DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 060 150 UD 012 152

AUTHOR	Schweitzer, Paul; And Others
TITLE	Evaluation of Decentralized ESEA Title I Programs, District 23, New York City Board of Education, 1970-1971 School Year.
INSTITUTION	Fordham Univ., Bronx, N.Y. Inst. for Research and Evaluation.
SPONS AGENCY	New York City Board of Education, Brooklyn, N.Y.
REPORT NO	Pub-71-39
PUB DATE	71
NOTE	241p.
EDRS PRICE	MF-$0.65 HC-$9.87
DESCRIPTORS	Bilingual Education; Cognitive Development; *Compensatory Education Programs; *Early Childhood Education; Elementary Education; Federal Programs; Intervention; *Paraprofessional School Personnel; Preschool Programs; *Program Evaluation; Readiness; Teacher Education
IDENTIFIERS	Elementary Secondary Education Act Title I; ESEA Title I Programs; New York City

ABSTRACT

At the beginning of the 1970-71 school year, eight ESEA Title I programs were implemented in Community District 23. The eight projects that were basic to the Title I program in District 23 included a Pre-Kindergarten Program, the basic aims of which were the development of language, perceptual, and cognitive skills in young children. A second project, a Special Primary Program, sought to raise the academic level of participating pupils, particularly those in grades K-3. A Strengthening Early Childhood Education Program was organized to foster reading readiness, listening and speaking skills, and growth in vocabulary and comprehension. To accomplish the goals of these and other projects in the District, a Paraprofessional Resource Program was instituted to train paraprofessionals and to promote the effectiveness of their work in the classroom. To increase the effectiveness of beginning teachers, Title I funds were used in a Teacher Training Project. The project also sought to increase the effectiveness of teacher-paraprofessional teams working in the classrooms. Two other projects included a Special Library Demonstration program and a Bilingual Program. (Author/JM)

ED 060150

FORDHAM UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF EDUCATION
HARRY N. RIVLIN, DEAN

EVALUATION OF DECENTRALIZED ESEA TITLE I PROGRAMS

DISTRICT 23, NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION

1970 - 1971 SCHOOL YEAR

Function Numbers

77-11602
77-11611
77-11603
77-11604
77-11605
77-11606
77-11607
77-11609

An evaluation of a New York City school district educational project funded under Title I of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965 (Pl 89-10) performed under contract with the Board of Education of the City of New York for the 1970-1971 school year.

INSTITUTE FOR RESEARCH AND EVALUATION

JOSEPH JUSTMAN, DIRECTOR

1971

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

A long list of representatives of the schools in District 23 contributed to the findings presented in these reports; District Coordinators, Program Coordinators, Principals, Teachers, Paraprofessionals, and Students. To all of them, our gratitude for their patience and cooperation.

The Evaluation Team

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ADMINISTRATIVE COMPONENT	1
I. Introduction	3
II. Program Objectives	4
III. Evaluation Objectives and Procedures	5
IV. Program Implementation and Effectiveness	6
V. Recommendations	11
PREKINDERGARTEN PROGRAM	13
I. Introduction	15
II. Program Objectives	15
III. Evaluation Procedures	16
IV. Implementation of the Program	17
V. Program Effectiveness	27
VI. Program Strengths and Weaknesses	39
VII. Recommendations	40
SPECIAL PRIMARY PROGRAM	43
I. Introduction	45
II. Program Objectives	45
III. Evaluation Procedures	46
IV. Implementation of the Program	47
V. Program Effectiveness	57
VI. Summary and Recommendations	68

TABLE OF CONTENTS (cont.)

	Page
PROGRAM TO STRENGTHEN EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION IN POVERTY AREA SCHOOLS	71
I. Introduction	73
II. Evaluation Procedures	76
III. Program Implementation	82
IV. The Kindergarten Program	95
V. First and Second Grade Program	115
VI. Program Personnel	139
VII. Childrens' Performance	148
VIII. Recommendations	166
THE PARAPROFESSIONAL RESOURCE PROGRAM	171
I. Introduction	173
II. Program Objectives	174
III. Evaluation Procedures	174
IV. Program Implementation	176
V. Program Effectiveness	184
VI. Recommendations	196
TEACHER TRAINING PROGRAM	199
I. Introduction	201
II. Program Objectives	203
III. Evaluation Procedures	203
IV. Program Implementation	204
V. Recommendations	212

TABLE OF CONTENTS (cont.)

	Page
SPECIAL LIBRARY DEMONSTRATION PROGRAM	215
I. Introduction	217
II. Evaluation Procedures	218
III. Program Implementation	219
IV. Program Effectiveness	228
V. Recommendations	229
BILINGUAL PROGRAM IN SCHOOL AND COMMUNITY RELATIONS	233
I. Introduction	235
II. Evaluation Objectives and Procedures	236
III. Program Implementation	236
IV. Program Effectiveness	239
V. Major Program Strengths and Weaknesses	245
VI. Recommendations	246

FORDHAM UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF EDUCATION
HARRY N. RIVLIN, DEAN

Function No. 77-11602

EVALUATION OF DECENTRALIZED ESEA TITLE I PROGRAMS

DISTRICT 23, NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION

"ADMINISTRATIVE COMPONENT"

Prepared by

PAUL SCHWEITZER
Evaluation Director

An evaluation of a New York City school district educational project funded under Title I of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965 (Pl 89-10) performed under contract with the Board of Education of the City of New York for the 1970-1971 school year.

INSTITUTE FOR RESEARCH AND EVALUATION
JOSEPH JUSTMAN, DIRECTOR

Publication No. 71-39

June 1971

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH,
EDUCATION & WELFARE
OFFICE OF EDUCATION
THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL OFFICE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

UD012154

EVALUATION OF DECENTRALIZED ESEA TITLE I PROGRAMS

DISTRICT 23, NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION

"ADMINISTRATIVE COMPONENT"

I. INTRODUCTION

At the beginning of the 1970-1971 school year, eight Title I programs were implemented in Community District 23. These programs were planned through the joint efforts of the Community Superintendent, the Community School Board, the Title I Coordinator, and the Title I Advisory Committee. The latter group, now referred to under new federal guidelines as the Parent Council, consisted, in approximately fifty per cent of its membership, of parents. The remaining members of the Council included individuals drawn from the District staff, representatives of public and non-public schools in the District, and representatives of local community agencies.

The Administrative Component, the primary subject of this evaluation report, provided for the coordination of all State and federal reimbursable programs in District 23.

A. The Scope of the Title I Program in District 23

The eight projects that were basic to the Title I program in District 23 included a Pre-Kindergarten Program, the basic aims of which were the development of language, perceptual, and cognitive skills in young children.

A second project, a Special Primary Program, sought to raise the academic level of participating pupils, particularly those in grades K-3.

A Strengthening Early Childhood Education Program was organized to foster reading readiness, listening and speaking skills, and growth in vocabulary and comprehension. To accomplish the goals of these and other projects in the District, a Paraprofessional Resource Program was instituted to train paraprofessionals and to promote the effectiveness of their work in the classroom.

To increase the effectiveness of beginning teachers in District 23, Title I funds were used in a Teacher Training Project. The project also sought to increase the effectiveness of teacher-paraprofessional teams working in the classrooms.

Two other projects included a Special Library Demonstration program designed to increase pupil use of the library and its services, and a Bilingual Program which sought to increase the involvement of parents of non-English speaking and bilingual pupils in important school activities.

II. PROGRAM OBJECTIVES

The following program objectives were cited by the District in the request for funding that was submitted:

1. To provide personnel and services for the planning, implementation, and supervision of Title I programs.

2. To provide for the coordination of activities of all participating groups (professional staff, participating schools, community groups, vendors, and Central Board of Education personnel).

III. EVALUATION OBJECTIVES AND PROCEDURES

The objectives of the evaluative study that was undertaken paralleled the program objectives, and may be stated as follows:

1. Determination of the extent to which personnel and services were provided for planning, implementation, supervision, and coordination of the program.

2. Determination of the adequacy of personnel and services in planning, implementation, supervision, and coordination of the program.

The procedures utilized in this evaluation of the Administrative Component included:

1. Interviews with the Acting Community Superintendent, the Title I Coordinator and members of her staff, project directors, other District staff members, and program evaluators with regard to personnel and services.

2. Analysis of program and personnel records.

3. Analysis of minutes of meetings, information bulletins, and similar materials.

IV. PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION AND EFFECTIVENESS

As one of her major functions, the District Title I Coordinator has played an extremely important role in the implementation of the Title I program in the District. This has included participation in the planning of programs with the District Superintendent and the Parent Council, the preparation of proposals and budgets, and the organization of programs through liaison with project coordinators.

In the implementation process for a specific Title I proposal, the District office, under the direction of the Title I coordinator, screens the needs of the schools and assesses the cost of implementing a program to meet those needs. Second, in conferences with individual project coordinators, the district coordinator and her staff gather suggestions for budget allocations in terms of greatest need. Third, proposals are formulated for the Community School Board, which approves the submission of these proposals to the State Education Department.

Since the implementation of the original eight projects noted above, several changes, in the form of additions and modifications were effected in the Title I program in the District. Three new Title I projects were authorized during the course of this academic year. The most extensive of these, a Spring Reading Package, provided, at a cost of $405,000, a total of three hundred fifteen new paraprofessionals and the necessary materials to give the schools additional assistance in reading instruction during the months of April, May, and June.

In addition, two paraprofessionals in each school were assigned to work with children in the school guidance offices.

A second new program, budgeted at $28,000 provided each school with four cultural bus excursions for its students. The third program, at a cost of $3,800, involved a Young Audiences Concert series, featuring artists from Lincoln Center.

Among the modifications to those programs which were organized at the beginning of the year were the addition of four pre-kindergarten classes and of one paraprofessional to the Strengthening Early Childhood Education Program, both changes being made when the changing needs of the student population became apparent. In addition, thirty more paraprofessionals were included in the Paraprofessional Resource Program, and several additional hours of secretary time were allotted to Title I work.

The implementation of the original programs and of these changes, the provision of personnel and services for planning and supervision, and the coordination of the activities of all participating groups has been the responsibility of the Title I Coordinator. These tasks were handled very efficiently.

The District Title I Coordinator is also charged with the responsibility of disseminating information concerning the programs under way to the community. Information regarding Title I activities is made available to the public in two ways. A booklet, prepared under the direction of the Coordinator, that describes in clear detail each of the Title I programs in operation, is available on request. In addition, community members are invited to attend Community School Board and Parent Council

meetings devoted to Title I activities. Publicity for these meetings is prepared by the Coordinator.

The District coordinator also has acted as a resource person to the Parent Council in its activities during the year. In a series of weekly meetings, the Council has participated in Title I planning activities; most recently, the focus of the Council has been upon summer programs for the district.

A change in the structure of this Parent Council and in the method of its constitution is projected for the end of this academic year. Under a recent decision of the Community School Board, a new advisory committee of forty elected rather than delegated members would be established. In order to be a committee candidate in the up-coming election, which will be administered by the Community Education Center, a parent may run as a nominee of the school which his child attends, provided that candidate presents ten approved petition signatures to the School Board's election committee. These new procedures were proposed because certain district residents had raised some questions concerning the equity of present selection practices for the Advisory Committee with the Community School Board. At this time it appears that the functions of the new Parent Council will remain the same.

The Coordinator has suggested that, since the newly formed Parent Council could not be expected to be familiar with the nature of the Title I advisement process, they be provided with the guidance of a workshop program. The workshop participants would review Title I laws and regulations, become aware of their advisement powers, enter into

long-range evaluative planning, and make recommendations for program development. She is currently developing a plan for such a workshop.

The District Coordinator is assisted in each of her administrative functions by three professionals and one paraprofessional. Clerical help in the form of two clerk-typists is also provided. These personnel and those hired for other Title I projects were sought and screened by the Coordinator. Candidates were then interviewed by the Community School Board; those who were approved were hired. Staff replacement follows like procedures.

The effectiveness of the Administrative Component in District 23 can be measured from two vantage points. The immediate objectives of communicating with the public, of meeting pressing assignments, of formulating proposals, and implementing recommended programs were met. This ability to make prompt responses to the needs of the individuals coordinating projects, to map out plans which are longer in range, and to work well with other district personnel may be looked upon as major strengths of the Administrative Component as it is currently functioning.

The coordinator has noted among the administrative problems to be solved the following are most pressing: alleviation of the problems arising because of redistricting, in that funds which would ordinarily be in use have not yet been released; the streamlining of the requisitioning process; the implementation of additional innovative programs; and the provision of additional time and/or personnel to accomplish long-range planning and evaluation.

In an attempt to deal with this last problem, the Coordinator has drafted a proposal for submission to the Community School Board in which the suggestion is made that a new position be created for a specialist in evaluation. Such a person would review past evaluation reports, conduct a research survey of district needs, and determine the "dollar effectiveness" of present projects as opposed to that of alternative projects. With the aid of a consultant, a comparative assessment of possible courses of action could be made so that Title I monies could be channeled with the greatest degree of effectiveness.

The coordinators impressed the evaluators as having developed excellent professional relations with the members of her staff and with other personnel in the District. Her assistants had been well-instructed in their duties, and they are functioning efficiently. The records are complete, and they are organized so that information is immediately available on every phase of the program. The coordinator has anticipated possible problems and provided for them by intelligent planning. She attends Parent Council meetings regularly and makes the proceedings available to the community in various ways. She impressed the evaluators as being well-organized, concerned about the success of the program, and perceptive and considerate in human relations. These qualities are major factors in maintenance of morale and in assuring the success of the District program.

V. RECOMMENDATIONS

Two recommendations may be made in the interests of greater efficiency:

1. The office of the District Coordinator is approximately 9' X 9', and houses the files as well as the desks of the coordinators and three other staff members. While it is helpful for the four people to be in the same room so that they can communicate readily, a larger room than the one now occupied would be desirable.

2. The office of the Coordinator should be equipped with its own telephone line. At the present time, this office can be reached only through a central switchboard, and it is often extremely difficult, because of the heavy load of calls to various District offices, to reach the Coordinator or her assistants.

FORDHAM UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF EDUCATION
HARRY N. RIVLIN, DEAN

Function No. 77-11611

EVALUATION OF ESEA TITLE I PROGRAMS

DISTRICT 23, NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION

"PREKINDERGARTEN PROGRAM"

Prepared by

JESSE H. BACHER
Research Associate

An evaluation of a New York City school district educational project funded under Title I of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965 (Pl 89-10) performed under contract with the Board of Education of the City of New York for the 1970-1971 school year.

INSTITUTE FOR RESEARCH AND EVALUATION

JOSEPH JUSTMAN, DIRECTOR

Publication No.: 71-65

June, 1971

EVALUATION OF ESEA TITLE I PROGRAMS

DISTRICT 23, NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION

"PREKINDERGARTEN PROGRAM"

I. INTRODUCTION

This program was to provide personnel and services for 32 classes serving 480 children in nine schools, as well as classroom supplies, special foods for instruction, educational bus trips, pupil lunches and snacks, parent snacks and activities.

This program sought to provide a varied program to meet the intellectual, social and physical needs of four year old children from socially and economically disadvantaged families living in the surrounding poverty areas. The program was designed to develop the ability to use language functionally, to promote perceptual and cognitive skills through first-hand experiences and a multi-media approach, to improve health and physical development, to develop a good self-image and interpersonal relationships with peer and adult groups in the school environment, to improve parent involvement in the school experience and to promote the team concept between professionals and paraprofessionals in the program.

II. PROGRAM OBJECTIVES

The objectives of the program, as stated in the proposal for funding, were as follows:

1. To develop the ability to use language functionally
2. To promote perceptual and cognitive skills through first-hand experiences and a multi-media approach

3. To improve health and physical development

4. To develop a good self-image and interpersonal relationships with peer and adult groups in the school environment

5. To increase parent involvement in school activities

6. To promote the team concept between professional and paraprofessional team members in the program.

III. EVALUATION PROCEDURES

This evaluation was conducted in six of the nine participating schools, using several different approaches that allowed for comprehensive observation of each of its components and an overview of the program in the light of the proposed objectives. Methods for the evaluation were as follows: a) several observations (in both A.M. and P.M. sessions) in 24 of 32 classes; b) interviews with early childhood supervisor, administrators, teachers, parents, paraprofessionals, relative to the program; c) visits to family rooms established to increase parent participation in the school's activities; d) questionnaires to parents, teachers and administrators relative to the program's functioning; e) observation of parent-teacher conferences; f) observation of teacher planning sessions with paraprofessionals; g) evaluation of materials used in the program; h) analysis of children's health records; i) discussions with pupils regarding their activities; and j) observation of lunch periods.

IV. IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PROGRAM

The Pre-Kindergarten program operated in 9 schools within District 23. Staffing and personnel for the program is noted in Table 1. In two schools, P.S. 396 and P.S. 332, where there were two classes, one additional teacher per class was added to the professional staff, a total of 4 extra staff members. This was made possible as a result of funding from the Special Primary Program (a Central Board of Education program funded under Title I and including five schools, two of which are in District 23 - P.S. 396 and P.S. 284), and the program for Experimental Education (EEP). In all classes the team, as designated in the proposal, had the full staffing of a teacher, teacher aide, and family worker.

TABLE 1

PRE-K CLASSES, STAFFING AND SCHOOLS

Schools	No. of Classes			No. of Teachers	Teacher Aides	Family Worker	Family Asst's
	AM	PM	Total				
150	1	1	2	1	1	1	-
298	1	1	2	1	1	1	-
155	1	1	2	1	1	1	-
175	1	1	2	1	1	1	-
137	2	2	4	2	2	2	1
284	2	2	4	2	2	2	1
396	2	2	4	4[a]	2	2	1
332	2	2	4	4[b]	2	2	1
144A	4	4	8	4	4	4	2
9	16	16	32	20	16	16	6

a. P.S. 396 has two teachers per class. The two additional teachers are funded under the special primary program.

b. P.S. 332 has two teachers per class. The two additional teachers are funded under the Experimental Education Program (EEP).

The program as implemented consisted of basic team units in each class, teacher, teacher aide, and family worker, who worked together in achieving the program's objectives. In those schools having more than one class, a family assistant was added to the staff to coordinate parent activities, A family activities room where parents gathered to meet one another, discuss the program, increase their own handcraft skills (i.e. sewing), and to learn as much as possible about the school and its function was provided. The specific roles of each adult in the program is noted below:

1. Teacher - responsible for the on-going educational program, as well as coordination of the activities of the paraprofessional personnel assigned to the class.

2. Teacher aide - assist the teacher in general maintanance of equipment, serving lunches, preparation of materials, educational activities with small groups and individuals as decided upon in planning sessions with the teacher.

3. Family Worker - recruit eligible children for the program from families most in need of this service; follow up on attendance problems; accompany parents and children to community service agencies (as decided upon in team planning); referral of families with problems to the proper social service facility; home visits to each family in conjunction with the family assistants; meet with parents in school to encourage greater parent participation; assist in the classroom during lunch periods as well as in conducting small group discussions with children; assist parents in obtaining baby sitting services while they are involved in school activities within the school.

4. Family Assistant - act as a liaison among parents, school and

various community agencies; work with family worker to recruit eligible children for the program; work with family worker in effecting referrals to service agencies; home visits; maintain bank account and all records related to parent activity funds; attend and participate in staff orientation and in-service pre-kindergarten workshops; assume major responsibility for the program conducted in the family activity room.

While the activities observed in the various classrooms reflected the particular skills and personalities of the individual teams, the major objectives were achieved in most instances. Implementation of the program was hindered to some extent by pupil mobility and the relatively poor attendance during the cold weather months. According to the staff, upper respiratory infections which spread throughout the class resulted in several children being absent for a few days at a time. Another factor that interfered with the program was that of lateness, especially in the afternoon groups. Parents found it more difficult to get their children to school on time in the afternoon than in the morning, The efforts of the family workers and family assistants made some inroads into this problem but not sufficiently to reduce the rate of lateness appreciably. In parent programs conducted at school, punctuality and attendance was stressed constantly. However, the parents who did not attend family activity room programs seemed to be the ones whose children had the poorest attendance records. This problem seemed to be more prevalent among the non-English speaking families.

In the classrooms, educational activities were geared to the overall development of the child as outlined in the program proposal. Thus, in free play situations, a high degree of interaction was noted among the children, who conversed freely while building their block towers, tunnels, bridges, etc., cutting, pasting, painting, engaging in dramatic play and other activities that fostered functional use of language and development of sound interpersonal relationships. The paraprofessional personnel were quite effective in the free play situations as they assisted the children in their various activities and held conversations with them. It was in situations such as these that singing, counting, and other subtle educational skills were built upon and reinforced.

More formal learning activities observed centered around the child's experiential background and his functional needs as a citizen in the community. For example, in one classroom, the teacher conducted a lesson on canned fruits, discussing with the children the difference in sizes, the costs involved, the quality of the product, where the items could be purchased, and culminated her lesson by having the children eat samples of the fruits, bringing in identification of color, and taste. This lesson allowed for pupil discrimination, introduction of mathematical concepts, such as same and different, size, shape, handling of money, and vocabulary building, all in an informal atmosphere, with high pupil attention and concentration. In this particular lesson, the paraprofessional assisted the teacher in the display of the edible aids and in encouraging children to express their observations verbally.

In another classroom, the teacher worked with the group on name recognition. Each child in the class read the name of a peer from the board and was then able to take that person as a partner for a dramatic play situation that followed. Discrimination of letters of the alphabet was subtly introduced when questions such as, "what letters are added to Juanita's name that are not in Juan's name," were asked. Children seemed to be quite pleased with their ability to recognize the names of others and motivation for this activity was high.

In most classrooms, music and singing was an integral part of the program. Children learned many songs, kept the tempo with rhythm instruments, danced in circles and couples and generally were helped to increase their coordination and rhythmic abilities. According to the staff, some children had begun the year knowing only one or two songs, but by the middle of the year had committed more than fifty to memory.

In some classrooms, more formal instruction was noted. Thus, children worked with the teacher in small groups on letter recognition, word recognition, mathematical concepts using discs, cuisenaire rods, coins, etc. Library work involving picture books as well as story books was evident in all classrooms. Teachers used story readings as an opportunity to develop children's listening skills, verbal skills, and general comprehension. Problem solving in the form of puzzles, sequential pictures, and word riddles were also part of the activities offered to the pupils.

The children in the program displayed a high level of performance in all the areas mentioned. When challenge and demand were part of the classroom approach, these young children demonstrated that they were capable of formal learning prior to the usual primary school experience. It would appear, too, that economic disadvantage need not affect performance in cognitive areas; the children in the program who come from socio-

economically deprived backgrounds were far from deprived in their ability to perform and to learn.

The creative manner in which children were introduced to activities and experiences, and the ensuing results, merits special mention. The teaming in most classes observed was highly cohesive. Teachers and paraprofessionals seemed to blend into a solid working unit as they engaged children in various activities. The warmth and respect for one another was very evident in these classrooms and the children gravitated freely to any adult of their choosing, suggestive of excellent cooperative effort. Unfortunately, this was not the case in every class. A few teachers found it difficult to give up their authority and tended to conduct their classes as very structured kindergartens. These teachers generally had had little experience with pre-kindergarten children and they found it difficult to function in an atmosphere of relative informality. Their paraprofessionals played less of a role in the instructional program and large group work tended to be the major instructional procedure, except in free play periods and in experiences involving art work.

Emphasis was placed upon language development in most classes. Adults mingled with children, engaged them in conversation, planned the activities of the day with them, answered their questions patiently and with interest, and, in general, provided an atmosphere where the use of language was an expedient to getting things done. In those classes where children were seated in groups of three or four at small tables, the level of spontaneous relating of experiences was noted to be high. High spontaneity was also in evidence in the different play areas around the room.

Dramatic and fantasy play which was fostered by creative use of space was also a catalyst for pupil interaction and communication. Most notable was the unrestricted communication among pupils and between pupils and adults.

The practice of good health habits was also emphasized in many of the class activities. Washing one's hands before eating, placing refuse into the proper receptacles, and general care about personal grooming were some of the areas touched upon in daily class procedure.

Facilities for the classes were large enough to accomodate the fifteen children enrolled in each session. The ample physical space allowed for many different activities and yet was small enough so that interaction between the students and staff was enhanced without individuals becoming lost in a large area. In one school, P.S. 150, construction to provide bathroom and sink facilities was being completed to obviate children's having to leave the room to attend to personal needs. The internal construction going on in this school presented minor problems in terms of pupil activity not observed in the other schools with more adequate facilities.

Materials in most classes were considered to be ample. However, there were some gaps in the audio-visual equipment so vital to the needs of this program. Tape recorders, cameras, projectors, were hard to come by; however, every room did have a record player and a good supply of children's records that facilitated the conduct of musical activities involving rhythm, singing, and dancing. Other materials, such as, carts, blocks, balance boards, wooden kitchen equipment, books, crayons, scissors, and puzzles, selected with the assistance of the District Coordinator of

Early Childhood Education, were in continual use and of good quality.

The teaming of teacher and paraprofessional worked well in most classes observed. The paraprofessional in many instances worked as a co-teacher, being involved in circle games, language, and word games, singing games. The level of acceptance on the part of the teacher for the paraprofessional and vice versa was judged to be high. An example of such rapport was the remark by a second year teacher about her paraprofessional assistant: "When I came in here, I knew very little; Mrs. _____ taught me how to really reach my children. She's great!" In one situation observed, the above was not found to be true. In this school, there were two classes; the teachers often combined their groups (the area for these classes was larger than in other schools) for large group activity (singing, circle activities, etc.). The paraprofessionals in these classes had little individual contact with the children. For the most part they spent their time in cleaning up, preparing materials to be used during the course of the day, and in serving lunches. In most of the other classes, the paraprofessional played a larger role in the instructional program.

The major problem encountered in the program was in the area of professional staff training for working with children of this age. The level of activity was more akin to the structured kindergarten than the pre-kindergarten, in some classes, evidenced by the emphasis on paper and pencil work copying of numbers and letters, overly long lessons in singing, and circle games that seemed to detract from the natural propensity of these children to move about with relative freedom. It appeared as if structure was instituted to insure proper preparation of the children

for the years ahead in more academic class settings.

While there were some instances of need for further professional training, many of the classes visited were staffed with teachers who had had previous early childhood experience. In these classes, the atmosphere was free flowing, children were free from strain, and actively engaged in satisfying activities.

Another problem of the program was noted in the family activities room, where parents gathered to meet with one another, enhance their handcraft skills, and to become better acquainted with the school's program for their children. These activity rooms were frequented, for the most part, by English speaking parents. In one room visited, there were fifteen black parents and only one Puerto Rican parent. Parents tended to be cliquish and it was observed that newcomers, while received cordially, seemed to be on the outside looking in rather than becoming involved in activities with the other parents. However, the family activities room was a parent resource center from which much local information could be obtained that might otherwise not be acquired, and was considered to be vital for the parent of the young child who often times was at a loss as to how to best relate to her child.

A note is pertinent here regarding the high degree of involvement of administrators and ancillary personnel (teacher in school and community relations, bi-lingual teacher in school and community relations, school nurse etc.) in this program. This involvement was noted in the frequent visits of these people to the classes, their familiarity with most of the children, as well as the children's positive attitudes toward them. In one case, specifically, the principal made a daily visit to the class in his school to greet each child. This positive interaction helped to make the program an integral part of the school's activities.

V. PROGRAM EFFECTIVENESS

This program was effective in meeting most of its stated objectives. Of fourteen teachers who were interviewed, twelve were licensed in early childhood education, one had preparation in Common Branches K-6, and one was prepared in special education (this teacher took graduate work at the Bank Street College in early childhood education and moved into the early childhood area after one year in special education at the high school level). Three of the teachers held master's degrees.

It is also of interest to note the previous experience of teachers in the program. This is summarized in Table 2, for the 14 teachers who were interviewed. These teachers constituted 70 per cent of the 20 teachers in the program.

TABLE 2

PREVIOUS EXPERIENCE OF TEACHERS (IN YEARS)

Teacher	Total Experience	Pre-K	Kg.	Elementary	Spec. Ed.
1	1½	1		½	
2	4	1	2	1	
3	4	4			
4	3	3			
5	7	7			
6	0				
7	3	2	1		
8	3	2	1		
9	½	½			
10	½	½			
11	1	1			
12	12	11			1
13	3	2	1		
14	9	3	3	3	
Total	51½	38	8	4½	1

As can be seen from table 2, the teachers observed brought to the program a total of 51½ years of teaching experience, 38 of which were in early childhood education (73.8% of total experience). Only two members of the group could be considered veteran teachers.

Questionnaires completed by these teachers relative to their need for further training, and whether such training was given this year resulted in varied response. Seven of the 14 respondents indicated that they felt no need for further training. Ten of the teachers had participated in a District training program. Six of the participants felt that the program had been "good"; four rated the effectiveness of the program as "fair."

From responses to questions in the interview, it would appear that teachers feel the need for communication with peers: "A great deal of learning takes place when teachers pool their ideas in meetings;" "It is not only interesting but important for Pre-K teachers to get together and exchange ideas."; "I think that the Pre-K workshops are very effective. Unfortunately we haven't had enough of them up until the present. Now they are scheduled monthly;" "An exchange workshop can be extremely helpful where all teachers and paraprofessionals exchange ideas, materials and philosophies;" "Visiting other schools to see what they are doing is the most helpful: I have picked up quite a few ideas in this way."

It is interesting to note that some of the teachers cited specific areas in which they felt they could use more training-developing reading readiness, teaching beginning reading, games, songs, specific techniques.

Four of the teachers reported that they had had no opportunity to participate in a training program; two of the six principals indicated that no such program was organized in their schools. In view of the expressed needs of teachers for training in specific areas and for opportunities for sharing experiences, it might be well to provide for

workshops for all teachers.

In responding to questions concerning the effectiveness of the program for the children, most teachers agreed that the program in their schools had been markedly effective. Table 3 summarizes teacher opinion concerning the different activities in their program and the effect of these activities in helping to achieve program objectives.

TABLE 3

TEACHER RATINGS OF PROGRAM EFFECTIVENESS FOR CHILDREN

Area	Effectiveness	
	Good	Fair
Developing language ability	13	1
Communicating with peers	13	1
Communicating with adults	14	
Improving behavior	14	
Developing muscular coordination	14	
Increasing attention span	14	
Improving personal hygiene habits	11	3
Developing background of experiences	12	2
Fostering learning achievement	13	1
Developing self-awareness	14	

The teacher rated the effectiveness of the program very highly.

According to the teachers, program effectiveness was related quite definitely to the assistance offered by the paraprofessionals who worked with them.

Table 4 summarizes teacher responses concerning areas in which the paraprofessionals were most helpful in furthering program objectives.

TABLE 4

TEACHER RATING OF AREAS IN WHICH PARAPROFESSIONAL WAS MOST HELPFUL

	Educ. Ass't		Family Worker	
Area	N	%	N	%
a. Participating in Planning	10	71.4	5	35.7
b. Assisting in large group activities	13	92.8	11	78.5
c. Working with small groups or individual children	14	100	7	50.0
d. Helping children to work and play harmoniously	11	78.5	7	50.0
e. Working with the NE speaking child	8	57.1	7	50.0
f. Relieving teachers of routines (milk, snack, etc.)	14	100	11	78.5
g. Keeping records	6	42.8	2	14.3
h. Preparing instructional materials	10	71.4	3	21.4
i. Taking care of supplies and equipment	13	92.8	4	28.3
j. Translating foreign language	4	28.6	5	35.7
k. Making home visits	5	35.7	12	85.7
l. Holding conferences with parents	8	57.1	9	64.3
m. Arranging and participating in parent workshops	5	35.7	9	64.3
n. Effecting liaison with community agencies	3	21.4	8	57.1

The most important contribution of the Educational Assistant was in the areas of assisting in large group activity,working with small groups and individuals,relieving teachers of routines, and taking care of equipment and supplies. These areas spanned the total program and indicate as do the other less highly rated contributions, that the role of the Educational Assistant was important to the conduct of the program. It should be noted, too, that for the paraprofessional to have the kind of involvement indicated, a strong positive relationship between teacher and paraprofessional must have been developed.

The most important contribution of the Family Worker was in the area of home visitation. Since the role of the Family Worker was mainly that of a liaison between the class and the home, it would appear that this role was carried out effectively. It is also interesting to note that when the Family Workers were in the classroom, they assisted in large group activity and in relieving the teacher of routines, suggesting an interaction with pupils similar to that of the Educational Assistant who was in the classroom full time.

Teacher ratings of the materials with which they worked and the availability of materials were mixed. In some cases teachers seemed to feel that funds were not readily available for purchase of supplies and that pre-planning was hindered due to the lateness in budgeting for the Program. Table 5 summarizes teacher ratings of the materials they had available.

TABLE 5

TEACHER RATINGS OF THE MATERIALS WORKED WITH (IN PER CENT)

	Very Good	Good	Fair	Poor	Very Poor
a. Sufficiency of material	28.6	21.4	42.8		7.2
b. Quality of material	21.4	57.1	7.2	14.3	
c. Variety of material	35.7	42.8	21.4		
d. Challenge to pupils	21.4	71.4	7.2		
e. Helpfulness in fostering language development	21.4	57.1	7.2	14.3	
f. Helpfulness in fostering group play, interaction	35.7	57.1	7.2		
g. Helpfulness in fostering muscular coordination	35.7	57.1	7.2		

In no instance did a majority of teachers rate the materials they used as "very good." These data raise a question concerning the role of teachers in choice of materials. Many teacher comments relative to availability of materials are pertinent: "Money grants for classroom supplies should be made in full before the year begins; we still do not have our full supply list for this year." "We would have liked the supply money to come at the beginning of the year or sooner." "The funds came much too late and the children missed out on the use of these materials at the beginning of the year." "We put the previous equipment to good use, but had to wait too long for our new supplies."

Teachers were also asked to indicate what factors they felt contributed most to the success of the program. Their responses are summarized in Table 6.

TABLE 6

FACTORS CONTRIBUTING TO SUCCESS OF PROGRAM, AS RATED BY TEACHERS

Factor	Responses N	%
a. Small class size	10	71.4
b. Assistance of the paraprofessional	14	100.0
c. More and better materials	9	64.3
d. Greater parent involvement	5	35.7
e. Administrative enthusiasm and support	10	71.4
f. Adequate classroom space	8	57.1

Again, the assistance of the paraprofessional is cited by all of the respondents. All of the other factors are cited by more than half of the group, with the exception of parent involvement. Small class size, and administrative support, were cited by almost three-fourths of the respondents.

The reactions of principals showed marked agreement with those of the teachers. All six of the principals felt that reduced class size was an important factor contributing to the success of the program; all six, too, cited staff enthusiasm as a contributing factor. The principals differed from the teachers in their estimate of the contribution of parents to the program; 5 (83.3%) of the principals felt this to be important, while only 35.7 per cent of the teachers did so.

When asked to identify problems that they faced during the course of the year, no single problem seemed to be significant to a substantial number of teachers. Four mentioned a need for more classroom space, three felt that pupil mobility created problems and three referred to

pupil attendance as a problem. Three principals agreed that pupil mobility was an important problem in their schools; two cited pupil attendance as a problem. The indications are, then, that the program, as judged by the teachers and administrators operated smoothly.

All of the schools in the program developed activities designed to increase parent involvement. Most of these activities were centered in the parent activity room; from these activities, others developed. Thus, trips were taken, theatre parties were organized and, on the third Monday of every month, conferences were held with teachers. One principal indicated that parent involvement was weak, despite the programs offered, and he did not feel that a sufficient number of parents were reached through these efforts. Teacher's tended to agree with this point of view. Teachers felt that it was difficult to get parents to attend school functions and that, while they were concerned with their youngster's development, they showed poor attendance at conferences and PTA Meetings. Teacher's and principals' ratings of the effectiveness of the programs of parent involvement that were developed in their schools are summarized in Table 7.

TABLE 7

TEACHERS' AND PRINCIPALS' RATING OF EFFECTIVENESS OF PROGRAMS OF PARENT INVOLVEMENT

Rating	Teachers N	Teachers %	Principals N	Principals %
Excellent	1	7.1	3	50.0
Good	4	28.6	3	50.0
Fair	5	35.7		
Poor	4	28.6		

As one would expect, principals were much more certain than teachers that the programs of parent involvement developed in their schools were effective. Despite the varied opinions regarding the effectiveness of the parent program, it would appear from the responses of 45 parents to questionnaires that they showed a fair measure of participation in school activities. Thus, 25 (55.6%) has attended PTA conferences; 30 (66.7%) had visited the parent activity room in their child's school, and 38 (84.4%) had had a conference with their child's teacher. Only 10 (22.2%), however, had taken part in any of the parent workshops held in the school.

It is evident that the parents were pleased with the program directed to their children. All but one of the 45 parents responded affirmatively when they were asked whether they felt that the teacher was interested in their child; all but three indicated that they would send other children to attend school at four years of age.

It is of note that responses of parents to a series of questions concerning their verbalization confirmed the observation noted above that the program had been markedly successful in helping children to use language functionally. The responses of the parents are summarized in Table 8.

TABLE 8

PARENTAL RESPONSES CONCERNING VERBALIZATION OF CHILD

Question	Very Often N	Very Often %	Sometimes N	Sometimes %	Very Little or Not at All N	Very Little or Not at All %
Does your child tell you about what he does in school?	27	60.6	17	37.8	1	2.2
Does your child talk about his friends in school?	23	51.1	19	42.2	3	6.7
Does your child talk about his teachers?	27	60.6	17	37.8	1	2.2
Does your child talk more since he is in school?	25	55.6	12	26.7	8	17.8

VI. PROGRAM STRENGTH AND WEAKNESSES

Strengths

1. A very high level of staff vitality and involvement.
2. Happy, learning, active children, highly involved with their teachers and their school.
3. A receptive and concerned administration within each school.
4. Excellent interpersonal relationships among professional and paraprofessional staff members.
5. Adequate space and facilities for activities within the classroom.
6. Varied activities that take into account the development of language facility, social development, acquisition of cognitive skills, physical coordination, self-awareness and appreciation of others.
7. Established family activity rooms which serve as a center for increasing parent involvement.

8. Creative teacher-made materials that supplemented other supplies purchased from budgetary allotments.

Weaknesses

1. Insufficient training and orientation sessions (for the total staff who conduct the district wide program) where ideas and mat ials may be shared, philosophies discussed, and new techniques pres ed.
2. Lack of provision for intervisitation among professior . and paraprofessional staff who might learn from and share each other's strengths.
3. Weak lines of communication regarding meetings, and the place they were to be held.
4. Insufficient audiovisual equipment, such as tape recorders, movie projectors, film strip projectors.
5. Poor attendance of parents at parent workshops.
6. Insufficient visits to pupils' homes as a means of enhancing parent-school relationships.
7. Insufficient attention to the needs of the non-English speaking parent in helping them to become a part of the school community.

VII. RECOMMENDATIONS

The Prekindergarten Program, as observed in six of the nine schools housing a total of 24 classes, was felt to be a superior service to the four year olds who were in attendance. Varied activity, interested and concerned adults, pleasant physical environments, were cumulative assets in helping the children to grow in verbal ability, cognitive skills, motor coordination, sound interpersonal relationships, and self-awareness. The program should be continued and expanded. The following recommendations are directed to some phases of the Program:

Recommendations

1. Increased teacher training and intervisitation programs. It is felt that staff members might benefit from observing one another in the classroom. Creative approaches have been observed that are not being shared from building to building. Some teachers might benefit from observing the particular expertise of some of their colleagues.

2. In observation of some parent-teacher conferences, it was noted that some parents might benefit from help in understanding their preschoolers and in meeting their emotional needs. Consideration should be given to the planning of a parent education program directed to these needs.

3. Some attention should be given to teacher training in the conduct of parent-teacher conferences. It was noted that some teachers were uncomfortable (as were the parents) in discussing some of the children's needs with their parents. This was especially noteworthy when something negative had to be discussed.

4. An attempt should be made to include as many parents as possible in the family activity room activities. It is possible that more parents do not attend because they feel inadequate in social situations; this seemed especially true of the non-English speaking parents observed in the family activity rooms.

5. More needs to be done with the non-English speaking pupil in language development. Coming from homes where Spanish is the dominant tongue, they are at times hesitant to communicate with peers in activities dealing with verbal interaction.

6. It is important that more audio-visual equipment be made available.

7. Many more home visitations are needed than are conducted. Some parents might become more involved with the total school program if school personnel were to visit with them and establish close relationships with them.

8. If at all possible, supplies necessary for the conduct of the program should be made available at the beginning of the school year.

FORDHAM UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF EDUCATION
HARRY N. RIVLIN, DEAN

Function No. 71-1-1603

EVALUATION OF ESEA TITLE I PROGRAMS

DISTRICT 23, NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION

"SPECIAL PRIMARY PROGRAM"

Prepared by

JESSE H. BACHER
Research Associate

An evaluation of a New York City school district educational project funded under Title I of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965 (Pl 89-10) performed under contract with the Board of Education of the City of New York for the 1970-1971 school year.

INSTITUTE FOR RESEARCH AND EVALUATION

Publication No.: 71-58

June 1971

EVALUATION OF ESEA TITLE I PROGRAMS

DISTRICT 23, NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION

"SPECIAL PRIMARY PROGRAM"

I. INTRODUCTION

This program, which operated in two schools, was designed to provide additional professional and paraprofessional personnel to supplement the ongoing school program through the organization of an After School Study Center for grades 1-6. In addition, this program was to include a part-time clinical staff which would provide psychiatric, psychological, and guidance services, and a Teacher of Community Relations, or a Community Liaison Worker, who was to help to build a cooperative and alert Parent Association in each school and interpret the program to parents and community. The after-school team of teachers, educational assistants, and tutors, it was felt, would make it possible to better meet the needs of each child by developing improved attitudes, skills, and habits in accordance with specific objectives. The educational assistants and tutors were to assit in giving small group instruction, assist in working with children at centers of interest and assist in supervision of games and other physical education activities.

II. PROGRAM OBJECTIVES

The program's objectives, as stated in the proposal for funding submitted by the District, were as follows:

1. To raise the academic level of participating pupils, particularly those in grades K-3.
2. To involve parents in the school program in a meaningful way.

3. To provide liaison among the classes and grades in the schools.

III. EVALUATION PROCEDURES

This evaluation utilized several different approaches:

1. Observations in K-6 classrooms (pre-kindergarten observations were made as well but are included in a separate report on the Pre-Kindergarten and will not be included in detail here).

2. Interviews with administrators, teachers, paraprofessionals, and parents, relative to the program and how it was serving youth.

3. Visits to the after-school centers and observation of on-going activities.

4. Conferences with grade coordinators in language arts, mathematics, science, and social studies relative to their roles in the program and the manner in which coordination among classes and between grades was accomplished.

5. Analysis of work samples of children and worksheets provided for reinforcement of concepts learned in the classroom.

6. Observation of demonstration teaching and special exhibits prepared by each of the special primary schools during the month of May, 1971.

7. Discussion with children concerning their in-school and after-school activities.

8. Discussion with parents in the family rooms set up in each school to help bring the school and home closer together.

9. Evaluation of materials used in the instructional process, including teacher made materials, those prepared by coordinators, and purchased materials relative to the supply, function and dissemination.

10. Small group conferences with staff during lunch periods to ascertain attitudes, ideas, and aspirations relative to their work in the program.

IV. IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PROGRAM

The Special Primary Program operated in two schools in District 23, P.S. 284 and P.S. 327/396 (tandem schools). P.S. 396 serves children from pre-kindergarten through grade 2; P.S. 327 serves grades 3 to 6. Although each school has its own principal and staff, they share a single, large physical plant, and their school programs are coordinated.

Table I presents a summary of the staff positions filled under the Special Primary Program in these schools.

TABLE 1

STAFFING-SPECIAL PRIMARY SCHOOL PROGRAM (SCHOOL DAY)

Position	No. in each Position	School 284	School 327/396	
Ass't Principal	3	1	1	1
Secretary	2.6	1	.8	(shared)
Tchr. Adm. Ass't	3	1	1	1
Tchr. Community Relations	2	1	.5	(shared)
Tchr. Language Enrichment	3	1	1	1
Tchr. Coordinator	3	1	2	0
Tchr. Jr. Guidance Class	4	2	1	1
Tchr. Citizenship	1	0	1	0
Tchr. Kindergarten	7	3	0	4
Tchr. Pre-kindergarten	4	2	0	2
Tchr. Speech Improvement	.8	.3	.5	(shared)
School Psychologist	.4	.0	.4	(shared)
School Social Worker	.4	.4	0	
School Psychiatrist	.3	.15	.15	(shared)
Guidance Counselor	1.4	.4	1	(shared)

The staff described in Table 1 contributed in large measure to the success of this program. A description of the duties and activities of the personnel will help give a picture of how each person's contribution added to the total program operating in the two special primary schools.

1. Assistant Principal. The assistant principal's activities included supervision of curricular areas, training of teachers, supervision of the school wide testing program, assembly programs, paraprofessional programs, lunch-room, agency liaison, attendance, safety, class coverage (per diem subs.), audio-visual aids, and supplies. Also entailed in their responsibilities were general school duties such as building supervision, discipline, educational experimentation, grade conferences, grade placement, plan books, text book ordering, report cards. These varied activities helped to make the school a more smoothly functioning unit so that the teaching staff could deploy their major efforts into the educational process.

2. Administrative Assistant. In both schools, the administrative assistants handled such functions as collating of inventory, ordering and distribution of all supplies and textbooks, special events such as book fairs, cake sales, etc., and pupil and teacher scheduling. They assisted in the training and supervision of school aides and in the testing and placement of newly arrived pupils. They maintained liaison between the District office and the school regarding business matters, arrangements for bussing, coordination of all school attendance, and the maintenance and repair of all audio-visual equipment.

3. Teacher in School and Community Relations. These personnel added considerably to the integration of parents and school as a cooperative working force through their activities, which included conferences with the family assistant, counseling with students, and conferences with parents.

They devoted attention to special health problems in coordination with school health personnel, and interacted with local law enforcement agencies, working closely with parents whose children were poor school attenders. Close working relationships were maintained with community agencies that were involved with students and their families and helped newly arrived families to acquire the necessary information needed to function within the community. In short, they provided general liaison between the school and community in any and all matters that would affect pupils' educational,social and psychological development.

4. Teacher-Language Enrichment. The people assigned to these positions provided liaison between the teacher and student in the classroom for all activities involving the language arts. They familiarized themselves with the latest developments in the field and were able to acquaint teachers through conferences, specially prepared materials, and demonstration lessons with better and more effective ways to teach. The resource rooms set up by these personnel were replete with materials in the language arts. These teachers met with small groups of children for instruction as the need arose, worked with parents in planning and carrying out language arts activities in the home, worked with educational assistants to improve their functioning with children, worked closely with student teachers in the language arts area, and were present at grade conferences in the language arts to lend their expertise to classroom planning in this area. In short, they helped to establish goals and methods to assess the effectiveness of the language arts programs in their schools. This particular position was an invaluable addition to the school and helped to increase learning in all other areas of the curriculum through the improvement of children's skills in the area of reading, the base from which most learning takes place in the school environment.

5. Teacher Coordinator. The grade coordinators were invaluable assests to the school team, in that their efforts resulted in closer teacher cooperation on grade levels as well as between grade levels. Basically, through regularly scheduled grade conferences, the curriculum being taught was discussed, amended, and improved. Special learning problems were discussed with teachers, and special groupings of children were established as needed. The grade coordinators also handled special areas such as science, mathematics, and social studies, where materials were compiled and disseminated for pupil use. By bringing the latest developments in the field to the teachers, the coordinators helped to add new zest to the curriculum and helped to motivate the teaching staff who began to use the newer approaches with success. Grade conferences held by the coordinators also allowed for feedback to administration regarding special needs for the classroom that would facilitate the learning process. The success achieved in helping teachers to form cohesive teaching teams was due in large respect to the efforts of the grade coordinators.

6. Teacher Junior Guidance and Citizenship Class. These positions are grouped as one because of their similarity in function. These teachers worked with small groups of children (10-11 per class) who were unable to adjust to the regular classroom routine. Basically, these children were also being served by the special services personnel (psychiatrist, psychologist, social worker, guidance counselor) regarding their emotional problems. The classes had regular periods of instruction, but also had as their goal rehabilitation of the pupil so that he might return to the mainstream of the educational system. By removing these children from the classroom temporarily, other children were enabled to benefit from continued, uninterrupted education.

7. Teacher, Pre-Kindergarten and Kindergarten. By adding additional personnel to these two critical areas of the educational sphere, teacher-pupil ratios were made smaller and more individualized attention was made possible. An additional asset of the additional personnel was that more time could be spent with parents in conferences regarding their children, thus heightening parent involvement in school activities in general. In conjunction with other personnel, the efforts of the pre-K and Kindergarten teachers helped parents to appreciate what the educational process could bring to their children.

8. Special Service Personnel. This category included teachers of speech improvement, the school psychologist, the school social worker, the school psychiatrist, and the guidance counselor. The impact made by these personnel was in direct proportion to the amount of time they were available. While one or two days a week is certainly better than no time at all, the activities of the special service person were limited. More children needed evaluation than time would permit. In view of the number of children who needed special placement and special attention, the services of the psychologist and psychiatrist were more of a holding action. Despite this time difficulty, those children seen were properly placed, and referred for necessary outside assistance. In a large number of cases the guidance counselor was of great assistance in helping the child. The services of the speech improvement teacher were especially helpful in diagnosing speech correction needs for future speech help, as time allowed.

9. Secretary. The efficient functioning of a school depends in large part upon the ability of the administration to get reports in on time, orders placed when necessary. These and a myriad of other responsibilities were handled by the secretary in the school. The addition of personnel in this important area facilitated the functioning of the persons

more directly involved with the instruction of children.

The program involving the total school staff was implemented according to the original design, despite some difficulties that arose out of the high rate of pupil mobility. In this area of the City, families are constantly on the move and the education of children interrupted. It is not unusual for a child to move to another school within the district, remain there for a few months, and then return to his original school. This mobility and the attempt on the part of school liaison personnel to ensure that all progress records and individual prescriptions reach the new school in time for them to be useful to the new staff, consumed a good deal of time.

Another frustration faced by the school staff related to materials ordered for use during the current academic year. Despite the best efforts of school personnel, suppliers were derelict in their responsibilities, and it was necessary to make literally hundreds of phone calls regarding materials originally ordered six or seven months before. It becomes difficult to plan activities when there was little assurance that the materials required will be available when needed. While this may heighten teacher activity in the preparation of their own materials, it detracts from the time they could spend in instruction or in educational diagnosis and prescription for individual children.

The program of the after-school study center was also implemented according to plans set forth in the proposal. This program operated in two schools, P.S. 284 and P.S. 327/396 on Tuesday, Wednesday, and Thursday from three p.m. to five p.m. from October through the end of May. Each school had similar staffing and similar budgeting, except for the addition of six high school student-tutors who were employed as assistants at one

school. At the other school, tutors that were to have been supplied by the local Community Education Center, but were not made available.

Basically, the after-school program was a voluntary one, serving children in grades 2 through 6. Weather conditions and darkness during the winter months caused some parents to be reluctant to enroll their younger children in this program. The program was designed as a reinforcing agent of the full day program in which children acquired basic skills. The afternoon program was designated as an enrichment program, in that children were helped to use and maintain acquired skills through varying approaches: arts and crafts, cooking, cultural heritage (Afro-American and Puerto Rican culture), music, dance, sewing, English and Spanish as second languages, and science. For example, in the after school program, organized into different clubs, the sessions oftentimes began with a review of some basic mathematics or language arts work. Activities such as cooking, using mathematical skills to measure ingredients and basic reading skills to follow recipes, were then introduced thus reinforcing these skills in an environment of relative informality. In many cases children asked their teachers for specific help in subject matter areas; this assistance was cheerfully given. Motivation of staff and pupils was noted to be very high.

Staffing for the After School Centers consisted of licensed teachers who taught at the schools during the regular school day, as well as educational assistants, school aides who performed monitorial functions, and secretarial assistants. Table 2 below describes the staffing of both after-school centers.

TABLE 2

STAFFING OF AFTER-SCHOOL CENTERS

P.S. 327/396		P.S. 284	
Administrator (A.P. at P.S. 327)		Administrator (A.P. at P.S. 284)	
Licensed Teachers	9	Licensed Teachers	9
Educational Assistants	9	Educational Assistants	9
School Aides	1	School Aides	2*
Secretarial Assistant	1	Secretarial Assistant	1
		High School Students	6

* Share 3 hours daily

The After School Centers served approximately 450 children, with an average daily attendance of about two-thirds that number. It is interesting to note that on one visitation during the month of May, a warm and inviting day to be outdoors, there were approximately 200 hundred children in the after-school center, working with the teachers and educational assistants in their particular club activities. Certainly, this example is indicative of the high degree of enthusiasm pupils displayed for the program. The six high school tutors, employed to work at one of the centers, related well to the pupils in the program and were felt to be major contributors in helping to make the atmosphere informal but yet sparked with a desire for learning.

In both centers, the entire physical plant was at the disposal of teachers and pupils; space needs were adequately met. Supplies, purchased from a limited budget, were ample, although distributed with caution lest the supply be too rapidly utilized.

TABLE 3

Mean Growth in Reading Shown by Pupils on Informal Reading Inventory and Gilmore Oral Reading Tests

Informal Reading Inventory	Total Group N	Total Group Growth	Top 75 Per Cent N	Top 75 Per Cent Growth
Grade 3	120	1.2	90	1.6
4	100	1.5	75	1.8
5	104	0.9	78	1.2
6	63	0.9	47	1.2
Total	387	1.2	290	1.5

Gilmore Oral Reading Test	Total Group Growth In N	Accuracy	Comprehension	Top 75 Per Cent Growth In N	Accuracy	Comprehension
Grade 2	46	1.1	1.3	35	1.4	1.6
3	43	1.3	1.6	32	1.6	2.0
4	39	1.1	1.2	29	1.4	1.4
5	48	0.8	1.0	36	1.0	1.4
6	68	1.2	1.0	51	1.6	1.3
Total	244	1.1	1.2	183	1.4	1.5

V. PROGRAM EFFECTIVENESS

Quantitative data, based upon individual administration of an informal reading test and the Gilmore Oral Reading Test to a sample of pupils in Grades 3-6, were available for analysis. Table 3 persents a summary of these data for the total group tested, and for the top 75 per cent of the group to whom these tests were administered.

As seen in table 3, the mean growth for all pupils tested was slightly more than one year in all areas. For the top 75 per cent of the group tested, growth approximated 1.5 years. Unfortunately, due to large numbers of pupils moving in and out of the schools during the school year, more individualized test data of this type were not available. In many cases, scores from September were available with no comparison scores for June, or the reverse, in the case of new entrants. However, the present sample data would indicate that learning is taking place and that children are growing in their basic ability to read. According to teachers interviewed, much of this progress is due to careful grouping of children, and the introduction of new materials such as the Open Court reading series which is used in both special primary schools. This reading series was praised by many of the teachers as being motivating to pupils as well as maintaining a high interest level. For next year, it is planned to order more materials spanning several grade levels since more pupils show direct evidence of being able to work with more difficult material.

It was evident, from classroom observations, that teaching was of a very high caliber and that the learner was receiving a good deal of individualized help, both by the teacher and by the paraprofessional assigned to the classroom. Careful planning between teachers on the grade and by teacher-paraprofessional teams helped to strengthen the total ongoing educational process. Lesson sequences followed patterns based upon individual student needs. Individually prescribed assignments for pupils, followed up on by the paraprofessional, was a strong feature of classroom activity. Materials were deemed to be appropriate in that pupils were

able to handle the material and, as observed, were able to spend twenty minutes to a half hour at a time in working on their individual assignments without adult assistance.

In classroom observations it was noted that careful attention was paid to follow-up of skill acquisition. Thus, assignments to students were rexographed by teachers and were corrected by the educational assistants so that each child's performance could be checked. In one case, the children were given an "all-in-one sheeet" that consisted of their work of the day in language arts, mathematics, and social studies as well as reinforcement activity to be done at home. This sheet was very carefully conceived and challenged the pupil to use his skills in working through the exercises. In this manner, a check was available to determine the extent to which the pupil had mastered the ideas and concepts presented during the school day. Individual prescriptions were made on the basis of these daily assignments. Educational assistants were important in the educative process in their checking of pupil assignments and in their work with individuals and small groups as assigned by the classroom teacher.

Various activities, in the classrooms observed, presented challenging situations for children that called upon their intellectual resources as well as enabling them to gain a sense of accomplishment from their performance. One situation that was exemplary was a lesson in deduction and reasoning that included use of language skills, integration of facts, and final solution based upon these facts. The teacher presented a series of pictures in a social studies unit for the students to place into proper sequence.

Questions such as, "what comes next," tested the child's perception of the situation, his background of knowledge relative to the situation and his ability to communicate his thinking through verbal response. The culmination of this activity incorporated writing, art work representative of the activity, and reading of a report to the class during the following session. This activity and others drew upon the basic skill areas and helped to enforce skills being acquired in the core areas of reading and verbal and written communication. In the area of mathematics, lessons were directed to children working on their own projects dealing with simple computation, spatial relationships and the like. Materials, such as discs, Cuisennaire rods, Stern material, and games and puzzles, helped to motivate children and enabled them to explore and discover concepts through individual work and work in small groups with their peers. In most lessons, the high motivational quality was evident. There seemed to be few instances where children were not using their time productively. Different areas of the classrooms were designated as science areas, library areas, dramatic play areas, etc. that took on the flavor of an open classroom, where children were free to work when a particular assignment was completed or when the teacher was working with a small group. The educational assistants were omni-present to talk with children, spark their interest, and to assist them in their self-selected activities. The above examples were noted in a majority of the classrooms observed from K-6 in both schools, suggestive of an intensive approach to improving the academic performance of the children.

An important qualitative aspect of the program was staff involvement, noted in the general school atmosphere and more specifically in the special primary exhibits set up in both schools during the month of May, 1971.

These exhibits displayed the work of children and teachers in the program. The amount of materials displayed lent further support to the observations made in the classrooms. Exhibits on black heritage; creative work of children (poetry, stories, art work); science experiments dealing with space, ecology, animal life, drugs, etc.; examples of different reading programs such as the Open Court series, Distar, and children's work samples in this area; social studies dioramas and reports; and arts and crafts work gave a varied picture of the activities that were ongoing that helped to make the school the center of the child's life and one of the principal sources of his development. Visitors to the exhibits seemed to be enjoying themselves and many stopped to try a puzzle, or read a poem or to generally express their satisfaction with the many things their children were doing at school.

Teacher-made materials were considered to be highly superior. In one school, a teacher had made electronic abacus that facilitated unit computation (ones, tens, hundreds etc.) . The device was very simple to operate and was put to excellent use in the classroom. Other teacher-made materials, such as charts, games, and mathematical puzzles, were used in the classrooms to spark cognitive development.

Parent involvement in the school program was noted to be fair in some areas and weak in others. Responses obtained from a small sample of parents to a questionnaire regarding their involvement in parent-teacher conferences, attendance at PTA meetings, and visits to parent activity centers set up in the schools are summarized in Table 4.

TABLE 4

PARENTAL INVOLVEMENT IN SCHOOL PROGRAMS

Activity	Several		One or Two		None	
	N	%	N	%	N	%
Attendance at PTA Meeting	6	13.3	19	42.2	20	44.4
Conference with Teacher	18	40.0	20	44.4	7	15.6
Social Activity at School	5	11.1	20	44.4	20	44.4
Service on Committee, trips			15	33.3	30	66.7

While it is true that parental involvement is still at a relatively low level, it should be noted that more parents were attending PTA meetings and school functions than was their practice in the past. Inroads have been made in this area largely through the efforts of the teacher in school and community relations, and through joint activities involving staff and parents (a program was put on in one of the schools that involved staff and parents and was presented to a packed house). In general, the Puerto Rican parent is not as involved in the school program as is the black parent. This is due in part to the language problem of the non-English speaking parent.

It would appear that general parent involvement in school wide activities was limited. The fact that so few of the respondents attended PTA meetings or functions established specifically for parents would indicate a weakness in the area of parent involvement in school functions. Similarly speaking, the low proportion of questionnaires that were returned (150 were distributed), is another indication of some lack in parent-school interaction.

TABLE 5

Parental Responses to Questionnaire Relative to

After-School Program (N=90)

		Affirmative Responses	
		N	%
1.	Does your child seem to like school better?	88	97.5
2.	Does your child like to come to the After-School Study Center?	82	91.5
3.	Does your child show more interest in books?	79	87.8
4.	Does your child seem to be reading more at home?	76	84.5
5.	Is your child doing his homework more willingly?	79	87.8
6.	Has your child developed new interests?	82	91.5
7.	Are you happy with the way in which the After-School Study Center is operating?	88	97.3

Suggestions concerning possible improvements in the center were made by 15 parents. Fourteen asked that their children be given more help in reading and arithmetic; eight asked that assistance in speaking English more fluently should be increased.

The effectiveness of the after-school centers added to the overall special primary program as a reinforcing agent of the skills acquired during the regular school day. The centers were staffed by teachers and educational assistants who were known to the children. Both formal and informal practice in the basic skill subject was conducted. In one class, (a music club) that was observed, children were learning to use the recorder. They had to employ counting to keep up with the proper rhythm and had to read the notes as well as the words of the song (On Top of Old Smokey), to keep their place in the small group of seven. In another music class, children were learning the song, Billy Boy, with a difficult rythmic pattern that involved careful attention to the counting of notes.

The teacher changed the age of Billy Boy often, so that children had to work out mathematically the age of the song's hero. This constant age changing was stimulating to the children and they were highly motivated to get the correct age before any one else did. One of the highlights of an afternoon observation at one of the centers was a club in cultural heritage. In the beginning of the session, the observer thought he was in a mathematics class, as the total group of 12 children worked through different computational exercises with the teacher and educational assistant. After 20 minutes of mathematics, the teacher presented some beautiful portraits of children from other lands. Spontaneously, the children began to identify the different pictures and to talk about the countries, the products produced there, the people, how they felt in the pictures. The children were led to gain an appreciation of other people and their accomplishments; truly a worthwhile experience for them.

As a result of parental request and children's motivation, the club groups became, in part, remedial sessions. Particularly for the older children, these remedial sessions helped them to solidify their gains in the academic core areas.

The degree of effectiveness of the After School Program may be guauged in part by the response of some of the teachers whose children were enrolled in the different groups after school. Responses were received from 35 staff members relative to the effectiveness of the program for their children. These responses are summarized in Table 6.

TABLE 6

Teacher Judgment of Effectiveness of After School Center Program (N=35)

Question	Affirmative Response N	Per Cent
1. Is child participating more actively in reading and related activities?	30	85.7
2. Is child more actively seeking books for classroom reading?	24	68.6
3. Is child more actively bringing in books from outside of school?	16	45.1
4. Is child making more use of his skills in solving classroom problems?	25	71.4
5. Is child showing improvement in reading in terms of:		
a. Phonics	26	74.3
b. Structural analysis	24	68.6
c. Comprehension	29	82.9
d. Study skills	24	68.6
6. Has child's peer relationships improved?	26	74.3
7. Has child's relationship with teachers improved?	27	78.5
8. Is child showing improvement in carrying out school assignments?	27	77.1

It would appear that utilization of the staff of the day school in the after school program was one of the major factors in the success of the total program. Since the staff of the after school centers was made up of teachers and assistants known to the children, the development of rapport was much less of a problem that it would have been had the adults been complete strangers to their charges. Moreover, lines of communication between teachers were more easily established and relevant information regarding students could be transmitted more easily.

A special note must be made here regarding the extremely high level of regard the staff members had for one another and for their schools. It is clear, through observation of the different activities, that the personnel involved were highly motivated and actively concerned individuals who cared about children's progress. The atmosphere in both schools was warm and open; teachers shared their ideas willingly and often made comments about the "wonderful" things going on in other classrooms taught by their peers. This was best exemplified by a grade conference attended by the observer. The topic for the meeting was the social studies curriculum being taught at the fourth grade level. The grade coordinator worked with the teachers to elicit ideas and different approaches to the units to be taught. The teachers shared ideas and techniques with one another and there was a strong air of unity of purpose. The basic material, The Thirteen Colonies, was less important than the question of how they would get the general concepts across to the children in a way that would maximize their participation and creativity. When the question of the unavailability of material was mentioned, two of the teachers produced material they had created and offered to share it with the others.

This grade conference was not unique; other similar examples were noted in both schools during the observation period.

The effectiveness of the special primary program in both schools might very well serve as a role model for other schools within the City. There is no question but that this program has contributed markedly to an increase in pupil achievement and motivation, and to greater interaction among school staffs. Major strengths and weaknesses as seen from an overview of the total program are noted below:

Strengths

1. A very high level of staff interaction and morale; pride in themselves and their school.

2. Increased staffing allowing for more individual attention to pupils.

3. Newer and more effective teaching techniques as developed in teacher planning sessions and grade conferences.

4. A close relationship between school administration and teaching staff that enhances efforts to make the school a service center to the community.

5. Opportunities provided for children to increase skill acquisition through regular and diversified classroom activity as well as in the informal atmosphere of the after school center.

6. Closer liaison between community service agencies and the school as effected through the joint efforts of school personnel and the teacher in school and community relations.

7. Excellent materials in the different subject areas that enhance children's motivation to learn. Specifically, material in the area of cultural heritage (social studies), and creative materials made by teachers, grade coordinators, and language arts specialists.

8. Physical plants that are clean and uncluttered, and whose walls are decked with charts, pictures, and pupil work samples which testify to the educational program.

9. Happy, learning children, growing steadily in cognitive and social skills.

10. Increased effort on the part of school staff to fight the problem of pupil mobility by insuring that individual prescriptions follow children to their new schools whenever possible, so that their education may continue uninterruptedly.

Weaknesses

1. Insufficient integration of the non-English speaking (Puerto Rican) parent into the school.

2. Unavailability of some materials ordered months in advance of the school year, which results in time being taken to restructure educational plans.

3. A high rate of pupil mobility that results in loss of educational continuity.

4. Insufficient allotment of special service time to assist those pupils needing psychiatric, psychological, social work assistance.

5. Insufficient involvement of parents in the educational program.

VI. SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The special primary schools program operating in District 23 has been observed to be of very high quality, offering to children and their parents a unique opportunity to identify with the school as an integral part of community life. Pupils have increased their learning skills, and evidenced high motivation for achievement. Parents have demonstrated their satisfaction with the schools as suggested by their increased

involvement with school staff and school programs. Staffs in the schools have been spurred on to greater activity as a result of the success they have achieved with their pupils. With the above success in mind, the following suggestions are made for consideration by the District:

1. An increased effort should be made to bring the non-English speaking parent into the school. Expansion of the corps of family assistants might be one approach to the situation. More program offerings stressing Puerto Rican culture should be instituted to serve as a link between the Puerto Rican parent and the school. Wherever possible, a person with bi-lingual skills should be available for parent-teacher conferences.

2. More intensive follow-up to expedite receipt of materials ordered for classroom use is needed.

3. An increase in personnel and time allotment for special services (psychiatric, psychological, social work) is indicated.

4. Increased experimentation with the open-classroom technique, with staff orientation to this approach should be considered.

5. Extension of program offerings at the after school centers to further pupil exposure (photography, drug abuse prevention programs, dramatics, etc.)

6. Use of other personnel in the after school centers, such as college education majors, social work students (as a field work experience), volunteer tutors.

7. Increased use of gyms in the after school centers to further children's physical development.

FORDHAM UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF EDUCATION
HARRY N. RIVLIN, DEAN

Function No. 77-11604

EVALUATION OF DECENTRALIZED ESEA TITLE I PROGRAMS

DISTRICT 23, NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION

"PROGRAM TO STRENGTHEN EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION IN POVERTY AREA SCHOOLS"

Prepared by

ELAINE B. CHAPLINE
and
WENDY OXMAN
Evaluation Directors

An evaluation of a New York City school district educational project funded under Title I of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965 (Pl 89-10) performed under contract with the Board of Education of the City of New York for the 1970-1971 school year.

INSTITUTE FOR RESEARCH AND EVALUATION
JOSEPH JUSTMAN, DIRECTOR

Publication No. 71-73

June 1971

EVALUATION OF ESEA TITLE I PROGRAMS

DISTRICT 23, NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION

"PROGRAM TO STRENGTHEN EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION IN POVERTY AREA SCHOOLS"

I. INTRODUCTION

The Program to "Strengthen Early Childhood Education in Poverty Area Schools" (SECE) organized in District 23 during the school year 1970-1971 constituted an extension of a similar program conducted during two previous school years. These programs were funded under Title I of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act (ESEA).

The Program was conceived to meet children's observed educational needs. Previous research and evaluation had identified some of these basic educational needs of children enrolled in early childhood classes in poverty areas:

a. To overcome deficits in verbal, conceptual, and cognitive development.

b. To think critically, make judgments, and develop solutions to problems.

c. To develop personal and interpersonal relationships with peers as well as with adults in the immediate environment.

d. To develop a sense of self-worth and an internalized code of behavior.

e. To improve vocabulary, concept development, and other skills requisite for success in formal learning.

f. To have parental and community knowledge of and support for their learning.

Two overall goals of the SECE program have been defined:

a. To improve the academic functioning of children in kindergarten, grade 1 and grade 2, with special emphasis on the removal of obstacles to learning.

b. To involve parents, in a meaningful way, in the education of their children.

The Program to Strengthen Early Childhood Education in Poverty Area Schools has the following stated objectives:

1. To develop at the earliest possible stage an awareness of the printed word and a readiness for reading through many experiences with stories, poetry and books.

2. To develop listening and speaking skills so that a child can communicate with peer groups and adults, follow directions, and enjoy and retell stories and poems in proper sequence.

3. To develop a larger vocabulary and learn beginning comprehension skills so that pupils may progress from readiness to beginning reading.

4. To provide at each child's level, opportunities to observe, discover, explore, experiment, classify, draw conclusions and/or find solutions; to make this possible through experiences in mathematics, science, art, and other creative expression.

Program Procedures

The Program to Strengthen Early Childhood Education in Poverty Area Schools was designed to provide more small group and individualized instruction by placing an educational assistant in every kindergarten class in poverty area schools. A multi-media approach to afford children opportunities to build perceptual skills (auditory, visual, tactile) and cognitive skills (naming and classifying) was to be emphasized. Curriculum guides appropriate to the kindergaten level were to be implemented.

On the first and second grade level, these needs were to be met by reducing pupil-teacher ratios and by providing educational assistant services. For 40 per cent of grade 1 and grade 2 classes, a pupil-teacher ratio of 15 to 1 in grade 1 and of 20 to 1 in grade 2 were to be established. For the remaining 60 per cent of grade 1 and grade 2 classes, a pupil-teacher ratio of 27.2 to 1 was to be established, with the addition of five hours of educational assistant time.

The presence of added adults, teachers and/or educational assistants, would make it possible to better meet the needs of each child. Educational assistants were to work in close relationship with the teachers assigned, their concern being to assist children in developing improved attitudes, skills and habits in accordance with specific objectives. They were to assist in giving small group instruction, in working with children at centers of interest, in maintaining wholesome classroom atmosphere, in the selection and acquisition of materials appropriate to the cultural background of the children, in the use of audio-visual materials, and were to provide supervision at games and in giving bilingual instruction when possible. Their role also called for assisting the teacher in the performance of such monitorial, clerical and administrative duties as required. In general, they were to assist the teachers to the greatest extent possible in order to give each child a maximum degree of small group and/or individualized instruction.

Paraprofessionals assigned to classes were to be residents of the community. Some might be parents in the schools. These educational assistants living in the community were to form a vital link between the home, the school and the community in the improvement of communication and interpretation of the objectives of the program.

A small amount of money was to be allotted for the purchase of additional supplies and materials so that adults can better provide individualized and small group instruction.

Staff development and training programs were to be conducted so that the full resources of the staff could be focused on meeting children's needs.

Parent and community related activities were to be carried out in order to promote a more cohesive learning environment for children.

II. EVALUATION PROCEDURES

The evaluation sought to determine as directly as possible the degree to which the program had been put into operation, how the program was operating and how children and school personnel were being affected.

Data Gathering

Data collected from a variety of sources, using a variety of means, included:

1. Analysis of school records - in order to gather data on program implementation, questionnaires were sent to all 16 schools in District 23 designated as eligible for participation in the program.
2. Observation - in order to obtain detailed data on the program's operation and to appraise its effectiveness, qualified observers visited 3 selected representative schools. In each school, 2 kindergarten, 3 first grade and 3 second grade classes were observed. In each first and second grade class, a reading lesson and a lesson in some other curricular area were observed. A standard form was used to summarize all classroom observations. An overall appraisal was made of the functioning in each first and second grade

group visited.

An orientation session was held for the two observers, both of whom were professional teacher educators with considerable experience in early childhood education and research. The program's objectives and research procedures were discussed.

3. Questionnaires - in order to gather additional information on program operation and to determine the reaction of the program's participants, questionnaires were sent to principals, assistant principals, early childhood coordinators and selected classroom and cluster teachers and paraprofessionals. Teachers' questionnaires included a series of ratings on children's growth.

4. Interviews - in order to contribute further information on the program's effects, observers, using the questionnaires mentioned above as basic tools, conducted interviews in the schools which they visited. Personnel involved were: principal, assistant principal, early childhood education coordinator, teachers and paraprofessionals.

5. Test results - in order to analyze the program's effects on children's skill development, test scores were collected. The scores of second grade children on the Upper Primary level of the Metropolitan Achievement Test were used. Metropolitan Achievement Test, Primary I scores for a first grade class, and N.Y.C. Prereading Assessment Test scores for a kindergarten class were collected by observers in three schools.

In addition, a follow-up was made of growth in reading during third grade by children who had been participants in the SECE Program in second grade during the 1969-70 school year in one school.

Program Implementation

The degree to which the program has been implemented was appraised in the following manner:

Program Procedure	Assessment Means
Organization of classes to provide desired sizes and ratios	School Records
Assignment of educational personnel in appropriate ratios	School Records
Provision of materials and supplies	Ratings by teachers and administrative personnel
Staff training programs	Questionnaire and interview responses
Parent programs	Questionnaire and interview responses

Program Objectives

Progress toward the objectives of the Program were assessed as follows:

Program Objective	Assessment Means
To develop at the earliest possible stage an awareness of the printed word and a readiness for reading through many experiences with stories, poetry and books.	Through standardized observation of interest, use of classroom library books, reading of signs in the classroom and curiosity and questions asked by children, and through teacher judgment of pupil growth.
To develop listening and speaking skills so that a child can communicate with peer groups and adults, follow directions, enjoy and retell stories and poems in proper sequence.	Through standardized observation of classroom language, and through teacher rating of children's skills.
To develop a larger vocabulary and learn beginning comprehension skills so that pupils may progress from readiness to beginning reading.	Through administration of standardized instruments (i.e. Prereading Assessment test in Kindergarten and Metropolitan Achievement Test, Primary I in grade 1, Upper Primary in grade 2)
To provide at each child's level, opportunities to observe, discover, explore, experiment, classify, draw conclusions and/or find solutions; to make this possible through experiences in mathematics, science, art and other creative expression.	Through teacher's rating, children's use of and manipulation of materials

Data Sources

1. School record data

Sixteen schools in District 23 were designated as eligivle for participation in the program; data regarding implementation of the program were received from all sixteen schools regarding kindergarten classes, and from 15 schools regarding first and second grade. Further data regarding the role of ratio teachers in the schools were received from 13 of the 14 schools reporting that teachers were assigned to the position.

2. Observation data

Three schools, hereinafter referred to as A, B, and C, were visited by an observer team. Interviews were conducted and observations were made in a total of 6 kindergarten, 9 first grade and 9 second grade classes. Detailed observation summaries, ratings and appraisals were yielded.

3. Questionnaire respondents

Questionnaires were mailed to all principals, assistant principals, ECE coordinators, three teachers at each grade level, three ratio teachers and three paraprofessionals in all schools not visited by observers. Interviews were conducted in Schools A, B, and C. These data yielded responses from 160 individuals with various roles in the schools.

TABLE II - 1

DATA COLLECTED THROUGH INTERVIEW AND QUESTIONNAIRE TECHNIQUES

Personnel	Number of Respondents
Principal	14
Assistant Principal	7
ECE Coordinator	5
Kindergarten Teacher	20
Grade 1 Teacher	29
Grade 2 Teacher	25
Ratio (Cluster) Teacher	21
Paraprofessional	39

Questionnaire returns from 14 principals revealed that 100 per cent of the respondents had a graduate degree and had earned an average of 67.15 graduate credits. They averaged 4.92 years of experience in their particular schools, with 2.69 years prior experience as principal and 6.08 years as assistant principal. They had an average of 7.29 years of elementary school teaching experience.

Assistant principals' questionnaires revealed an average of 58.14 graduate credits earned. They averaged 2.4 years of experience as assistant principals in their particular schools and 3.33 prior years as assistant principals. They had an average of 11.5 years of elementary and 3.0 years of early childhood teaching experience.

Early childhood coordinators' questionnaires revealed that in this group of one man and four women, four had earned a Master's degree. They had an average of 8.60 years experience in their particular schools and 1.90 years as early childhood coordinators.

Questionnaires from responding classroom teachers (6 men, 68 women) reported that 30 (40.5%) hold a Common Branches license, 32 (43.2%) an Early Childhood Education license, and 2 (2.7%) another license. Among the licensed teachers, 67 (90.5%) held a regular and 4 (5.4%) a substitute license. Most of the group had attended graduate schools, from which 21 (28.4%) had earned a degree. The average number of graduate credits earned was 21.35. As a whole, the group averaged 3.48 years of experience in their particular school, 3.35 years of prior teaching and 4.31 years of early childhood teaching experience.

Questionnaires returned from ratio or cluster teachers, all women, indicate that 13 (60%) hold Common Branches and 6 (27%) hold Early Childhood licenses. Among these, 15 (68%) hold regular licenses. An average of 23.29 graduate credits had been earned by this group. Two individuals had earned a graduate degree. The group had an average of 2.88 years of experience in their particular school, 6.17 years of prior teaching

and 3.74 years of early childhood teaching experience.

Among the paraprofessionals (1 man, 34 women) reporting, 13 (37.1%) had a high school diploma, 19 (54.3%) had completed some college work and 3 (8.6%) had earned a degree in a two year college program. A total of 32 paraprofessionals reported an average of 2.68 years of experience as an educational assistant or teacher aide prior to the current year. A total of 2.97 years of experience as an educational assistant or teacher aide in their particular school were reported by 32 paraprofessionals.

The general picture of the staff which emerges is that of a group of people who have sought out educational experiences beyond those minimally required for their positions. They have both general experience in their positions and specific experience in their particular schools. A degree of sophistication in this group of respondents, based upon their training and experience, will therefore be assumed in analyses of their responses to questionnaire and interview items.

Data Analysis

The sources of data used yielded extensive information on the nature of the program and its perceived effects on people. These data were summarized with appropriate sub-group comparisons being reported.

III. PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION

Program implementation has many facets. Those investigated and described in this section include: class organization and personnel, materials and equipment, staff training and development and parent programs.

A. Personnel and Organization at Kindergarten Level

A total of 113 kindergarten classes were organized in the 16 participating schools in District 23. Of these, 91 (80.5%) were classes taught by a single teacher with the assistance of a paraprofessional. No paraprofessional assistance had been assigned to two (1.8%) single classes. The 20 (17.7%) paired classes were taught by teachers sharing a single room who also shared the assistance of a paraprofessional. The mean registers of these kindergarten classes are presented below.

TABLE III - I

Mean Registers of Kindergarten Classes

Type of Class	Number of Classes	Mean Register
Single, with paraprofessional	91	21.31
Single, no paraprofessional	2	23.00
Paired, one paraprofessional	20	14.50

The objective of providing paraprofessional assistance to each kindergarten class has been met in the majority of instances. Small registers in the kindergarten classes have been maintained. The mean class size of less than 15 in paired classes indicates that in these classes on the average, two teachers share the responsibilities for the instruction of 30 children, with the help of a paraprofessional.

Additional teaching personnel, variously referred to as "ratio," "cluster," or "floater" teachers, have been assigned to kindergarten classes in each school. A total of 186 hours of ratio teacher time had been devoted to kindergarten classes in the District. Converting the hours of ratio teacher time to the fractional equivalent of full time service to the kindergarten classes, it was found that a total equivalent of 9.3 teachers served these classes.

A "pupil-teacher ratio," based on the ratio of the total number of pupils to the total number of classroom teachers and ratio teachers on the kindergarten level was computed. The mean class size in District 23's kindergartens was 18.75; the pupil-teacher ratio was 17.32 to one. The assignment of a total of 93 paraprofessionals further increased the staff and reduced the pupil-adult ratio to 9.84 to one.

The goal of assigning paraprofessionals and of maintaining low pupil-teacher and pupil-adult ratios in kindergarten classes in District 23 has been achieved. These ratios, moreover, are among the lowest in the city.

B. Personnel and Organization at First Grade Level

The goal of the SECE program at the first grade level was to establish a pupil-teacher ratio of 15 to one in 40 per cent of the classes; in the remaining 60 per cent, a pupil-teacher ratio of 27.2 to one, with an additional full-time assignment of paraprofessional assistance to these classes.

A total of 138 classes were organized on the first grade level. The registers in these classes ranged from 9 to 32 children. In the 55 classes with the lowest registers, (40 per cent of the total) the mean class register was 15.84. Of these 55 classes, 31 (56.4 per cent) had no paraprofessional assistance; 24 classes (43.6%) were assigned full-time paraprofessional assistants.

In the remaining 60 per cent of the first grade classes (85 classes), 70 (84.3%) had paraprofessional assistance, while 15 (15.7%) did not. The mean register of these classes was 26.45.

TABLE III - 2

Pupil-Teacher Ratios in First Grade Classes

Organization	Number of Classes	Per Cent of Classes	Mean Register	Adjusted Pupil-Teacher Ratio*
Low Register with Paraprofessional	24	17.5	15.84	13.69
Low Register without Paraprofessional	31	22.5		
High Register with Paraprofessional	70	50.7	26.45	22.86
High Register without Paraprofessional	15	9.3		

* Includes services of ratio or cluster teachers

Paraprofessional assistance, apparently, was assigned on the basis of criteria other than class size. Of the total of 138 classes, 94 (68.1%) were assigned the assistance of paraprofessionals; as previously noted, however, many of these paraprofessionals were assigned to classes with small registers.

Addition of the services of a total of 21.7 ratio teachers to first grade classes further reduced the pupil-teacher ratio below that indicated by the mean registers. The ratio of pupils to classroom and ratio teachers in 40 per cent of the first grade classes was 13.69 to one; in the remaining 60 per cent of the classes, the ratio was 22.86 to one.

Addition of the services of 94 paraprofessionals provided a pupil-adult ratio of 9.53 to one in 40 per cent of the classes; in the remaining 60 per cent the ratio was 12.53 to one. Thus, the objectives of the program on the first grade level in regard to lowering the pupil-teacher ratio

were achieved and surpassed.

C. Personnel and Organization at Second Grade Level

On the second grade level, the goal of the program was to establish a pupil-teacher ratio of 20 to one in 40 per cent of the classes, and in the remaining 60 per cent of the classes, to establish a pupil-teacher ratio of 27.2 to one, with full-time paraprofessional assistance.

A total of 113 second grade classes were organized, ranging in size from 7 to 35 children. In the 40 per cent of the classes with the lowest registers (45 classes) the mean register was 19.62. Of these classes, 27, or 60 per cent, had been assigned paraprofessional assistance. The mean register of the remaining 60 per cent of the second grade classes (68 classes) was 28.18; paraprofessionals were assigned to a total of 82 (72.6%) classes; 31 (27.4%) second grade classes had no paraprofessional assistance.

TABLE III - 3

Organization	Number of Classes	Per Cent of Classes	Mean Register	Adjusted Pupil-Teacher Ratio*
Low Register with Paraprofessional	27	20.4	19.62	16.63
Low Register without Paraprofessional	18	19.6		
High Register with Paraprofessional	55	48.6	28.18	23.88
High Register without Paraprofessional	13	11.4		

* Includes services of ratio or cluster teachers.

The services of 20.56 ratio teachers were assigned on the second grade level. The pupil-teacher ratio, taking these ratio teacher services into consideration, was 16.63 to one in the 40 per cent of the classes with the lowest registers and 23.88 to one in the upper 60 per cent.

Addition of the services of 82 paraprofessionals yielded a pupil-adult ratio of 10.39 to one in the 40 per cent of the classes with the

lowest registers and 13.04 to one in the upper 60 per cent.

The objective of the program on the second grade level in lowering the pupil-teacher ratios was achieved. However, many small classes had been assigned the help of paraprofessionals, while some larger classes had no such assistance.

In summary, it is evident, from analysis of these data, that District 23 has fully met the objectives of the SECE Program, in terms of class organization. Indeed, in this aspect of the Program, the District presents one of the most favorable pictures in the city.

D. Materials and Supplies

Classroom teachers, at the three levels of the program, were asked to rate books, audio-visual aids and other materials and equipment with which they had to work during the year. They rated, on a five point scale, general adequacy and adequacy in fostering progress toward program goals. Most frequent total responses (Table III-4) indicated that teachers felt the quality of materials was generally good. The least adequate functions of materials were in fostering muscular coordination and positive self-concept. Ratings were quite variable on the sufficiency and variety of materials.

TABLE III - 4

PER CENT OF 74 CLASSROOM TEACHERS' RATING OF CLASSROOM MATERIALS AND EQUIPMENT

Judgment of Material	RATING				
	Very Good	Good	Fair	Poor	Very Poor
Sufficiency	16.2	36.5	13.5	16.2	16.2
Quality	18.9	41.9	24.3	6.8	6.8
Variety	18.9	31.1	23.0	14.9	10.8
Challenge to Pupils	27.0	33.0	28.4	5.4	5.4
Helpfulness in fostering Language Development	28.4	43.2	16.2	5.4	5.4
Helpfulness in fostering Group play; interaction	18.9	35.1	23.0	16.2	5.4
Helpfulness in fostering muscular coordination	10.8	20.3	32.4	24.3	9.5
Helpfulness in fostering positive self-concept	18.9	25.7	32.4	12.2	9.5

Analysis of ratings by grade level revealed more variability (Tables III- 5, 6, 7). As tabulations were being prepared, a bi-polar situation was suggested. Some schools and grades tended to have positive ratings while others tended to have fair to poor ratings. A teachers' statement, "I haven't seen anymore or better materials," captures the feeling in some situations.

TABLE III - 5

PER CENT OF 20 KINDERGARTEN TEACHERS' RATING OF CLASSROOM MATERIALS AND EQUIPMENT

Judgement of Material	RATING Very Good	Good	Fair	Poor	Very Poor
Sufficiency	15.0	45.0	5.0	25.0	10.0
Quality	15.0	50.0	30.0		5.0
Variety	15.0	30.0	25.0	25.0	5.0
Challenge to Pupils	25.0	25.0	40.0	10.0	
Helpfulness in fostering Language development	40.0	30.0	20.0	5.0	5.0
Helpfulness in fostering Group play; interaction	15.0	55.0	20.0	5.0	5.0
Helpfulness in fostering Muscular coordination	15.0	30.0	35.0	15.0	5.0
Helpfulness in fostering Positive self-concept	20.0	35.0	30.0	15.0	

TABLE III - 6

PER CENT OF 29 FIRST GRADE TEACHERS' RATING OF CLASSROOM MATERIALS AND EQUIPMENT

Judgment of Material	RATING Very Good	Good	Fair	Poor	Very Poor
Sufficiency	26.9	23.1	23.1	11.5	15.4
Quality	26.9	46.2	19.2	7.7	
Variety	23.1	26.9	23.1	15.4	11.5
Challenge to Pupils	34.9	26.9	32.8	3.8	3.8
Helpfulness in fostering Language development	38.5	26.9	26.9	3.8	3.8
Helpfulness in fostering Group play; interaction	23.1	23.1	26.9	26.9	
Helpfulness in fostering Muscular coordination	19.2	11.5	34.6	30.8	3.8
Helpfulness in fostering Positive self-concept	30.8	26.9	19.2	15.4	7.7

TABLE III - 7

PER CENT OF 25 SECOND GRADE TEACHERS' RATING OF CLASSROOM MATERIALS AND EQUIPMENT

Judgment of Material	RATING				
	Very Good	Good	Fair	Poor	Very Poor
Sufficiency	9.5	47.6	14.3	19.0	9.5
Quality	14.3	42.8	33.3	4.7	4.7
Variety	9.5	47.6	28.6	9.5	4.7
Challenge to Pupils	19.0	61.9	19.0		
Helpfulness in fostering Language development	19.0	66.6	9.5	4.7	
Helpfulness in fostering group play; interaction	19.0	33.3	28.6	19.0	
Helpfulness in fostering muscular coordination	4.7	23.8	28.6	33.3	9.5
Helpfulness in fostering positive self-concept	9.5	28.6	57.1		4.7

Observer ratings (Tables III-8 and III-9) revealed that materials at first grade level were generally more adequate, plentiful and varied than those at second grade. Kindergarten materials were judged, in quality and quantity, to need improvement, as will be noted in a later section.

TABLE III - 8

Observer Ratings of Materials in Grade 1

Material	Per Cent of Rating		
	Plentiful	Adequate	Sparse; Not Present
Library or recreational reading	25.0	62.5	12.5
Reading Workbooks	12.5	75.0	12.5
Readers and other skill material	12.5	87.5	0.0
Other language arts	12.5	50.0	37.5
Science	25.0	75.0	0.0
Math	12.5	75.0	12.5
Art	25.0	62.5	12.5
Music	62.5	37.5	0.0
Physical activities	50.0	50.0	0.0

TABLE III - 9

Observer Ratings of Materials in Grade 2

Material	Per Cent of Ratings		
	Plentiful	Adequate	Sparse; Not Present
Library or recreational reading	57.1	14.3	28.6
Reading Workbooks	42.8	28.6	28.6
Readers and other skill material	57.1	28.6	14.3
Other language arts	57.1	28.6	14.3
Science	42.8	28.6	28.6
Math	57.1	14.3	28.6
Art	57.1	42.9	0
Music	71.4	28.6	0
Physical activities	57.1	28.6	14.3

The possibility of school to school and grade to grade variability in the adequacy of materials warrants some attention. Materials seem plentiful in a number of instances and very sparse in others, as noted by teachers and observers.

E. Staff Development and Training Activities

Essential elements in implementing an effective program are those development and training activities that help the total staff to work together to make full use of its resources. While there is clearly room for difference in defining the nature and extent of training programs from school to school, some provisions for training are necessary in all.

Since there were no district-wide training programs for early childhood teachers in the current year, as reported by 100 per cent of the ECE coordinators, and 92.9 per cent of the principals, training responsibilities rested upon various schools. Responses to a question of whether a school had organized a training or orientation program yielded differing perceptions from segments of the professional staff. (Table III-10). Among those respondents who indicated that training had taken place, there were considerable differences of opinion about the program's effectiveness (Table III-11). Some of these differences may be explainable through differences in how the various groups would define training programs. It seems appropriate, however, to interpret the teachers' ratings as an indication of a need for more effective training. This seems most markedly so in the case of the ratio teachers. Since they serve vital school functions, frequently working across grade levels, an adequate degree of training and consequent increased effectiveness could produce an impact on the overall program.

The district paraprofessional training/orientation program was rated as excellent (7.1%), good (42.9%), and fair (42.9%) by principals who indicated some familiarity with the program. The presence of a paraprofessional training program in the various schools was reported by a large majority of principals, assistant principals and classroom teachers. The effectiveness of those programs was perceived differently by segments of the professional staff (Table III-12). These responses suggest that these programs need strengthening, and that, the nature of the programs might be more fully described to the school community as a whole.

In general, it appears that more extensive staff development programs for teachers and paraprofessionals need to be planned. The total early childhood staff needs to be informed about the goals and involved in the activities of the program. Planning for these programs might be facilitated

if teachers and paraprofessionals were involved in developing workshops or activities for the programs.

TABLE III - 10

PER CENT OF STAFF GROUPS' REPORTING TEACHER TRAINING OR ORIENTATION PROGRAM

Group	Number	Had Program	Didn't Have Program	Didn't Know
Principals	13	64.3	35.7	
Ass't. Principals	6	83.3	16.7	
ECE Coordinators	5	60.0	40.0	
Classroom Teachers	74	39.2	47.3	1.4
Ratio Teachers	21	47.8	30.4	21.7

TABLE III - 11

EFFECTIVENESS OF SCHOOLS' TEACHER TRAINING OR ORIENTATION PROGRAM AS PERCEIVED BY DIFFERENT STAFF GROUPS, REPORTED IN PERCENTAGES

	RATINGS					
Group	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor	Very Poor	Don't Know
Principals	22.2	77.8				
Ass't. Principals	50.0	50.0				
ECE Coordinators	23.3	66.6				
Classroom Teachers	10.0	50.0	15.0	5.0	20.0	
Ratio Teachers				52.4	33.3	13.0

TABLE III - 12

EFFECTIVENESS OF SCHOOLS' PARAPROFESSIONAL TRAINING OR ORIENTATION PROGRAM AS PERCEIVED BY DIFFERENT STAFF GROUPS, REPORTED IN PERCENTAGES

	RATINGS					
Group	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor	Very Poor	Don't Know
Principals	7.1	42.9	42.9			
Ass't. Principals	25.0	50.0	25.0			
Classroom Teachers	9.1	25.0	20.5	6.8	1.4	36.4

Parent Involvement

While not a major program objective for the current year, parental knowledge of involvement in children's school experience was a desired outcome of the program.

Classroom teachers were asked if the SECE program had had any effect on the relationship of parents and community members to them as teachers. A number, 30, (40.5%) felt that it had, while 24 (32.4%) felt that it had not, 16 (21.6%) felt unsure that it had an effect and 3 (4.1%) didn't respond.

A majority of professional staff members indicated that their schools had a program to encourage greater involvement of parents in the program during the current year. Programs were reported by 78.6 per cent of the principals, 80 per cent of the assistant principals and 44.6 per cent of the classroom teachers. Among the group of teachers, 25.7 per cent either didn't know about the program or didn't respond to the question.

The activities described in the programs included grade teas, coffee hours, workshops, assembly programs, invitations to visit classes, trip involvement with children, trips for parents, classes (sewing, needlework),

language instruction (Spanish to English-speaking and English to Spanish-speaking parents), Mothers' Clubs, Parent room facility, special orientation programs and use of a school's guidance team with parents.

Effectiveness ratings by various staff groups (Table III-13) indicate that some of the program efforts were indeed satisfactory, but that room for improvement exists. A clear relationship between the extensiveness and rated effectiveness of school programs were noted.

In general, then, increased planning and execution of parent programs, with increased activity and diversity in those schools which currently have limited efforts, seems needed to enhance this program phase.

TABLE III - 13

RATINGS OF EFFECTIVENESS OF PROGRAM TO ENCOURAGE GREATER INVOLVEMENT OF PARENTS IN SECE PROGRAM, REPORTED IN PERCENTAGES

	RATINGS				
Group	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor	Very Poor
Principals	8.3	58.3	25.0	8.3	
Ass't. Principals	40.0	20.0	20.0		20.0
Classroom Teachers	15.2	39.2	18.2	15.2	12.1

IV. THE KINDERGARTEN PROGRAM

The program in kindergarten in terms of class organization, play experience, language activities, other content areas, classroom management and program effectiveness is described below. Data were drawn from observations in 3 schools, and from responses of program participants or interviews and questionnaires.

A. Organization

The classes observed represented the kinds of organization in existence in the district. Two morning, two afternoon and two all-day classes were observed. In both the morning and afternoon groups, the staff included a teacher and a paraprofessional. The all-day kindergarten had two teachers and a paraprofessional assigned.

Class registers which varied from school to school, ranged from 15 to 25, with an average of 19.8. School A's average was 19 and it's pattern was half-day groups with one teacher and a paraprofessional. School B's average was 25 with the same pattern. School C's average class size was 15.5 in an all day group with two teachers and a paraprofessional.

The attendance during observations ranged from 9 to 20 children with an average of 14.5. No school to school variations were discernable in attendance.

B. Play Experiences and Activities

The content of play observed ranged broadly with a variety of activities in each group. Table IV-1 summarized the activities observed.

TABLE IV-1

RANGE OF CONTENT OF PLAY ACTIVITY

Activity	Observed N	Observed Per Cent	Not Observed N	Not Observed Per Cent
Domestic	4	66.7	2	33.3
Construction	5	83.3	1	16.7
Toys (trains, cars, etc.)	5	83.3	1	16.7
Dramatic (puppets, constume play, etc.)	4	66.7	2	33.3
Manipulation (puzzles, pegboards, etc.)	5	83.3	1	16.7
Sand table, water play	2	33.3	4	66.7
Rhythms	5	83.3	1	16.7
Art	6	100.0	0	0
Dictated writing	3	50.0	3	50.0
Library (books, story records, etc.)	4	66.7	2	33.3
Outdoors play	4	66.7	2	33.3

In addition, one group had science equipment, such as magnets, and aquaria, whichwere spontaneously used by children.

The kinds of activity involved cooperative, parallel and individual play experiences. Some grouping which the teacher helped to organize, as well as spontaneous grouping occurred.

Some art activities, for example, easel painting, string painting, crayons, or dough, took place in all classes. Construction activities, toys, manipulation activities and rhythms took place in most groups.

The play equipment (Table IV-2) in use and available provided for a wide range of content in play. Two classes which were seen only indoors were not seen engaging in large muscle activities.

TABLE IV-2

Play Equipment Available and in Use in Kindergartens,

Reported in Percentages

Equipment Designed To:	In Use	Available Not in Use	Not Available
Stimulate large muscle activity	66.7		33.3
Promote cooperative play	66.7	33.3	
Promote dramatic play	66.7	33.3	
Stimulate expression of ideas and feelings	100.0		
Encourage quiet activities	83.3	16.7	
Encourage manipulative skill	83.3	16.7	
Encourage "looking-glass self"	100.0		

Ratings of positive qualities in play experiences were made using a five point scale, in which 5 indicated that the quality existed "almost always," 4 indicated "usually," 3 "occasionally," 2 "seldom" and 1 "almost never." These ratings were also expressed on a 5 point scale ranging from excellent through good, fair, poor and very poor. The ratings made by observers (Table IV-3) are favorable and positive with most qualities rated "good." The overall picture which emerges is of classes where considerable active, self-selected constructive play took place in which children are happily and productively engaged.

TABLE IV-3

Ratings of Play Experiences and Activities

Experiences	Per Cent of Ratings: Almost Always	Usually	Occasionally	Seldom or Never	Mean Rating
Children participate in planning, self-selective of activities	33.3	50.0	16.7		4.17
Children free from strain; smile, laugh, chatter	50.0	50.0			4.50
Children actively engaged in satisfying activity	50.0	50.0			4.50
Play materials suitable to age level	66.7	33.3			4.67
Play materials easily accessible, in good condition	16.7	83.3			4.17
Use of available play space	33.3	50.0	16.7		4.17

C. Language activities

Since a major objective of the SECE program was to promote language and concept development, specific attention was given during observations to the nature of language usage in classes. A wide range of specific language activities, both spontaneous and supervised by adults, was observed involving both speaking and listening. A significant indication of the spontaneous use of language and of positive classroom climate was that children asked questions in all and stated their needs in most classes. Helpful involvement of adults in eliciting and responding to children's language was observed. Children frequently spoke to each other during on-going activities, to discuss the activity or their own feelings or ideas.

Table IV-4 summarizes the observations of language experiences in kindergarten classes.

TABLE IV-4

Children's Language Activities in Kindergarten, Reported in Per Cent of Classes

Activity	Un-supervised	Supervised by teacher	Supervised by Paraprofessional	Supervised by both
Conversation	50.0	83.3		
Planning	16.7	33.3	16.7	
Explaining	33.3	33.3		33.3
Discussion	16.7	50.0		
Telling stories	33.3	66.7		
Retelling stories	33.3	50.0		16.7
Telephoning	33.3	16.7	16.7	
Dramatization	33.3	16.7	16.7	
Speaking to groups	50.0	50.0		
Asking questions	100.0	33.3		
Stating needs	83.3	33.3		
Greetings, farewells	83.3	50.0		
Telling experiences	66.7	33.3		
Giving directions	66.7	50.0		
Delivering messages	33.3	33.3		
TV	16.7	16.7		
Music, rhythms	33.3	33.3		
Movies	16.7			

Language activities specifically designed for building reading readiness or for beginning reading were observed. Readiness activities included: visual and auditory discrimination experiences (lotto, color matching and naming, left to right directionality, puzzles, etc.) alphabet awareness (letter tracing on large forms) following directions (for spiral mobiles, for string painting, for using work sheets, etc.) concept building (naming, clothing, articles and uses, tool definition, identifying short, long, inside and outside, etc.)

The Distar program was seen in operation in four classes. Variations in sub-grouping included: five children per group for a 20 minute session; seven children per group for a Distar unit. Blocks, charts, cards, manuals and work sheets were all seen in use. Children were listening, speaking, reading, labeling, identifying, describing, anticipating events in stories, etc. These activities were closely supervised by teachers and paraprofessionals.

Ratings of language activities (Table IV-5) were made using the five point scale described above. The overall quality of language activities was rated "good" to "excellent." In two instances, no non-English speaking children were present during observations. In all groups considerable attention was directed toward helping individual children to communicate effectively.

TABLE IV-5

Ratings of Language Experiences in Kindergarten Classes

Experiences	Per Cent of Ratings: Almost Always	Usually	Occasionally	Seldom	No Rating	Mean Rating*
Adults ask questions that stimulate oral response, discussion	33.3	66.7				4.33
Adults listen to and understand children	50.0	50.0				4.50
Adults give specific attention to language development of non-English speaking children	16.7	50.0			33.3	4.25
Adults use incidental and planned experiences to develop observation and related verbalization	50.0	50.0				4.50
Child-adult communication free and open, without hesitation or restriction	66.7	33.3				4.67
Child-child communication active, vital and flowing	66.6	16.7	16.7			4.50

* Ratings on five point scale (5 = excellent, 4 = good)

D. Other Content Areas

Content areas such as mathematics, science, literature, art and music provide rich opportunities for the development of concepts, extension of vocabulary and general knowledge of the world and increasing skills in dealing with the environment. A well balanced, stimulating kindergarten program provides a wealth of content with which children may interact.

Both spontaneous interactions and planned structured experiences play a part in a full program for inner city children. An illustration of spontaneous use of science materials occurred in one class when a girl picked up a magnet and began to test the object's properties in relation to it. The teacher, seeing this, used the opportunity to engage the child in a discussion of what she was observing. Planned experiences for example, took the form of planting a variety of seeds and observing growth of plants. Counting out materials for use, for example, provided opportunities for building and clarifying mathematical concepts. Both kinds of situations provided direct opportunities through which children were observing, describing, inquiring, evaluating and conceptualizing experiences.

The ratings of various content areas, which summarize the extent of positive curricular areas observed, are reported in Table IV-6. These ratings were by and large good, with excellence in some situations.

TABLE IV-6

RATINGS OF VARIOUS CONTENT

AREAS IN KINDERGARTEN PROGRAM

PER CENT OF RATINGS

Experiences	Almost Always	Usually	Occasionally	Seldom	No Rating	Mean Ratings*
Teachers build understanding of mathematical concepts	50.0	33.3	16.7			4.17
Teachers structure specific group activities to develop science concepts	50.0	50.0				4.50
Teachers structure experiences that focus upon the children's environment	33.3	66.7				4.33
Teachers encourage good health and safety practices	33.3	66.7				4.33
Teachers use literature in a way that creates enthusiasm and enjoyment	16.7	66.6			16.7	4.20
Teachers guide children in finding satisfaction and pleasure in music	16.7	66.6			16.7	4.20
Teachers use art experiences for children to explore media	33.3	50.0	16.7			4.16

* Ratings on five point scale (5 = excellent, 4 = Good etc.)

E. CLASSROOM MANAGEMENT

Day by day classroom living provides opportunities for both attitude building and cognitive and skills development. The degree to which teachers used these opportunities to promote growth was rated on a 5 point scale and summarized in Table IV-7. The adults were rated "good" in their educational uses of management and routines.

TABLE IV-7

Ratings of Classroom Management in Kindergartens

Area	Per Cent of Rating: Almost Always	Usually	Occasionally	Seldom	Mean Rating*
Children are given responsibility for routine activities	33.3	66.7			4.33
Character of transitions smooth and effective	33.3	50.0	16.7		4.16
Teacher flexibility appropriate	50.0	50.0			4.50
Adults utilize classroom living to foster sharing; acceptance of rights and responsibilities of self and others	50.0	50.0			4.50

* Ratings on 5 point scale (5=Excellent, 4=Good, etc.)

Overall program ratings

Overall ratings of the play, language and other content activities, classroom management and total learning environment were made using a five point scale. These ratings summarized in Table IV-8 were good, with language experiences judged excellent in half of the classes. Strengthening in the other content areas and in play experiences seems needed now.

TABLE IV-8

Overall Ratings of Kindergarten Program

Area	Per Cent of Ratings					Mean Rating*
	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor	No Rating	
Play experience	16.7	83.3				4.16
Language experience	50.0	50.0				4.50
Other content areas	16.7	66.6			16.7	4.20
Classroom management	33.3	66.7				4.33
Total Observation	16.7	83.3				4.16

* Ratings on five point scale (5=Excellent, 4=Good)

The appraisal of the program by participants, through interviews and questionnaires, was done in several ways. Ratings of the effect of the total strengthening early childhood education program were made along with designations of areas of greatest improvement, areas of significant problems and elements which contributed most to the program.

Effects of the total SECE program on kindergartens (Table IV-9) were rated as strongly positive by a majority of principals (78.6%) assistant principals (66.6%), ECE coordinators (100%), and teachers (55%). Most of the remaining ratings indicated a somewhat positive effect of the program.

TABLE IV-9

Effect of Total Strengthened ECE Program on Kindergarten

Per Cent of Participants assigning rating

Personnel Rating	Strongly Positive	Somewhat Positive	Neutral	Somewhat Negative	Strongly Negative	Don't Know
Principals	78.6	14.3	7.1			
Assistant Principals	66.6	16.7				16.7
ECE Coordinators	100.0					
Classroom Teachers	55.0	40.0	5.0			

Administrator's ranking of areas of greatest improvement in the program differed, both within and among personnel groups. Table IV-10 presents these rankings.

TABLE IV-10

Areas of Greatest Improvement in Kindergarten During 1970-1971

Average Ranking Assigned by Administrators*

Program Area	Principals	Assistant Principals	ECE Coordinato
General Academic progress	4.5	4.0	2.7
Social behavior of children	3.7	3.4	5.5
Relationship between school and parents	3.9	4.8	5.7
Instructional techniques of teachers	4.2	5.4	4.3
Teachers' control of class	5.2	6.6	6.6
Materials of instruction used	5.7	5.5	3.5
Individualization of instruction	3.4	2.8	4.7
Creative expression of children	5.4	5.8	6.3
Progress in reading	4.3	3.2	3.8

* Lowest ranking indicates greatest improvement

Both principals and assistant principals judged individualization of instruction as the area showing greatest improvement. Both of these groups agreed that fewer gains had taken place in creative expression of children and materials of instruction used. The teachers' control of class had shown less improvement, judged by all three administrative groups. This could have been a function of less need for improvement in that particular area. As one principal commented during an interview, "The kindergartens have been and continue to be fine. They always manage well."

ECE coordinators judged greatest improvements to have taken place in general academic progress, materials of instruction used and progress in reading. Since these coordinators were frequently responsible for selecting and ordering materials and equipment; they may have been particularly aware of new additions. Evidently, as judged by others, even if materials were better they were still not at a level that would generally be considered favorable.

Significant problems encountered, in organizing and implementing the SECE program were designated in a number of areas by different personnel groups. (Table IV-11) Pupil mobility stands are as a problem identified by 57.1% of the principals and 60% of the teachers. Teachers (55%) and ECE coordinators (80%) indicated that materials, including audiovisual, raised problems. Assistant principals emphasized classroom and other space, class size and staff relationships while ECE coordinators cited teacher turnover as problematic.

Table IV-11

Significant Problems in Organizing and Implementing the SECE Program In Kindergarten

Problem Area	Per Cent of Participants Citing Area			
	Principals	Assistant Principals	ECE Coordinators	Teachers
Classroom and other space	21.4	28.6	40.0	30.0
Class size	21.4	28.6	20.0	30.0
Materials including audiovisual	21.4	14.3	80.0	55.0
Parent relations	14.3	14.3		20.0
Staff relationships	14.3	28.6		5.0
Individualization of instruction	X	X	X	5.0
Teacher training (methods)	14.3			X
Teacher training (management and discipline)	14.3	14.3		X
Discipline of children	X	X		35.0
Overemphasis on reading	14.3	14.3		30.0
Teacher turnover	14.3	14.3	60.0	X
Pupil mobility	57.1	14.3	40.0	60.0
Training of Paraprofessionals	21.4		40.0	10.0
Assignment of ratio teachers	7.1		20.0	5.0

X = Group was not asked to rate that item

Some data on pupil mobility and attendance rates were secured for a sample of 29 classes. Teachers reported that, with an average register of 2 to 5 and daily attendance of 20.1, an average of 3.9 children had entered and 5.0 children had left their classes during the school year. This serves to underscore the realistic nature of concerns expressed with regard to children's mobility.

When selecting the elements which contributed most to the program (Table IV-12), principals differed somewhat in their choice but 28.6 per cent felt that reduced class size and the assignment of ratio teachers had contributed significantly. Assistant principals (80.0%) designated staff enthusiasm, while ECE coordinators selected a wide range of elements. Teachers clearly emphasized help of paraprofessionals (42.8%) and reduced class size (32.2%) as the elements which contributed most to the program.

TABLE IV-12

Element Which Contributed Most To The SECE Program, as Rated by Personnel

	Per Cent of Participants Citing Element			
Element	Principals	Assistant Principals	ECE Coordinators	Teachers
Reduced class size	28.6	20.0	10.0	32.2
Assignment of ratio teachers	28.6			3.6
Enthusiasm of staff	14.3	80.0	10.0	7.2
Help of paraprofessionals	21.4		10.0	42.8
More and better materials			10.0	7.2
Involvement of parents			10.0	7.2
Assignment of ECE Coordinator			10.0	7.2

Overall, the program seems to have been carried out in ways which are consistant with the objectives and goals of the program. As viewed by observers and by participants, the program is functioning generally on a good , positive level.

V. FIRST AND SECOND GRADE PROGRAM

The SECE program as it was being carried out in first and second grades, in terms of organizational patterns, adult role, kinds of activities and lessons and indications of effectiveness is described below. Data have been drawn from observations of 18 classes in three schools and from participants' responses to interviews and questionnaires.

A. Organizational Patterns

Among the classes observed on first grade level, five had a teacher and paraprofessional assigned, one had a teacher alone and three had two teachers plus a paraprofessional. On the second grade level, six had a teacher and paraprofessional assigned; three had two teachers plus a paraprofessional. Two of the schools had a typical pattern of a single teacher with a paraprofessional assigned and one school typically used a "team" approach in which 2 classes were assigned 4 teachers and 2 paraprofessionals.

The patterns of organization within classes observed varied from total class to individual instruction, (Table V-1). The most frequent patterns used in first grades were small group and individual instruction. In second grade, the most frequent pattern seen was total class instruction followed by small groups.

TABLE V-1

Grouping Patterns Observed in First and Second Grade Classes

Rank and Average Percent of Time Observed*

Grouping Pattern	Grade 1		Grade 2	
	Rank	Per Cent	Rank	Per Cent
Total class	3	32.1	1	48.0
Small groups	1	42.0	2	41.7
Individual	2	38.8	4	15.0
Combination of Small group and individuals	4	15.0	3	20.0

*Percentages do not add up to 100 because of variations among classes

B. Adult Roles

The adult roles seen in first grade classes (Table V-2) suggest that a typical class operates with groups during reading and other content lessons supervised by a teacher and a paraprofessional. The teacher also works frequently with individuals and typically organizes and directs total class activity and checks children's work. The paraprofessional also checks children's work and helps children to attend to learning tasks and to behave appropriately. When a second teacher is present, she typically teaches a small group, works with individuals, checks work and alternates with the paired teacher in directing the class as a whole. Housekeeping and record keeping were shared with the paraprofessional performing these tasks more frequently.

TABLE V-2

Mean Ranking of Adults' Activity and Time Observed in First Grade Classrooms*

Activity	Teacher 1	Teacher 2[(a)]	Paraprofessional
Teaching class	2.7	3.7	7.0
Teaching small group	1.5	1.3	1.3
Teaching individuals	2.1	1.7	4.2
Discipline	4.6	5.0	3.5
Housekeeping	6.3	6.0	4.0
Checking work	3.2	3.3	2.3
Record keeping	6.7	7.0	5.6

* Lowest mean rank indicates greatest portion of activity and time spent

(a) 3 classrooms had a second teacher

The most typical pattern seen in second grades was small groups supervised by a teacher and a paraprofessional who also frequently checked children's work. The teacher taught the whole class, checked work, taught individuals and maintained appropriate behavior. The paraprofessional taught individuals and maintained appropriate behavior. Housekeeping and record keeping were shared, with the teacher doing these tasks less frequently. When a second teacher was present, in order of frequency, she taught a small group, taught individuals, checked work; taught the class, maintained order, and did housekeeping and record-keeping. Table V-3 presents these rankings.

TABLE V-3

Mean Ranking of Adults' Activity and Time Observed in Second Grade Classrooms*

Activity	Teacher	Paraprofessional
Teaching class	2.0	7.0
Teaching small groups	1.3	1.7
Teaching individuals	3.0	2.8
Discipline	4.0	3.0
Housekeeping	6.7	5.0
Checking work	2.7	1.7
Record keeping	6.3	5.0

* Lowest mean rank indicates greatest portion of activity and time spent

C. Activities of Children

Table V-4 summarizes the activities observed in classes. Language development, discussion and reading, skill building through "drill" and demonstrations by children were the most frequently seen activities in first and second grades. Since the evaluation plan called for observation of one reading lesson and one other lesson, it seems possible that the weighting of activities seen was partially a function of observers' requests. Comments by teachers and administrators, however, indicated that emphasis in the program generally was on reading and language development activities. Question may be raised therefore about the extent to which staff members are using content such as science and social studies as areas through which language and concept development can be fostered.

TABLE V-4

Activities Observed in First and Second Grade Classrooms

Activity	Per Cent of Classrooms	
	Grade 1	Grade 2
Planning	37.5	14.3
Discussion	87.5	85.7
Language Development	87.5	100.0
Demonstration by child	75.0	71.4
Physical education	12.5	42.9
Play	12.5	57.1
Research	50.0	42.9
"Drill"	87.5	85.7
Art	25.0	57.1
Storytelling	25.0	42.9
Teacher reading aloud	25.0	42.9
Experimentation	50.0	57.1
Recreational reading	75.0	85.7

D. Lessons

Reading lessons and another lesson, mostly mathematics, were observed in the 18 first and second grade classes in the sample. Ratings were made of many characteristics using a five point scale, from excellent (5.0) to very poor (1.0). Table V-5 presents these ratings.

TABLE V-5

Means Rating Assigned to Reading and Other Lessons

Observed in First and Second Grades

Characteristics Observed	Mean Ratings* Grade 1 Reading	Grade 1 Other	Grade 2 Reading	Grade 2 Other
Lesson is well planned and organized	4.2	4.7	4.3	4.3
Lesson type and level of content are suitable for children in class	4.0	4.3	4.1	4.3
Lesson is paced to needs and personality of children	4.1	4.3	4.1	4.2
Teacher evaluates and encourages children to evaluate learnings	4.2	4.6	4.1	4,2
Emphasis of lesson is on development of concepts and understanding rather than in drill and organization	4.0	4.0	3.9	4.6
Experiences of children are drawn on	4.1	4.1	3.9	4.2
Provision is made for follow-up based on interests and needs	4.1	4.2	4.1	4.1
Teacher uses opportunities to relate concepts and learnings to other areas of curriculum	3.9	3.6	3.8	3.9
Children are aware of what they are learning	4.0	4.2	4.1	4.0
Teacher talks clearly and at a suitable volume	4.4	4.4	4.4	4.5
Teacher encourages thinking and oral language through use of stimulating questions	4.2	4.1	4.4	4.5
Teacher uses praise and encouragement; avoids reproof as much as possible	4.5	4.6	4.1	4.3
Many children participate, comment, explain, ask questions, discuss, demonstrate	4.4	4.7	4.4	4.4
Teacher uses good techniques for involving slower as well as faster learners	4.2	4.2	3.6	4.2

TABLE V-5 (Continued)

Characteristics Observed	Grade 1 Reading	Grade 1 Other	Grade 2 Reading	Grade 2 Other
Most children are alert, interested, eager but not tense during instruction	4.2	4.6	4.2	4.2
In general, children appear to have learned what teacher tried to teach	3.9	4.2	4.1	4.2
Materials used during lesson suitable in content and level of difficulty	4.1	4.4	3.9	4.4
When total class is not taught as a single group, activities provided for other children are suitable, worthwhile	4.5	4.1	4.6	4.4
Materials used by independent groups or individuals are suitable in content and level of difficulty	4.4	4.1	4.2	4.3
Independent groups of individuals work constantly at assigned or other tasks	4.3	4.3	4.4	4.4
Work done by independent groups or individuals is checked and supervised in some way	4.2	3.9	4.4	4.3
General estimate of teachers' instructional ability based on this lesson	4.3	4.7	4.0	4.3
General estimate of teachers control of class during lesson	4.3	4.3	4.1	4.5
General estimate of teachers' use of paraprofessional during lesson	4.3	4.0	3.9	4.1

*Ratings were on a five point scale, with the higher the most positive rating

Inspection of the average ratings reveals that lessons were generally rated as "good." Reading was rated slightly higher in first grade than in second, but in both grades lessons other than reading had somewhat higher ratings. This differential between reading and other lessons was more pronounced in second than in first grade.

The specific characteristics of other lessons in first grade which yielded the more positive ratings were their organization, appropriateness, pacing, active quality and interest value. It's possible that teachers were teaching in ways that were especially stimulating. Observers also noted the frequent use of materials which children actively manipulated during mathematics work. Despite overall ratings, these other lessons didn't provide as adequately for individualization or independent work as did reading.

In second grade other lessons were assigned higher ratings than reading in their emphasis on concepts, relationship to children's experiences, appropriateness and involvement of children. As in first grade, provision for independent group or individual work was better during reading.

Lowest ratings, across areas and grades were assigned to the teachers' use of opportunities to relate concepts and learning to other areas of curriculum. This suggests the possibility that interrelationships among content areas and continuity in concept building need strengthening.

E. Overall Classroom Ratings

Classroom characteristics dealing with positive aspects of social-emotional climate, interpersonal relationships, leadership, organization, management and physical facilities were rated on a scale indicating their presence from almost always (5) to hardly ever (1). Table V-6, which contains average ratings in grades 1 and 2 on specific characteristics, shows that these postive characteristics were usually observed.

TABLE V-6

Mean Ratings Assigned to Various Characteristics Observed in First and Second Grade Classes

Characteristic	Mean Ratings Grade 1	Grade 2
Relationships between children are friendly, cooperative	4.5	4.4
Children communicate freely with little yelling, pushing, interrupting	4.4	4.3
Children show independence and help one another in dressing, working, etc.	4.0	3.9
Children tend to use sentences rather than words or phrases in communicating	4.1	4.1
Children appear to like school; general atmosphere of class free from tension	4.4	4.1
Children are friendly and courteous to teacher and other adults	4.4	4.4
Children show confidence in teacher and other adults; ask for help when needed; are not unduly demanding	4.3	4.4
Children accept directions of adults promptly without hostility	4.3	4.4
Teacher avoids over-domination; children given opportunities for initiative or leadership	4.3	4.0
Relationship between teachers sharing room is positive	4.6	4.5
Relationship between teachers and paraprofessionals is friendly, cooperative, confident	4.4	3.8
Emotional climate of classroom is warm and positive	4.4	4.3
Quiet learning activities are interspersed with play, body activity and rest	4.1	3.9
Grouping patterns vary with different activities	4.1	3.7
Attention is given to learnings of individual children as well as total class and small groups	4.4	4.1
Classroom courtesies and management by teacher are well developed and effective	4.4	4.4
Paraprofessionals actively participate in childrens' functioning and learning activities	4.5	4.2

TABLE V-6 (Continued)

Characteristics	Mean Ratings Grade 1	Grade 2
Room is attractively furnished and decorated, not cluttered	4.0	3.9
Furniture is suitable to children functionally arranged	4.1	4.0
Classroom space is well utilized	4.3	4.0
Toilet and washing facilities are easily accessible	3.6	3.6
Exit to street is easy accessible	3.5	3.4
Safety precautions appear to be well observed both in physical facilities and class management	3.9	4.0

The overall picture is slightly but rather consistently more favorable in first grade. The characteristics which contribute most to this picture are the general atmosphere in the classrooms, provision for individual attention, positive relationship of teachers and paraprofessionals. The paraprofessionals' active participation in children's learning, flexibility of organization and good utilization of space. The suggestion in these data is that the first grades have a slightly more positive emotional climate and also work somewhat more efficiently on learning tasks.

F. Overall Program Ratings

Participants in the program via interviews and questionnaires provided assessments of the effect of the total SECE program, the areas of greatest improvement, areas of significant problems in establishing the program, and the elements contributing most to the program.

Total program effects (Tables V-7 and V-8), while viewed more positively by administrators than by classroom teachers, were judged generally positive on a five point scale. The first grade picture was more affirmative than that of the second grade as judged by principals and classroom teachers.

TABLE V-7

Effect of Total Strengthened ECE Program in First Grade

	Per Cent of Participants Assigning Rating					
Personnel Rating	Strongly Positive	Somewhat Positive	Neutral	Somewhat Negative	Strongly Negative	Don't Know
Principals	78.6	21.4				
Assistant Principals	57.1	14.3				14.3
ECE Coordinators	100.0					
Classroom teachers	40.0	48.0	12.0			

TABLE V-8

Effect of Total Strengthened ECE Program in Second Grade

	Per Cent of Participants Assigning Rating					
Personnel Rating	Strongly Positive	Somewhat Positive	Neutral	Somewhat Negative	Strongly Negative	Don't Know
Principals	57.1	42.9				
Assistant Principals	57.1	14.3				14.3
ECE Coordinators	100.0					
Classroom teachers	23.8	57.1	19.1			

Classroom teachers, when rating the effects of the program on children's learning and behavior felt that more impact had occurred on general learning and reading than on behavior. These ratings are summarized in Tables V-9 and V-10. Ratio teachers (Table V-11) refrained from making judgments about general learning in many cases, but judged that there had been generally good effects on reading and behavior. Teachers tended to polarize in their ratings on children's behavior. Those who felt the program had had positive effects emphasized the benefits of individual attention and the positive contribution of paraprofessionals. Those who felt the program had no effect on behavior emphasized large classes, complexities of children's problems and a negative impact of the total school environment.

TABLE V-9

Effects of SECE Program on Children's Learning and Behavior, Rated by Classroom Teachers, Grade 1

	Per Cent Assigning Rating					
Effect On	Very Good	Good	Fair	No Effect	Negative Effect	No Response
General Learning	57.6	23.1	7.7	11.6		
Reading	46.5	38.4	7.7	7.7		
Behavior	32.0	20.0	8.0	36.0	4.0	

TABLE V-10

Effects of SECE Program on Children's Learning and Behavior, Rated by Classroom Teachers, Grade 2

	Per Cent assigning ratings					
Effect On	Very Good	Good	Fair	No Effect	Negative Effect	No Response
General Learning	33.3	38.1	14.2	4.8	4.8	4.8
Reading	28.5	43.1	14.2	14.2		
Behavior	9.6	52.3	9.6	28.5		

TABLE V-11

Effect of SECE Program on Children's Learning and Behavior, Rated by Ratio Teachers, Grades 1 and 2

	Per Cent Assigning Rating					
Effect On	Very Good	Good	Fair	No Effect	Negative Effect	No Response
General Learning	13.0	19.0				66.6
Reading	38.1	47.6	9.5	4.8		
Behavior	52.0	42.9	4.8			

Areas of greatest improvement were ranked from 1 through 9 by principals, assistant principals and ECE coordinators. These ranks were averaged and are presented in Table V-9 for first grade and Table V-10 for second grade. Closeness of ranking figures indicates that individuals ranked specific items differently. These differences may reflect school to school variations as well as the vantage point of the individual doing the ranking in individualization of instruction and instructional techniques. All three groups saw creative expression of children as improving less than other areas. Table V-12 presents these data.

TABLE V-12

Areas of Greatest Improvement in First Grade

Average Ranking Assigned by Administrators*

Program Area	Principals	Assistant Principals	ECE Coordinators
General academic progress	3.8	5.0	2.8
Social behavior	3.1	5.6	6.2
School-parent relations	4.9	4.6	6.2
Teachers' instructional techniques	3.7	5.2	4.3
Teachers' control of class	4.7	4.8	7.4
Instructional materials used	5.9	4.4	4.8
Individualization of instruction	3.5	2.5	4.2
Creative expression of children	7.5	8.6	6.7
Progress in reading	4.6	3.2	2.2

* Lowest mean ranking indicates greatest improvement

On the whole, principals, in ranking first grades tended to choose social behavior, individualization of instruction, instructional techniques and general academic progress as those areas which showed greatest improvement. Assistant principals agreed that individualization of instruction had shown improvement, but judged that reading progress, instructional materials and school-parent relations had improved markedly. ECE coordinators judged progress in reading and general academic progress to be noteworthy, along with improvement.

Second grade rankings by principals cited social behavior, individualization of instruction and instructional techniques as areas of greatest improvement. Assistant principals selected progress in reading, individualization of instruction, instructional materials and social behavior as improved areas, ECE coordinators agreed that progress in reading and instructional materials had improved, but judged that instructional techniques and general academic progress had also shown gains. All rating groups saw fewer gains on the average in creative expression of children. These rankings are presented in Table V-13.

TABLE V-13

Areas of Greatest Improvement in Second Grade

Average Ranking Assigned by Administrators*

Program Area	Principals	Assistant Principals	ECE Coordinators
General academic progress	4.5	4.3	3.7
Social behavior	3.2	4.2	6.3
School-parent relations	4.5	6.0	6.5
Teachers' instructional techniques	3.9	5.8	3.3
Teachers' control of class	4.5	5.2	6.6
Instructional materials used	5.5	4.2	3.7
Individualization of instruction	3.5	3.2	3.8
Creative expression of children	7.5	8.4	7.3
Progress in reading	5.0	2.7	3.3

* Lowest mean ranking indicates greatest improvement

Significant problems in organizing the SECE program were summarized in the percentages of personnel who cited particular problems. These percentages are reported for first grade in Table V-14 and for second grade in Table V-15.

TABLE V-14

Significant Problems in Organizing and Implementing the SECE Program in First Grade

Problem Area	Per Cent of Participants Citing Area			
	Principals	Assistant Principals	ECE Coordinators	Classroom Teachers
Classroom and other space	28.6	42.9	80.0	20.0
Class size	35.7	14.3	80.0	40.0
Materials, including audiovisual	28.6	28.6	60.0	40.0
Parent relations	7.1	14.3	20.0	12.0
Community relations		14.3		
Staff relationships	21.4			12.0
Individualization of Instruction	X	X	X	32.0
Teacher training (methods)	14.3	14.3		X
Discipline of Children	X	X	X	48.0
Teacher training (management, discipline)	28.6	28.6		X
Overemphasis on reading	14.3			8.0
Teacher turnover	14.3		60.0	X
Pupil mobility	57.1	14.3	40.0	56.0
Training of paraprofessional	28.6	28.6	40.0	24.0

X Indicates group was not asked to rate that item

TABLE V-15

Significant Problems in Organizing and Implementing the SECE Program in Second Grade

Problem Area	Per Cent of Participants Citing Area			
	Principals	Assistant Principals	ECE Coordinators	Classroom Teachers
Classroom and other space	21.4	42.9	80.0	33.3
Class size	28.6	28.6	80.0	19.1
Materials, including audiovisual	28.6	42.9	60.0	38.2
Parent relations	7.1	14.3	20.0	9.5
Community relations		14.3		
Staff relationships	21.4			9.5
Individualization of instruction	X	X	X	38.2
Teacher training (methods)	35.7	14.3		X
Discipline of children	X	X	X	14.3
Teacher training (management and discipline)	35.7	28.6		X
Overemphasis on reading	7.1			4.8
Teacher turnover	14.3		40.0	X
Pupil mobility	57.1	14.3	40.0	47.6
Training of para-professional	28.6	28.6	40.0	28.5

X Group was not asked to rate that item

While differences among personnel on perceptions of problems existed, perhaps reflecting their vantage points or areas of responsibility, some areas of problem tended to be emphasized by more than one group. Pupil mobility, for instance was seen as a significant first grade problem by 57.1 per cent of the principals and 56 per cent of the teachers. Class size was a problem cited by principals, ECE coordinators and teachers. These three groups and assistant principals all stressed the problem of materials, while principals, assistant principals and ECE coordinators found classroom and other space to be a significant problem.

Some data in pupil mobility were collected from a sample of 30 first grade and 24 second grade classes. In the first grades, the teachers reported registers which averaged 25.3 and daily attendance which averaged 22.0. In these classes an average of 8.2 children entered and 7.9 left the class during the school year. In second grades, the class registers averaged 25.9 and daily attendance averaged 22.6. An average of 4.8 children left and 6.6 children entered during the school year. These data point to the realistic basis for concern among personnel who cite children's mobility as a problematic factor in implementing the program.

Pupil mobility, materials, space and class size emerged as problems at the second grade level which were perceived by all four professional groups. While each group didn't necessarily give the same weight to each, their problem areas emerged as those for which concern was shared. Principals and assistant principals expressed concern about teacher training, and were joined by ECE coordinators and teachers in identifying problems in the training of paraprofessionals.

When personnel were asked to select one element which they felt contributed most to the SECE program, interesting differences in perception emerged (Table V-16). Principals, indicated that reduced class size (28.6%) and the additions of ratio teachers (28.6%) and paraprofessionals (21.3%) contributed most to the program. Assistant principals felt that the enthusiasm of the staff (57.1%) contributed most while ECE coordinators didn't concur on a single factor. Teachers indicated that reduced class size (36.5%) and the help of paraprofessionals (33.8%) were the elements which contributed most significantly.

TABLE V-16

Element Which Contributed Most to the SECE Program, as Rated by Personnel

	Per Cent of Participants Citing Element			
Element	Principals	Assistant Principals	ECE Coordinators	Classroom Teachers
Reduced class size	28.6	14.3	10.0	36.5
Assignment of rating teachers	28.6			4.1
Enthusiasm of staff	14.3	57.1	10.0	4.1
Help of para-professional	21.3		10.0	33.8
More and better materials			10.0	8.1
Involvement of parents			10.0	
Assignment of ECE Coordinator			10.0	

In summary, the existing first and second grade program reflects a good deal of effort in executing aspects of the program and some areas of success in providing school experiences which appear positive.

VI. PROGRAM PERSONNEL

The reduction of class size and decrease in pupil-teacher and pupil-adult ratios through the presence of increased personnel has been a major facet of the SECE program. The roles developed by and impact of ECE coordinators, ratio teachers and paraprofessionals, who are unique features of the program, have been examined.

A. Early Childhood Education Coordinator

The position of ECE coordinator was expected to have a significant impact in the implementation of the SECE program. Previous investigations have demonstrated the contribution of coordinators, especially in teacher training, and their value in program operation.

Four of the 14 principals who provided questionnaire responses indicated that they were able to assign a teacher as an ECE Coordinator. Three were rated excellent, and one good on a five point effectiveness scale. Three principals further indicated that the assignment of the coordinator had served to increase the effectiveness of the primary assistant principal. Three assistant principals indicated that their role and the coordinator's had been clearly differentiated, while their own work loads had remained the same or diminished slightly. This suggests the development of supplementary or complimentary roles for those holding the two positions.

The ECE coordinator's role, as described by 5 coordinators, involved some planning for the current year through consulting with early childhood classroom teachers (80%) and consulting with the principal on teacher needs, class organization, etc. (80%). During the school year, the average of the coordinators' weekly time spent on teacher training was 9.8 hours, on administration 11.6 hours, on evaluation 17.5 hours, on conferences with school personnel exclusive of teachers and

paraprofessionals 10.5 hours, and on work with parents 1.6 hours. Among their varied professional activities, the specific tasks which occupied a large portion of their time were: training individual teachers, ordering books and equipment, grouping and regrouping pupils, conferring with assistant principals and holding conferences about individual pupils.

The evidence available at this point suggests the full use of the coordinator position. Since ECE Coordinators are still relatively rare in this district, full evaluation necessarily awaits their greater presence in the program.

B. Ratio or Cluster Teachers

Ratio or cluster teachers provide a professional resource which can be used in a wide variety of ways within the SECE program.

Among ratio teachers reporting on their roles and responsibilities, the following assignments were noted: teaching a first grade class, teaching a second grade class, speech improvement instruction, social studies instruction combined with science or music or library, reading improvement instruction, reading combined with language instruction for non-English speaking children, reading combined with library, and conducting Math laboratory. This sample illustrates the diversity of services provided by ratio teachers. Their assignments most typically bring them into contact with more than one class. They also provide a personnel resource to permit flexibility in meeting unanticipated or emerging needs.

Ratio teachers indicated that they were involved in planning learning activities for children in the classes they served: always for 61.5 per cent of the group reporting usually for 19.2 per cent, occasionally for 7.7 per cent, seldom, 3.8 per cent and never 3.8 per cent. In the majority of cases reported, cooperative planning did take

place.

Ratings of ratio teachers' most helpful contributions in the program by administrators (Table VI-1) reveals that they see their staff members as contributing most toward individualization and enrichment of instruction.

In general, then, it appears that these teachers have been appropriately assigned and are working in ways which contribute to meeting program goals.

TABLE VI-1

Ratio Teachers' Most Helpful Contributions in Program, Rated by Principals, Assistant Principals and ECE Coordinators

	Per Cent of Administrators Citing Aspect		
Program Aspect	Principals	Assistant Principals	Coordinators
Participation in planning	71.4	42.9	40.0
Teaching entire class groups	57.1	28.6	40.0
Assisting in large group activities	42.9	14.3	20.0
Presenting lessons in special content areas	35.7	57.1	40.0
Working with small groups	64.3	71.4	60.0
Working with individual pupils	42.9	42.9	60.0
Orienting new teachers	14.3	28.6	20.0
Helping children to work and play harmoniously		14.3	20.0
Serving as source of affection and comfort to children	21.4		
Preparing instructional materials	21.4	42.9	40.0
Controlling behavior of children	14.3		20.0
Substituting for absent teachers	7.1	14.3	40.0

C. Paraprofessionals

The presence of paraprofessionals, which has become such a prominent feature of the program, has held promise for noteworthy contribution to the achievement of program goals. As reported in the section in Program Implementation, significant numbers of paraprofessionals are at work in the district, nearly all assigned to individual early childhood classes.

No other assigned duty was reported by a large number of paraprofessionals, although other activities of the group were: lunchroom duty, bus and hall duty, helping in school office, and assisting on trips.

The most frequent classroom responsibility which paraprofessionals reported was working with a group of children. They indicated that reading groups were their most frequently assigned small groups. Small group activity dominated descriptions of their classroom work, while the second most frequently reported activity was with individual children. The clear picture which emerges is that of the paraprofessional engaging directly with children in their learning activities, while other tasks were mentioned (e.g. correcting papers, distributing lunch or taking children to lunch, arranging bulletin boards, preparing materials, etc.) these were not prominent among the descriptions given.

The paraprofessionals reported an overwhelming sense that the teacher with whom they worked felt that they had been helpful. The major indication that they had used to judge this was the teachers' appreciative statement to them. "Definitely, she told me I was helpful," and "she said so many times" are illustrations of the feeling projected. This certainly suggests the existence of many good working relationships.

The presence of positive relationships is further supported by observers'ratings. The relationship between teacher and paraprofessional was judged to be friendly, cooperative and confident almost always in 59 per cent and usually so in 41 per cent of the first and second grades observed. Observers also noted that paraprofessionals usually participated actively in children's functioning and learning activities.

Most helpful contributions of paraprofessionals, as perceived by administrators (Table VI-2) emphasizes the significance of their work with small groups and individual children. While different aspects were emphasized by various administrators, the major areas on which they showed agreement were those involving the paraprofessionals' direct work with children. While two groups of teachers differed somewhat in the specifics of their ratings, they concurred on the importance of paraprofessionals' work in childrens' learning activities. They also stressed the paraprofessionals' role in providing a supportive social-emotional climate. Table VI-2 and VI-3 presents these ratings.

TABLE VI-2

Paraprofessionals' Most Helpful Contributions in Program,

Rated by Principals, Assistant Principals, and ECE Coordinators

Program Aspect	Per Cent of Administrators Citing Aspect		
	Principals	Assistant Principals	Coordinators
Participation in planning	28.6		20.0
Assisting in large group activities	35.7	28.6	40.0
Working with small groups	92.9	85.7	100.0
Working with individual pupils	85.7	57.1	100.0
Helping children to work and play harmoniously	50.0	42.9	20.0
Serving as source of affection and comfort to children	42.9	71.4	60.0
Relieving teachers of routines (milk, snack, etc.)	50.0	28.6	20.0
Preparing instructional materials	42.9	28.6	80.0
Making home visits	21.4	14.3	20.0
Arranging or participating in workshops for parents	14.3		
Effecting liaison with community agencies		28.6	
Taking care of supplies and equipment		14.3	20.0

TABLE VI-3

Paraprofessional's Most Helpful Contribution in Program, Rated by Classroom and Ratio Teachers

	Per Cent of Teachers Reporting	
Program Aspect	Classroom Teachers	Ratio Teachers
Participation in planning	18.4	
Teaching entire class groups	5.3	19.0
Assisting in large group activities	57.9	4.8
Presenting lessons in special content areas	10.5	47.6
Working with small groups	86.8	9.5
Working with individual pupils	78.9	66.6
Orienting new teachers	2.6	76.2
Helping children to work and play harmoniously	52.6	
Serving as source of affection and comfort to children	51.3	28.6
Working with N-E children*	21.1	38.1
Relieving teachers of routines (milk, snack, etc.)	30.3	28.6
Keeping records	10.5	38.1
Preparing instructional materials	27.6	4.8
Controlling behavior of children	31.6	14.3
Taking care of supplies and equipment	19.7	38.1
Sustituting for absent teachers	3.9	19.0
Making home visits	10.5	9.5

* Non-English speaking children

In summary, it can be noted that the paraprofessionals' role has been well defined and implemented with emphasis placed on working with small groups and individual children. Their presence and participation contributed to a positive social-emotional climate in classrooms. The paraprofessionals' impact has been clearly felt within the program.

VII. CHILDRENS' PERFORMANCE

Children's increased skills and improved performance on learning tasks were central goals in the SECE program. Assessments of growth in reading readiness and beginning reading have been carried out using standardized measures. Indications of children's cognitive skill levels have been made using teacher observations and ratings. Children's attitudes toward self and school have been judged by their teachers.

A. Achievement Test Data

1. Kindergarten

An average or typical class in schools A, B and C was tested by the observer with the assistance of the classroom staff. If the children had been tested shortly before observation, their scores were obtained. The New York City Prereading Assessment test was used to provide data on children's skills in language and visual discrimination.

Tables VII-1 and VII-2 present the results of the testing of kindergarten children in these schools.

TABLE VII-1

Kindergarten Childrens' Performance in Language on PAT Reported as Number and Percentage in Score Categories

School	Total N	Very Poor (Below 5)		Below Average To Poor (5-23)		High to Low Average (24-77)		Above Average (78-96)		Superior (Above 96)	
		N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
A	18	1	6	4	22	9	50	3	17	1	6
B	18	1	6	7	39	8	44	2	11	0	0
C	10	0	0	1	10	6	60	3	30	0	0
Total	46	2	4.3	12	26.0	23	50.0	8	17.4	1	2.2

TABLE VII-2

Kindergarten Childrens' Performance in Visual Discrimination PAT Reported as Number and Percentage in Score Categories

School	Total N	Very Poor (Below 5)		Below Average To Poor (5-23)		High To Low Average (24-77)		Above Average (78-96)		Superior (Above 96)	
		N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
A	18	0	0	1	6	8	44	8	44	1	6
B	20	1	5	2	10	9	45	8	40	0	0
C	10	0	0	0	0	4	40	6	60	0	0
Total	48	1	2.1	3	6.3	21	43.8	22	45.8	1	2.1

The total kindergarten sample's scores on Language (Table VII-1) reveal that 50 per cent of the group achieved scores within the average range. More children scored in the below average range (26.0%) than in the above average range (17.4%) which depressed the score pattern so that the top 75 per cent of scores includes some in the below average range. One school has 90 per cent of its pupils' scores within or above the average range, while one school has 73 per cent and one 55 per cent of its pupils' scores at that point.

The scores on Visual Discrimination were higher as seen in Table VII-2. The total samples' scores place 91.7 per cent at or above the average range. In all three schools, the criterion of having 75 per cent of the children display normal growth in this phase of reading readiness was surpassed.

2. First Grade

First grade children, enrolled in an average or typical class were tested by the observer with the assistance of the classroom teacher and paraprofessional. Word Knowledge, Word Association and Reading scores on the Metropolitan Achievement Test, Primary I, are reported in Table VII-3 for the total sample of 74 children. At the time of testing, the grade norm was 1.8.

TABLE VII-3

Mean MAT Grade Equivalent Scores in Grade 1 for Total Sample

School	N	Word Knowledge	Word Association	Reading
A	25	1.3	1.2	1.3
B	24	1.5	1.4	1.5
C	25	1.8	1.9	1.6
Totals	74	1.53	1.50	1.47

Scores for the group as a whole were somewhat below average, although considerable variation among schools was noted.

When data are examined for the top 75 per cent of the sample (Table VII-4), the picture is more favorable. One school's scores exceeded the 75 per cent criterion of normal growth in Work Knowledge and Word Association but not in Reading. The generally consistent picture of lower achievement in reading suggests that comprehension skills and concept development are areas which need further emphasis in the total program.

TABLE VII-4

Mean MAT Grade Equivalent Scores in Grade 1 for 75 per cent Criterion Group

School	N	Word Knowledge	Word Association	Reading
A	19	1.4	1.4	1.4
B	18	1.7	1.5	1.7
C	19	2.0	2.0	1.7
Totals	56	1.70	1.64	1.60

3. Second grade

Second grade childrens' Word knowledge and Reading scores on the Metropolitan Achievement Test Upper Primary Level, administered during the city-wide testing program of the Board of Education, were obtained for seven classes in the three schools that served as the samples for intensive study. Scores for this sample of children are shown in Table VII-5. At the time of testing, the grade level norm was 2.7.

TABLE VII-5

Mean MAT Grade Scores Equivalent in Grade 2

For Total Sample

School	N	Word Knowledge	Reading
A	25	2.66	2.54
	25	2.53	2.06
	19	2.34	2.37
B	25	3.28	2.46
C	19	2.45	2.19
	21	2.67	2.30
	23	2.19	1.97
Totals	157	2.61	2.27

The criterion specified in the SECE program goals was that 75 per cent of the children studied would have scores reflecting normal growth on standardized tests. Table VII-6 contains the scores for the top 75 per cent of the sample. It is noteworthy that Word Knowledge scores exceeded Reading scores, and that while Word Knowledge exceeded the criterion established, Reading does not reach it. It seems plausible that this finding reflects the intensive work being done in classes on word analysis skills and phonics.

TABLE VII-6

Mean MAT Grade Equivalent Scores in Grade 2 for 75 per cent Criterion Group

School	N	Word Knowledge	Reading
A	19	2.86	2.65
	19	2.65	2.15
	14	2.51	2.41
B	19	3.64	2.62
C	14	2.71	2.46
	16	2.82	2.51
	17	2.36	2.14
Totals	118	2.82	2.42

4. Third Grade

Concern with the maintenance of gains by children who have been part of the SECE program has been expressed. Scores were obtained for 89 children, in one school, who had been tested on the Metropolitan Achievement Test. These scores (Table VII-7), obtained over an interval of one year, reveal that gains in Word Knowledge have been substantial (1.20) and gains in Reading have been moderate (.70). This further supports the idea that the word analysis approaches and vocabulary building phases of the reading program are producing recognizable gains. These findings raise some question about the relative lack of emphasis on comprehension and concept formation within the program currently.

TABLE VII-7

Gains in MAT Grade Equivalent Scores from Grade 2 (1970) to Grade 3 (1971)

For 89 Children in School B

Sub-Test	Average in Grade 2	Average in Grade 3	Gain
Work Knowledge	2.4	3.6	1.20
Reading	2.5	3.2	.70

B. Cognitive Skills

Teachers were asked to identify the number of children in their classes who could perform specific operations which demonstrate the presence of particular cognitive skills. Their responses were summarized and are presented in Table VII-8. In most skill areas, a clear progression of increasing skill with higher grades is evident.

TABLE VII-8

Cognitive Skills of Children in ECE Classes as Reported by Teachers

Skill	Per Cent of Children Having Skill: Kindergarten Classes (N=29)	Grade 1 Classes (N=30)	Grade 2 Classes (N=24)
Can make accurate observations of physical phenomena	77.6	80.1	80.0
Can describe physical phenomena accurately	69.1	73.4	72.5
Can classify physical properties of phenomena accurately	62.1	66.1	69.9
Can demonstrate how something works	51.3	56.1	60.9
Can explain why something works	45.0	45.3	47.2
Can recall the sequence of an event	65.7	72.9	68.9
Can offer an explanation of an event	58.8	58.4	62.0
Can anticipate the outcome of an event	60.5	61.1	61.8
Can ask questions which show insight into a problem	40.8	45.7	43.6
Can suggest ways of finding answers to a question	39.4	44.9	43.3
Can volunteer alternative answers to a question	42.9	46.4	47.5
Can give reasons why one answer might be more plausible than another	32.3	38.5	38.3
Can support opinion in regard to physical properties of phenomena with facts or illustrations from experience	35.1	41.2	34.5
Experiment purposively with physical and creative materials	52.2	46.9	48.0
Appear to enjoy individual or group problem-solving processes	56.6	63.0	55.7

As a whole, the children were judged to be skillful in observing, describing their observations, classifying properties, recalling sequences and anticipating outcomes, since more than half of the children in the classes sampled could demonstrate these skills.

Skills were less well developed, i.e. present in less than half of the children in the classes, in the areas of asking questions which show insight into problems, suggesting ways to find answers to a question, giving reasons why one answer might be more plausible than another, and supporting opinion of properties of phenomena with facts from experience. These skills are related to divergent thinking and evaluative intellectual operations. A question might be raised about the degree to children are getting opportunities to raise questions as well as to answer questions, to suggest procedures as well as to carry them out, and to consider and evaluate alternative explanations as well as to learn correct responses.

Second grade children were more able to demonstrate how something works and to offer an explanation of an event. First graders were judged to experience a higher degree of improvement in individual and group problem-solving processes than did the other groups. This may be meaningful in relation to childrens' attitudes which are described in the section which follows, and observers' rating reported above.

Kindergarten children were described as more able to experiment purposively with physical and creative materials than were first and second grade children. Since this contradicts the general trends in the data of increasing skills through the grades it raises an interesting point. It's possible that since the structure, materials and opportunities present in kindergarten foster children's purposive explanation, these skills are demonstrably greater at that point in the child's school life.

C. Attitudes Toward Self and School

Teachers were asked to provide ratings for designated children based upon their observations of the individual in a variety settings. Specifically, teachers rated the boy whose name appeared third and the girl whose name appeared fifth on the class register using an 11-point scale, (0-Low to 10- High) to describe the child's attitudes at the beginning and end of the school year. Tables VII-9, 10, and 11 summarize the ratings for each of the three grades. A clear trend toward increasingly positive attitudes toward self and school throughout the school year can be noted in each grade.

TABLE VII-9

Kindergarten

Pupil Attitudes to Self and School

(N=42)

Item	Percentages at Levels START OF YEAR			Percentages at Levels END OF YEAR		
	Low 0-3	Moderate 4-6	High 7-10	Low 0-3	Moderate 4-6	High 7-10
Happy and relaxed	31.0	45.2	23.8	7.1	19.0	73.8
Tries new things	16.6	57.1	26.2	4.8	28.6	66.7
Works independently	16.6	66.7	16.7	7.1	26.2	57.1
Gets along with classmates	14.3	57.1	28.6	9.5	23.8	66.7
Confident in abilities	23.8	54.8	21.4	9.5	23.8	66.7
Care of dress and appearance	2.4	45.2	57.1	4.8	26.2	69.0
Takes pride in work	9.5	54.8	35.7	4.8	26.2	69.0
Friendly and outgoing	21.4	54.8	23.8	11.9	28.6	59.5
Reacts well to frustration	25.0	67.5	7.1	16.7	47.6	30.9
Leadership qualities	33.3	52.4	14.3	19.0	35.7	69.0
Cooperates in working	9.5	64.3	26.2	7.1	28.6	61.9
Accepts criticism	21.4	61.9	16.6	9.5	26.2	64.3
Completes assignments	11.9	54.8	33.3	2.4	28.6	69.0
Attends regularly	11.9	33.3	54.8	2.4	33.3	64.3
Controls behavior	7.1	54.8	38.1	7.1	26.2	66.7
Courteous toward others	4.8	35.7	59.5	9.5	16.7	73.8
Adjusts to limitations	11.9	50.0	38.1	7.1	33.3	59.5
Attentive to class activities	4.8	38.1	45.2	4.8	30.9	64.3
Gains satisfaction from work	7.1	35.7	42.9	2.4	14.3	60.6
Participates in class activities	9.5	45.2	38.1	4.7	16.6	78.6

TABLE VII-10

Grade 1

Pupil Attitudes to Self and School
(N=60)

Item	START OF YEAR Low 0-3	Moderate 4-6	High 7-10	END OF YEAR Low 0-3	Moderate 4-6	High 7-10
Happy and relaxed	21.7	38.3	40.0	10.0	30.0	58.3
Tries new things	28.3	45.0	26.7	11.7	21.7	65.0
Works independently	31.7	43.3	23.3	13.3	26.7	58.3
Gets along with classmates	11.7	40.0	46.7	13.3	23.3	61.7
Confident in abilities	28.3	40.0	30.0	8.3	36.7	53.3
Care of dress and appearance	6.6	20.0	68.3	8.3	16.7	73.3
Takes pride in work	20.0	33.3	43.3	10.0	18.3	68.3
Friendly and outgoing	26.7	31.7	40.0	10.0	30.0	58.3
Reacts well to frustration	31.7	36.7	28.3	18.3	35.0	43.3
Leadership qualities	46.7	33.3	18.3	31.7	36.7	30.0
Cooperates in working	30.0	33.3	35.0	13.3	36.7	46.7
Accepts criticism	15.0	40.0	43.3	10.0	30.0	58.3
Completes Assignments	20.0	30.0	48.3	8.3	21.7	68.3
Attends regularly	11.7	25.0	61.7	3.3	21.7	73.3
Controls behavior	18.3	35.0	45.0	15.0	28.3	55.0
Courteous toward others	15.0	18.3	65.0	8.3	18.3	71.7
Adjusts to limitations	18.3	40.0	40.0	13.3	31.7	53.3
Attentive to class activities	21.9	38.3	38.3	13.3	28.3	56.7
Gains satisfaction from work	25.0	31.7	41.7	10.0	18.3	70.0
Participates in class activities	23.3	41.7	33.3	13.3	30.0	55.0

TABLE VII-11

Grade 2

Pupil Attitudes to Self and School
(N=46)

Item	START OF YEAR Low	Moderate	High	END OF YEAR Low	Moderate	High
Happy and relaxed	17.4	56.5	21.7	2.2	41.3	54.3
Tries new things	26.1	50.0	19.6	4.3	56.5	36.9
Works independently	34.8	39.1	21.7	13.0	47.8	39.1
Gets along with classmates	15.2	30.4	50.0	8.7	30.4	60.9
Confident in abilities	28.3	43.5	23.9	4.3	63.0	32.6
Care of dress and appearance	6.5	32.6	56.5	2.2	36.9	60.9
Takes pride in work	19.6	52.2	23.9	10.9	36.9	52.2
Friendly and outgoing	15.2	56.5	23.9	2.2	36.9	43.5
Reacts well to frustration	19.6	50.0	26.1	4.3	67.4	28.3
Leadership qualities	45.6	41.3	8.7	32.6	50.0	17.4
Cooperates in Working	13.0	58.7	23.9	6.5	50.0	43.5
Accepts criticism	10.9	50.0	34.8	2.2	39.1	58.7
Completes assignments	26.1	30.4	39.1	15.2	30.4	54.3
Attends regularly	15.2	32.6	47.8	6.5	30.4	63.0
Controls behavior	15.2	34.8	45.6	10.9	28.3	60.9
Courteous toward others	10.9	26.1	58.7	4.3	26.1	69.6
Adjusts to limitations	10.9	43.5	41.3	8.7	36.9	54.3
Attentive to class activities	19.6	47.8	28.3	6.5	45.7	47.8
Gains satisfaction from work	13.0	56.5	26.1	6.5	50.0	43.5
Participates in class activities	17.4	52.2	26.1	8.7	43.5	47.8

Table VII-12 which combines each grades' average ratings for each of the items on the scale highlights grade to grade differences. While age and experience related differences clearly contribute to some of the ratings, a general trend of declining attitudes at the grade two level is evident on many items. Second graders, while initially judged quite similar to first graders were judged finally to be less willing to try new things, less able to work independently, less confident in abilities, taking less pride in work, displaying fewer leadership qualities, being less attentive to class activities and gaining less satisfaction from work than first graders. Second graders were judged to be somewhat more controlled in behavior, accepting of criticism, adjusting to limitations and cooperative than first graders, and about the same in qualities of courtesy, friendliness and getting along with classmates than first graders. Second graders emerge from these descriptions as less happy and relaxed at school, and while generally more controlled; less enthusiastic and involved in learning activities. A general moderating effect on behavior seems to be evident here along with decreasing interest and involvement in learning tasks.

TABLE VII-12

Changes in Pupil Attitudes to Self and School, from Start to End of School Year in Kindergarten, Grade 1 and Grade 2 Reported In Percentages

Item	Grade	Start of Year Low	Start of Year Moderate	Start of Year High	End of Year Low	End of Year Moderate	End of Year High
Happy and relaxed	K	31.0	45.2	23.8	7.1	19.0	73.8
	1	21.7	38.0	40.0	10.0	30.0	58.3
	2	17.4	56.5	21.7	2.2	41.3	54.3
Tries new things	K	16.6	57.1	26.2	4.8	28.6	66.7
	1	28.3	45.0	26.7	11.7	21.7	65.0
	2	26.1	50.0	19.6	4.3	56.5	36.9
Works independently	K	16.6	66.7	16.7	7.1	26.2	57.1
	1	31.7	43.3	23.3	13.3	26.7	58.3
	2	34.8	29.1	21.7	13.0	47.8	39.1
Gets along with classmates	K	14.3	57.1	28.6	9.5	23.8	66.7
	1	11.7	40.0	46.7	13.3	23.3	61.7
	2	15.2	30.4	50.0	8.7	30.4	60.9
Confident in abilities	K	23.8	54.8	21.4	9.5	23.8	66.7
	1	28.3	40.0	30.0	8.3	36.7	53.3
	2	28.3	43.5	23.9	4.3	63.0	32.6
Care of dress and appearance	K	2.4	45.8	57.1	4.8	26.2	69.0
	1	6.6	20.0	68.3	8.3	16.7	73.3
	2	6.5	32.6	56.5	2.2	36.9	60.9
Takes pride in work	K	9.5	54.8	35.7	4.8	26.2	69.0
	1	20.0	33.3	43.3	10.0	18.3	68.3
	2	19.6	52.2	23.9	10.9	36.9	52.2
Friendly and outgoing	K	21.4	54.8	23.8	11.9	28.9	59.5
	1	26.7	31.7	40.0	10.0	30.0	58.3
	2	15.2	56.5	23.9	2.2	36.9	43.5
Reacts well to frustration	K	25.0	67.5	7.1	16.9	47.6	30.9
	1	31.7	36.7	28.3	18.3	35.0	43.3
	2	19.6	50.0	26.1	4.3	67.4	28.3
Leadership qualities	K	33.3	52.4	14.3	19.0	35.7	69.0
	1	46.7	33.3	18.3	31.7	36.7	30.0
	2	45.6	41.3	8.7	32.6	50.0	17.4
Cooperates in working	K	9.5	64.3	26.2	7.1	28.6	61.9
	1	30.0	33.3	35.0	13.3	36.7	46.7
	2	13.0	58.7	23.9	6.5	50.0	43.5

TABLE VII-12 (Continued)

Item	Grade	Start of Year Low	Start of Year Moderate	Start of Year High	End of Year Low	End of Year Moderate	End of Year Hi
Accepts criticism	K	21.4	61.9	16.6	9.5	26.2	64
	1	15.0	40.0	43.3	10.0	30.0	58
	2	10.9	50.0	34.8	2.2	39.1	58
Completes assignments	K	11.9	54.8	33.3	2.4	28.6	69
	1	20.0	30.0	48.3	8.3	21.7	68
	2	26.1	30.4	39.1	15.2	30.4	54
Attends regularly	K	11.9	33.3	54.8	2.4	33.3	64
	1	11.7	25.0	61.7	3.3	21.7	73
	2	15.2	32.6	47.8	6.5	30.4	63
Controls behavior	K	7.1	54.8	38.1	7.1	26.2	66
	1	18.3	35.0	45.0	15.0	28.3	55
	2	15.2	34.8	45.6	10.9	28.3	60
Courteous toward others	K	4.8	35.7	59.5	9.5	16.7	73
	1	15.0	18.3	65.0	8.3	18.3	71
	2	10.9	26.1	58.7	4.3	26.1	69
Adjusts to limitations	K	11.9	50.0	38.1	7.1	33.3	59
	1	18.3	40.0	40.0	13.3	31.7	53
	2	10.9	43.5	41.3	8.7	36.9	54
Attentive to class activities	K	4.8	38.1	45.2	4.8	30.9	64
	1	21.9	38.3	38.3	13.3	28.3	56
	2	19.6	47.8	28.3	6.5	45.7	47
Gains satisfaction from work	K	7.1	35.7	42.9	2.4	14.3	60
	1	25.0	31.7	41.7	10.0	18.3	70
	2	13.0	56.5	26.1	6.5	50.0	43
Participates in class activities	K	9.5	45.2	38.1	4.7	16.6	78
	1	23.3	41.7	33.3	13.3	30.0	55
	2	17.4	52.5	26.1	8.7	43.5	47

D. Summary of Performance Data

Briefly, childrens' performance on standardized tests showed higher levels of skill development in word knowledge than in reading in the grades and greater skill in visual discrimination than in language in kindergartens. Cognitive skills show generally steady increases through the grades, but are strong in some while limited in other areas. Attitudes show positive change from the start to the end of the school year, however, this change is less positive in second grade than at the lower levels.

VIII. RECOMMENDATIONS

In the opinion of the evaluation team, the program to Strengthen Early Childhood Education in Poverty Area Schools should be recycled. While there are areas of weakness, the program has made positive contributions to children's education. The discussion and recommendations which follow are directed toward improving those areas of the program whose current effectiveness is questionable.

A. Implementation Phases:

A sense of awareness in carrying out the program in the District emerged from a number of data sources. In some schools, it appeared that staff members were generally aware of the program and recognized and took advantage of the resources it made available. In other schools, staff members seemed unaware of the program and felt that direct benefits had not occured for their classes. This suggests that communication about the program, its objectives and proposed procedures, and current results, needs to be carried out deliberately in all schools in ways which tend to enhance staff knowledge of and commitment to program goals.

Special personnel associated with the program, i.e. ECE Coordinators, ratio teachers and paraprofessionals are currently contributing positively to the program for the most part. However, the need for coordination and integration of the efforts of the total staff became clear. It seems as if many of the pieces for a fully synchronized operation are present but are not yet fully moving together. More than the presence of personnel is needed to yield the desired results.

Additional deliberate and specific staff training needs to take place. Both professional and paraprofessional staff need opportunities to increase their skill levels and to learn to operate more effectively in coordinated efforts. This can probably best be accomplished through

involving all staff levels in planning for workshops and activities that specifically relate to their functions in the program.

Materials appear to be unevenly distributed from grade to grade and school to school. This point warrants some examination so that equitable distributions of resources can be made. Both the quantity and variety of materials appears limited, especially in second grades. Materials and equipment for language arts other than reading and in other content areas need strengthening. In some cases, building security measures need improvement. Several teachers reported that things had been taken from their school this year, leaving them with limited material and equipment.

Parent-school relations need improvement. Conscious deliberate planning is needed to build school attitudes which welcome and involve parents. In those schools which currently have fairly extensive parent programs, personnel also rate the total ECE program as most effective. Programs which emphasize parent-teacher contacts and facilitate and ease communication seem to be most promising. Formal meetings above seem least likely to promote positive school-community relations.

Recommendations:

1. Extend communication within and among schools , focused on the strengthened early childhood education program, to promote knowledge of and commitment to the program's objectives. This communication should take that form which helps each staff member to identify with the total effort and to experience recognition of his contribution to the program.

2. Plan and carry out, on a continuing basis, staff training and development activities which help the staff to coordinate and integrate its efforts and which help the staff to see how to make fuller use of it's talents and resources. Some new classroom procedures need to be instituted to promote growth of children's cognitive skills. Staff planning needs to precede and accompany these efforts.

3. Materials which are appropriate and challenging for children, in sufficient variety and quantity, need to be secured, especially in content areas other than reading.

4. Improved efforts to involve parents in their children's learning need to be carried out. Paraprofessionals and parents may well work with professional staff in planning ways to foster this involvement.

B. The Kindergarten Program

The program generally seems to be functioning on a good, positive level. Language experiences seem to be the strongest part of the program and specific skills are clearly being learned. For example, children's visual discrimination scores are quite high.

To further strengthen the program and enhance growth of cognitive skills and promote concept development the use of content in areas other than reading needs to be expanded. Children, in addition to focusing on teacher directed reading related activities, need to increase their skills in observation, description and classification and to use these experiences as bases for increasing their language facility. At this point, activities which help children to learn to raise and state questions, to develop ideas for procedures and to evaluate outcomes are needed. Structured and sequential activities in content areas need to be increased.

Recommendations:

1. Provision of structured, sequential learning activities in content areas.

2. Further implementation of relevant curriculum bulletin ideas.

C. The First and Second Grade Programs

While much positive activity has been in progress and children are benefiting in many instances, the fact that children's growth is somewhat slower than the criterion of acceptable performance set in the SECE program indicates that much remains to be accomplished. It is not sufficient to repeat essentially more of the same experiences. Qualitatively different learning opportunities are needed in both grades 1 and 2. Grade 2 situations appear to contain even more pressing needs than those of Grade 1.

Children need opportunities to learn in ways which enhance their sense of self, which build upon their curiosity, which engage and involve them. They do not need more "teaching" but rather more structured situations which give them opportunities and challenge them to learn. They need to develop concepts and to build cognitive skills which seem minimally developed at the present time in many of the children. They need more direct experience (things to touch, see, smell, hear, visit, etc.) so that they can verbalize and build concepts using the content of their experiences. Too often, still, the classroom experience is too remote from living,and learning has a rote quality. Structured situations which promote discovery learning in science, for example, would be appropriate and could provide the kinds of learning experiences the children need.

Recommendations:

1. Strengthening of content areas in addition to formal reading to provide specific opportunities for experiences which promote concept development.

2. Planned regularly available opportunities for children to develop through use of those cognitive skills which involve the raising of questions, consideration of alternative explanations for phenomena, evaluation of possible answers to questions and development of means for finding answers.

3. Climate building in classrooms which nurtures children's curiosity and involvement in learning.

FORDHAM UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF EDUCATION
HARRY N. RIVLIN, DEAN

Function No. 77-1-1605

EVALUATION OF TITLE I PROGRAMS

DISTRICT 23, NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION

"THE PARAPROFESSIONAL RESOURCE PROGRAM"

Prepared by

ANTHONY N. BARATTA
Evaluation Director

An evaluation of a New York City school district educational project funded under Title I of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965 (Pl 89-10) performed under contract with the Board of Education of the City of New York for the 1970-1971 school year.

INSTITUTE FOR RESEARCH AND EVALUATION

Publication No. 71-59 June 1971

EVALUATION OF TITLE I PROGRAMS

DISTRICT 23, NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION

"THE PARAPROFESSIONAL RESOURCE PROGRAM"

I. INTRODUCTION

The Paraprofessional Resource Program, as originally planned, had two components: (1) paraprofessional training, and (2) the placing of additional paraprofessionals for small group instruction in selected classes.

1. Paraprofessional Training: A full-time training team consisting of a training coordinator, two teacher trainers and four auxiliary trainers was to be responsible for the training and support of all paraprofessionals in the district schools. Workshops were to be conducted which stressed skill development in all curriculum areas, with special emphases on basic educational skills. Each of the 400 paraprofessionals assigned to classrooms in the district were to attend in-service workshops at least six hours per month.

2. Paraprofessionals for small group instruction: A total of 75 educational assistants or teacher aides were to be placed in selected classes throughout the district to provide necessary individual attention to non-English speaking pupils and to pupils with low reading and mathematics scores.

II. PROGRAM OBJECTIVES

The following program objectives were cited by the District in request for funding that was submitted:

1. To provide suitable training for paraprofessionals at times other than their assigned class time

2. To increase the skills and abilities of paraprofessionals to work with pupils in special small group instruction

3. To increase the proportion of individual and small group instruction in selected classrooms

III. EVALUATION PROCEDURES

In order to determine the extent to which paraprofessionals received adequate training, the following procedures were utilized:

A. Observation of the training program. The evaluation team made a total of 18 visits to the Paraprofessional Training Centers. There were 8 visits to Training Site A in P.S. 332 and 10 visits to Training Site B in P.S. 144. Attention was directed to the scope and sequence of activities, provision for practice, opportunities for questioning, and adaptation to individual differences of paraprofessional trainees.

B. Questionnaires to participating personnel. The paraprofessional trainees were asked to rate their growth as a result of the Paraprofessional Training Program. The areas of their work that were included in this rating were methods, planning, human relations, management and discipline, pupil relationships, professional growth and evaluation. Responses were received from 135 paraprofessionals on the self rating form.

A rating scale was also developed to obtain teacher ratings of the paraprofessional in their classroom relative to the goals that had been defined for the program.

Training Sites

Training Site A was located at P.S. 332. The training facilities included a standard classroom, as well as office space for the training team, equipped with telephone, desks, files and work space for planning purposes.

Training Site B was located for the first several weeks in P.S. 87. The training room was located in a very busy location adjacent to a make-shift corridor. The noise and distraction were not conducive to a good learning environment for training purposes. Late in February, arrangements were made to move to P.S. 144. The principal of P.S. 144 was very cooperative in making arrangements for the training site room and office. At the present time, the Site B training site facilities are adequate.

Paraprofessional Trainees.

The paraprofessional training program for about 450 paraprofessionals began in mid-January, and accommodated the following five separate groups of trainees:

Group I Educational Assistants, 0-2 years experience

Group II Educational Assistants, 3 yrs. experience and Junior High School paraprofessionals

Group III Educational Assistants, Career Ladder Program

Group IV Educational Assistants, Career Opportunities Program

Group V Family Assistants, Family Workers, Teacher Aides-Pre-K

In general, the recently appointed paraprofessionals had little previous training, while those in the Career Ladder Program had several years of experience, as well as some college education.

Responses were received from 61 teachers who had paraprofessionals assigned to their classrooms. The rating scale included the areas of methods, planning, human relations, individual help, supervisor, management and discipline, positive attitudes and professional growth, problems, needs of pupils, resource person, and special help in reading and mathematics.

Interviews. Interviews were conducted with the Paraprofessional Resource Program Coordinator. One interview was held at the beginning of the program; the second, toward the end of the school year.

Interviews were also conducted with members of the training staff and several principals and teachers.

Observation visits to schools. The evaluation team made observational visits to P.S. 73, P.S. 156, P.S. 165, P.S. 137, J.H.S. 263, P.S. 327 and P.S. 332.

IV. PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION

Staff. The Coordinator for the Paraprofessional Resource Program in District 23 has had a strong and extensive background in the training of paraprofessionals. As coordinator, she bore the major responsibility for planning, implementing, coordinating, and supervising the operation of the training program. At each of the two sites at which the program operated, she was assisted by a Teacher Trainer and two paraprofessionals who served as Auxiliary Trainers. Both trainers had had extensive classroom teaching experience. The auxiliary trainers had also had extensive experience as paraprofessionals; they made a substantial contribution to the work of the training teams.

Schedule.

A comprehensive training schedule was developed at both Training Sites. The schedule provided for bi-monthly training sessions for Group I, the Educational Assistants with 0-2 years experience, and for Group II, Educational Assistants with 3 years experience. Monthly meetings were scheduled for Group III, the Educational Assistants Career Ladder Program, for Group IV, the Educational Assistants Career Opportunities Program, and for Group V, Family Assistants, Workers, Teacher Aides and Pre-K.

Training sessions encompassed the entire day on Tuesday and Thursday and a morning session on Friday. For example, the schedule for Training Site A was as follows: Tuesday: Group I, January 19, February 2 and 16, March 2nd, 16th, and 30th, April 27, May 11th and 25 and June 8th and 22nd. Paraprofessionals from schools 41, 150, 156, 175, 184, 284, 298 and 327 were scheduled for an A.M. Session and those from 183, 332, 125 and 396 were scheduled for a P.M. Session. At Site B, Group I was scheduled on January 25, February 9 and 23, March 9 and 23, April 6 and 20, May 4 and 18 and June 1 and 15.

The evaluation team noted that the schedule was carried out as arranged with the exception of one or two days when emergencies arose.

The Training Program

The Paraprofessional Training Program included a variety of subjects and activities. The development of relevant experiences for five different levels of so large a group of paraprofessionals in a training program called for considerable planning by the training staff.

The aims of the Training Program, defined in conferences by the coordinator and the training staff, were very clearly stated:

1. To upgrade the skills of paraprofessionals in communication

2. To increase understanding of the primary curriculum areas in the elementary school especially in the language arts and reading

3. To increase understanding of paraprofessionals of effective techniques of working with children

4. To upgrade paraprofessionals skills in small group instruction

5. To increase understanding of the many aspects of the school program

6. To provide assistance in their paraprofessional work through practice sessions

7. To utilize varying approaches in instructional patterns such as discussion, oral contributions, role-playing, round robin discussions, and use of audio visual methods

Table I provides data about the nature and scope of the training curriculum and activities. The number of sessions was determined through content analysis of the records kept in the training sites and in the office of the Paraprofessional coordinator. The number indicates the frequency of sessions in both training sites for 10 different groups of trainees. During a typical training session of approximately two hours, several different activities were scheduled.

Guest Speakers

During the course of the training program guest speakers were invited to participate in the program at both Site A and Site B. These guest speakers presented information about such subjects as mathematics, bi-lingual education, African-American History, Guidance, Working with non-English speaking children, working with children in early childhood grades, narcotics, and the police department.

Curriculum Development

A substantial amount of time was allocated to the important areas of language arts. The training staff utilized the technique of story-telling in a unique manner. First, there was the aim of improving skills of paraprofessionals in this language arts area, and secondly, this technique was utilized to develop public oral communications skills on the part of the trainees.

TABLE I

PARAPROFESSIONAL TRAINING CENTERS PROGRAM AND FREQUENCY OF SESSIONS

Activity-Subjects	Sessions
Language Arts	
Manuscript	4
Storytelling techniques	8
Listening	2
Oral Communications techniques	3
Language Arts Manual	2
Handwriting	3
Vocabulary	3
Grammar	4
Louie Book technique	3
Math-Guest Lecturer	3
Cuisinaire rods	1
Bi-lingual Education - Guest lecturer	8
African American History - Guest lecturer	5
Child Relationships - Guidance Specialists	8
Working with Non-English Speaking Child	7
Working with Children in Early Childhood Grades (Early Childhood Supervisor, Guest lecturer)	6
Narcotics - Guest lecturer	2
Police Department - Guest lecturer	1
Games in elementary school	4
Orientation sessions	10
Other Activities	
Lesson plans	5
Cumulative folders	4
Anecdotal records	3
Overhead Projector demonstration	5
Bulletin board suggestions	5
Job charts	3
Role playing experiences	10
Small groups techniques	10
Assignments	20
Art Projects	4
Evaluation sessions	10

Orientation sessions. With a program as large and new as the Paraprofessional Resource Program a great deal of information must be transmitted to the paraprofessional. This phase of the training program was conducted mainly by the Coordinator, and the trainers at the two sites. These sessions dealth with such information as attendance, enrollment in college training programs, payroll matters, suggestions to promote harmonious relationships with pupils, teachers, and supervisors, etc..

Clinic sessions. Throughout the training program there were opportunities for the paraprofessionals to discuss problems in their work. Opportunities were provided to obtain participant reactions; suggestions concerning possible courses of action were discussed.

Evaluation sessions. Interspersed throughout the schedule were opportunities for paraprofessionals to discuss the role of the training sessions as well as comments about the strengths and weaknesses of the activities in which they had been engaged. The training staff conducted these sessions at a high level. The training staffs reported that they utilized these suggestions to improve and help organize the ensuing program.

Small group sessions. The training staff at both Sites included three persons, the trainer and two assistant trainers. Frequently, after the main presentation of the subject, the group was sub-divided and each member of the staff conducted small group sessions.

Visitation Component. A systematic arrangement of visitations was organized by the training teams at both sites. Visits were made to

P.S. 150, 298, 275, 263 and 184 by the training team at Site A up to April 20, 1971. Visits were made to P.S. 87, 144, 144A, 73, 137A, 178, 155 and I.S. 55 by the training team of Site B also up through the period of April 26, 1971. This component continued throughout the entire period from January, 1971 through June, 1971.

The visit to a school included a conference with the principal and his staff member who was directly in charge of the paraprofessional program. This conference provided the training team with an opportunity to explain the aims and procedures of the Paraprofessional Training Program, and to resolve any individual problems that had arisen. When necessary, adjustments in training schedules to avoid interference with organized programs in the school were made. The field visits also served the purpose of assisting the training team to understand the needs of the paraprofessionals through first hand experience in the field thus enabling the trainers to make the training program more practical and relevant.

The training teams observed classrooms where the paraprofessionals were assigned to determine what utilization was made of program training. Assistance was provided to the paraprofessionals in a form of a follow-up conference after the visit.

Paraprofessionals for Small Group Instruction

A total of 75 educational assistants or teacher aides were placed in selected classes throughout the district to provide necessary individual attention to non-English speaking pupils and to pupils with low reading and mathematics scores. The program coordinator indicated that this phase of the paraprofessional resource program was integrated in the program as a whole.

The net effect of this staffing for special assistance to pupils with low reading and mathematics scores as well as for non-English speaking pupils was to emphasize small group instruction for all paraprofessionals. Special attention for the non-English speaking child was given in the training sessions where the units on techniques in bilingual education were stressed.

Observations were made by the evaluation team in twenty-five classrooms where paraprofessionals were working. In the largest percentage of these classes, the evaluation team observed some phase of small group instruction in the areas specified.

Training Staff District Conferences

Conferences called by the Paraprofessional Coordinator were conducted regularly on a bi-monthly schedule. The purpose of these district meetings was to discuss curriculum development, administrative matters and other problems related to the program. As a result of these conferences, schedules were modified, a training site was changed, and program modifications were made.

The most fundamental modification was the attention given to small group and individualized instructional techniques. Another modification was provision for an increased number of guest speakers, in order to provide the paraprofessional participants with an opportunity for noting different points of view, and to reduce the amount of repetition in program materials.

V. PROGRAM EFFECTIVENESS

Observation and Evaluation of the Training Program

The evaluation team made 18 observations of the program at the two training sites. The evaluation of the training program took the form of ratings made by the evaluators regarding the program, and ratings assigned by the trainees about the training program.

Table 2 summarizes the overall ratings assigned by the evaluation team to the training program at both sites. Ratings of "good" or higher were assigned to 76.7 per cent of the aspects rated in the training program. On a weighted scale of 5 to 1, with 5 for "excellent," 4 for "very good," 3 for "good," 2 for "fair" and 1 for "unsatisfactory," the overall weighted evaluation of the program was 3.2 which would indicate that the total program was judged a bit better than "good."

TABLE 2

RATINGS ASSIGNED TO PARAPROFESSIONAL TRAINING ACTIVITIES BY 15 EVALUATORS (IN PER CENT)

Aspects Rated:	Excellent %	Very Good %	Good %	Fair %	Unsatisfactory %	*Mean Weighted Value
Scope of Program	6.7	26.7	40.0	26.7		3.1
Sequence of Program	13.3	20.0	40.0	26.7		3.2
Adaptation to Individual Needs of Trainees	13.3	33.3	33.3	20.0		3.4
Training Methods	20.0	13.3	40.0	20.0	6.7	3.2
Demonstrations	20.0	33.3	26.7	13.3	6.7	3.5
Follow-up Activities	20.0	20.0	40.0	13.3	6.7	3.3
Mean	15.6	24.4	36.7	20.0	3.3	3.3

* Weighted values computed according to a scale of 5 for excellent, 4 for very good, 3 for good, 2 for fair and 1 for unsatisfactory.

Recommendations Offered by the Paraprofessionals

Recommendations concerning changes in the program were also obtained from 135 paraprofessionals. In general, the respondents noted that the workshop approach to training was excellent, but a number of persons asked that a definite period of time be set aside for straight lectures, and that simulation of classroom situations be utilized as a training approach. It was suggested, too, that each paraprofessional give a demonstration lesson during the training period, to be discussed by her peers and the training staff.

Several suggestions dealt with the quality of the training program. Many of the paraprofessionals with considerable experience asked that the training program be more rigorous. Some felt, too, that discussion should be more directed, and that the discussion leader should stay as close to the thread or purpose of the lesson as possible.

Some suggestions were also made in the area of curriculum. It was felt that more attention should be given to work in language arts. It should be noted, however, that this area received the greatest amount of attention during the course of the program.

Ratings Assigned by Teachers to Paraprofessional Competence

Ratings from 61 teachers who had paraprofessionals assigned to their classrooms were sought concerning the competency of their paraprofessionals. The data are summarized in Table 4.

The teachers were asked to rate the competency of the paraprofessionals in eleven areas: methods, planning, human relations, individual help, supervisor, management and discipline, positive attitudes and professional growth, problems, needs of pupils, resource person, and special help in math and reading. This information was obtained through a questionnaire.

Ratings assigned by the evaluator were much the same in each area of the program to which attention was directed. The quality of the demonstrations provided by the trainers was rated most highly.

Ratings Assigned by Paraprofessionals to the Training Program

Information was obtained from 135 paraprofessionals through interviews and questionnaires regarding the training program. Table 3 summarizes paraprofessional ratings regarding the training programs at both Sites A and B. They were asked to evaluate the quality of the training program in seven areas: methods, planning, human relations, management and discipline, pupil relationships, professional growth and evaluation.

TABLE 3

RATINGS ASSIGNED BY 135 PARAPROFESSIONALS TO

THE TRAINING PROGRAM (IN PER CENT)

Aspects rated:	Excel-lent	Very Good	Good	Fair	Unsatis-factory	No Response	*Mean Weighted Value
Methods	14.8	22.2	41.4	19.3		3.22	3.3
Planning	6.7	22.2	42.2	23.7	2.22	2.97	3.1
Human Relations	29.7	28.2	34.9	5.9		1.48	3.8
Management and Discipline	14.8	30.4	39.3	14.1		1.48	3.5
Pupil Relationships	23.7	31.9	36.4	6.7		1.48	3.7
Professional Growth	15.6	37.1	32.7	11.9		1.48	3.5
Evaluation	15.6	30.4	43.0	9.7		2.97	3.5
Mean	17.3	28.9	38.6	13.0	0.3	2.0	3.6

* Weight values computed according to a scale of 5 for excellent, 4 for very good, 3 for good, 2 for fair and 1 for unsatisfactory.

In general, the paraprofessionals assigned ratings of "good" or higher to the various aspects of the training program in which they had participated. The most favorable ratings were assigned in the area of Human Relations the value of the training program in helping them to get along with parents, community, colleagues, and supervisors and in Pupil Relationships (the value of the program in helping them to understand children, build pupil confidence and build pupil trust).

In a sense, while these ratings directed the paraprofessionals to consider the adequacy of the training program in which they had participated, the ratings assigned may also be considered indicative of the paraprofessionals' estimate of their competence. Viewed in this light, it is interesting to note that the lowest ratings were assigned to the general categories of Methods and Planning. Evidently, the paraprofessionals were less sure of their competence in these areas than in the others. The high ratings in Human Relations and Pupil Relationships also merits comment. Members of the evaluation team were impressed by the competence of the paraprofessionals in these areas. While it is true that the program placed great stress upon training in relationships, the evaluation team noted that the paraprofessional brought to her task a strong concern for children and for a strong commitment building stronger bonds between the school and the community to begin with. The program succeeded in giving the paraprofessional techniques that would serve as a means of implementing their concern.

It was also observed that, more and more, the paraprofessionals are coming to look upon themselves as participants in a program that calls for special skills, and that they were aware of their growth in this respect while in the training program. In interviews, many of the paraprofessionals, particularly those with several years of ex-

perience, suggested that the training program be more rigorous and demanding. This recommendation can only be looked upon as a manifestation of their professional growth.

Strengths of the Paraprofessional Training, as Viewed by Paraprofessionals

The paraprofessionals were invited to indicate what they considered the major strengths of the training program. This information was obtained through interviews at the training centers and through the questionnaire.

As one would expect, the catalogue of strengths that were identified was long and varied. The workshop format with its open discussion of problems and the assistance afforded in coping with problems in the classroom was looked upon as a major strength by many participants. The focus upon pupil relationships was also considered an important positive element: "the program helped me understand and deal with children;" "it helps us learn how to motivate children;" "it helps us be more objective in relation to both parents and children."

The longer scope of the program, as compared to the relatively narrow training in a single school was also noted as a major strength: "I find out what is going on throughout the school system, and I can bring this back to my school;" "I am able to see things in a more professional manner."

The development of close relationships with peers was also cited as an asset of the program. There were many comments, too, about the values of the program in developing insights into specific curriculum areas - reading, language arts, story-telling, arts and crafts, mathematics, African-American history, Puerto Rican culture.

Weaknesses of the Training Program, as viewed by Paraprofessionals

The paraprofessionals were also requested to indicate what they considered the major weaknesses of the training program. Some comments indicated that curriculum areas should be expanded, particulary more arts and crafts, reading, and language arts. Many paraprofessionals commented that greater attention should be given to problems on the junior high school level. It should be noted, however, that the junior high contingent was small. While a major shift in that direction should not be contemplated, some special attention to the needs of this group should be programmed in a future year.

A large number of the observations made by the paraprofessionals dealt with the amount of time devoted to training. It was noted that some paraprofessionals received no training; others felt that the training period should reflect individual needs. It was felt that, for paraprofessionals with considerable training, the program might be less extensive, and the time thus saved given to persons with less training.

The paraprofessionals, too, tended to be highly self-critical. They complained that some of their colleagues disturbed the group by arriving at sessions late, that some monopolized the discussion, that some were dilatory about getting down to work, and that some tried to turn every meeting into a "gripe" session.

The observer noted that these sources of complaints were less in evidence during the latter part of the training program.

TABLE 4

RATINGS ASSIGNED BY 61 TEACHERS TO PARAPROFESSIONAL COMPETENCE (IN PER CENT)

Aspects Rated:	Excel-lent	Very Good	Good	Fair	Unsatis-factory	Mean Weighted Value
Methods	27.9	31.2	32.8	4.9	1.6	3.7
Planning	27.9	36.1	27.9	3.3	3.3	3.8
Human Relations	44.3	32.8	19.7	3.3		4.2
Individual Help	39.3	34.4	19.7		3.3	4.1
Supervision	32.8	29.5	21.3	11.5		3.9
Management and Discipline	31.2	29.5	26.2	11.5		3.8
Attitudes and Professional Growth	39.3	36.1	24.6			4.1
Problems	26.2	27.9	34.4			3.8
Needs of Pupils	31.2	26.2	34.4	8.2		3.8
Resource Person	19.7	24.6	37.7	11.5	3.3	3.6
Reading and Math	31.2	23.0	34.4	3.3	3.3	3.8
	31.9	30.1	28.5	5.1	1.4	3.8

In general, the ratings assigned by the teachers to their paraprofessionals was very high, particularly in the area of Human Relations, Ability to give Individual Help, and Attitudes and Professional Growth.

These ratings of the competency of the paraprofessionals constitute an indication of the high respect and esteem that is accorded the paraprofessionals by the teachers, with whom they work. Within a relatively short period of time, the paraprofessional is regarded as a welcomed and much sought after colleague; when the program first began there was much resistance on the part of the teachers toward having paraprofessionals in their rooms. This high value given to the work of paraprofessionals is an outgrowth of in-district training, some college training and much, much teacher training. It is impossible to determine which has the greatest impact, it is all needed.

Effectiveness of the Visitation Component

The evaluation of the effectiveness of the visitation component was determined through interviews with the training teams, several principals, and a sample of paraprofessionals.

The training teams indicated that their purpose in observing classrooms was to assist the paraprofessionals in their own schools. One trainer noted, "We have been observing classrooms where the team teaching approach is or should be in progress. In most schools, the paraprofessionals are an integrated part of the program and are used to their full potential. Most of the paraprofessionals in these schools are content with their role in the classroom and are dedicated."

In the reports made by the training teams to the program coordinator, it was indicated that there are isolated cases of general lack of a cooperative attitude on the part of the paraprofessionals toward the classroom teacher. In instances where this problem was noted, the trainer had a conference with the paraprofessional. When this did not help, the program coordinator was asked to confer with the paraprofessional. If no improvement was noted, the paraprofessional was removed from the position.

Reports by the visiting trainers revealed that the majority of the family assistants and family workers played an important part in the program. They organized parent workshops, arranged meetings with guest speakers, arranged trips, located and used various facilities in the community and were actively engaged as liaison between the parents and the schools. In some situations, however, these workers were allowing themselves to be used by their supervisors for clerical and classroom routines.

The majority of the administrators in the district are enthusiastic and appreciative of the value of the paraprofessionals in the classrooms and in the various special programs in the schools. The training teams have noted through their observations, conferences with paraprofessionals, and conferences with teachers and supervisors that the administrators of a few schools were not as cooperative as deemed necessary to conduct a successful inservice training program. This fact was corroborated by the evaluation team.

Members of the evaluation team noted a substantial qualitative improvement in the latter half of the training program at both Sites A and B. This was due, in part, to the greater contact with paraprofessionals in their home schools. This dimension of the Paraprofessional Resource Program was considered as successfully promoting the overall goal of providing a more practical and relevant program.

Effectiveness of Small Group Instruction

Members of the evaluation team conducted 25 observations to obtain data concerning the effectiveness of the small group instruction provided for children with low scores in reading and mathematics, and for non-English speaking children. The type of work done by the paraprofessional may be seen in the following examples:

Grade 1 - Small group in reading. Paraprofessional reviewing new words of the week. Each child reads word, uses it in sentence.

Grade 1 - Small group in reading. One-half of group participating, others far removed from what is going on. Good carry-over from previous day. One-to-one approach by paraprofessional; too little attention to other children. Encourages child on individual basis.

Grade 2 - Small group in mathematics. Assigns Computation problems, goes over work with children. Helps child as problems arise. Good encouragement of slow learner.

Kindergarten - Small group, learning colors. Good atmosphere in class, due in part to work of paraprofessional. Very dependent on teacher, needs detailed instruction.

Grade 3 - Working with two pupils in mathematics. Not well organized, but excellent rapport. Good use of praise. Good relation of work to everyday situations.

Grade 3 - Paraprofessional helping non-English speaking boy complete his spelling lesson. Works with him for a few minutes and then moves to another child. Explains what should be done in Spanish.

Grade 4 - Paraprofessional working with one student in word study, using phonics cards. This is a very good drill.

Kindergarten - Paraprofessional helping with exercises in learning days of the week. Then takes small group for story-telling. Good rapport with children. They are enthusiastic.

Grade 2 - Two paraprofessionals in the room. One conducts drill in mathematics with five children. All children are intent on the work. Work is well prepared. The other is working on spelling drill. Good phonetic sounding; every child actively participating and responding.

Kindergarten - Art Project for Easter. Class very well managed and children are busy at work. Lesson was planned with paraprofessional, very well conducted.

Of the 25 situations observed by the members of the evaluation team in which the paraprofessional was working with small groups, ratings of "good" or higher were assigned in 20 (80%) instances.

This program is just beginning, with continued training, this approach should constitute a major element in the effectiveness of the program.

VI. RECOMMENDATIONS

The Paraprofessional Resource Program in District 23 provides a highly essential service for the paraprofessionals in the District schools. It should be retained in its present form and function. The following suggestions are advanced for consideration:

1. The Paraprofessional training component of the Paraprofessional Resource Program should be given the primary task of providing a full orientation program for all beginning paraprofessionals at whatever time they are employed. It is strongly recommended that no new paraprofessional be allowed to begin work in a classroom without a minimum of 10 hours of orientation. It is suggested that this orientation phase be conducted during the days that the training sites do not have regularly scheduled sessions.

2. The orientation phase for the new paraprofessionals should become a primary responsibility of one member of the training staff. If the 1971-1972 training staff continues to consist of the several auxiliary

trainers who have had ample experience as paraprofessionals and as trainers, one of these auxiliary trainers should be given this responsibility. This person should also follow the same training technique of inviting the team of trainers to provide specialized assistance where needed.

3. It is generally assumed that the orientation program should be scheduled at the beginning of the school year. However, during 1970-1971, the Paraprofessional Training Program did not begin until January, 1971. In addition, a large number of new paraprofessionals were hired in April. In such instances, the Community Superintendent and the Local School Board should provide the necessary support to the Paraprofessional Resource Program and particularly to the training component for at least a minimal orientation program.

4. The training teams presently consist of one coordinator, two trainers and four auxiliary trainers. It is recommended that a redeployment of staff personnel be considered during some phases of the training programs. When a guest speaker is present, three persons on the training staff are members of the audience. In many cases this is necessary, particularly where there is follow-up in small groups. However, in other instances, the time of some of the members of the training staff may be given to other activities.

5. It is apparent that increasing attention is being given to training the paraprofessional in individualization of instruction. In many training sessions devoted to this topic, the larger group was divided into sub-groups which were lead by the auxiliary trainers. This is a trend that should be continued and expanded.

6. It is recommended that there be differentiation of goals in the training program. While there are some common goals for all para-

professionals in the areas of human relations, colleague relations, supervisor relations, child relations, there are more specialized goals for the educational assistants at various levels, as well as for the family assistants and teacher aides. Therefore, it is suggested that, for the beginning educational assistants, there be a concentration on becoming more efficient in the various routines as outlined in the job description. For the more experienced educational assistants, particularly those in the Career Ladder Program, there should be greater emphasis on more advanced work.

7. An advisory committee for the paraprofessional training program should be formed to guide and support the district's paraprofessional training program. The advisory committee should be composed of representatives from the teachers, supervisors, District office and Community Board.

8. The program of field visits and follow-up by the training teams be continued as they operated during this current year.

9. The Coordinator of the Paraprofessional Training Program should attend District supervisory meetings for mutual consideration of problems related to the training program.

10. The training staff should institute a direct system of getting feedback from the teachers regarding the effectiveness of the training of the paraprofessional.

FORDHAM UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF EDUCATION
HARRY N. RIVLIN, DEAN

Function No. 77-1-1606

EVALUATION OF ESEA TITLE I PROGRAMS

DISTRICT 23, NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION

"TEACHER TRAINING PROGRAM"

Prepared by

JOSEPH F. X. McCARTHY
Evaluation Director

An evaluation of a New York City school district educational project funded under Title I of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965 (Pl 89-10) performed under contract with the Board of Education of the City of New York for the 1970-1971 school year.

INSTITUTE FOR RESEARCH AND EVALUATION

JOSEPH JUSTMAN, DIRECTOR

Publication No. 71-60 June, 1971

EVALUATION OF ESEA TITLE I PROGRAMS

DISTRICT 23, NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION

"TEACHER TRAINING PROGRAM"

I. INTRODUCTION

The influx of large numbers of inexperienced teachers into the schools of District 23, New York City Board of Education, presented a major problem in the development of programs in the schools of the district. It was estimated that 573 teachers in the District during the school year 1970-1971 were "inexperienced" - that is, were serving with less than one full year's experience. These inexperienced teachers were spread among the schools unevenly, with the intermediate and junior high schools employing the largest number of such teachers, and the largest proportion of inexperienced teachers to total staff. A large number of the inexperienced teachers had completed some teacher training work in the colleges they had attended, but the training these teachers had had in collegiate studies did not provide a homogeneous background against which teacher training could progress at the District level.

The schools of District 23 include many with extremely challenging educational problems. The experience level of principals and assistants to principals serving in the district varies widely, but many supervisory personnel in the district's schools have relatively brief experience in school supervision; most supervisory personnel are heavily concerned with curriculum development work, especially involving themselves with input from the community for curriculum development purposes. Indeed, the proper and effective interrelationship of schools and community is a dominant factor in the District 23 picture.

The present project was proposed to provide special assistance to beginning teachers assigned to the schools of District 23. Ordinarily, such assistance would be made available within the normal scope of school operations and services. However, the very large numbers of inexperienced teachers, and the unusual stress on curriculum innovation and development combined to limit the assistance that could be provided for beginning teachers in the District. The proposal to deploy experienced teachers as Teacher Trainers sought to provide inexperienced teachers with resource persons who could show them techniques, assist them in analyzing classroom problems, and help them on a basis of equals in the school's organizational pattern.

The original project proposal called for the assignment of eighteen (18) experienced classroom teachers to serve as Teacher Trainers in sixteen schools in District 23. It was projected that more than one Trainer would be assigned to the intermediate and junior high schools with the highest proportion of inexperienced teachers (JHS 263, and IS 271). The proposal outlined the following scope:

> The teacher trainers' duties will include necessary and effective support for beginning and inexperienced teachers serving in schools, and supplement the on-going teacher training program in the school. The teacher trainer will focus the training program on the problems of the beginning and inexperienced teacher, namely: (a) planning, (b)class and classroom routines, (c) class management, (d) relationships with parents, (e) pupil adjustment (the exceptional pupil, meeting the different needs of the individual children), (f) developing teaching skill, (g) group activities, (i) development of instructional materials, (j) organization, (k) teacher self-evaluation. It is anticipated that each teacher trainer (master teacher) will work with a revolving group of nine to ten new and inexperienced teachers at their assigned school, and provide support to others on a referral basis.

This rather extensive direction for the teacher trainers was incorporated to provide for all foreseen problems, and provided a very wide scope within which the teacher trainers were expected to function. The ESEA Title I project was drawn up, specifically, as a supplement to existing patterns of supervision and the improvement of instruction in the schools. It was stated specifically, too, that the "teacher trainer will work under the supervision of the principal at the school to which he is assigned."

The project included in its scope the provision of an After School Workshop program for new teachers, and major emphasis on parent and paraprofessional involvement in the training program.

II. PROGRAM OBJECTIVES

The objective of the program, stated simply, was to improve the effectiveness of beginning teachers, both as individuals and as members of teacher-paraprofessional teams.

III. EVALUATION PROCEDURES

A series of visits was conducted to selected schools in the District, in which individuals connected with the program were interviewed. School supervisors, teacher trainers, and beginning teachers were interviewed both in their schools and in other places, to assess the impact of the program. The District Coordinator of Teacher Trainers provided a great deal of information about the organization and operation of the project at the District level. The evaluator took part as an observer in one of the monthly conferences of teacher trainers, and examined a number of logs maintained by the trainers as records of their work.

At first it was hoped to conduct an analysis of individual beginning teacher's work, to determine the effectiveness of the teacher trainer's assistance. It appeared, however, after two pilot attempts, that such an effort would be unlikely to yeild reliable evidence, although it would perhaps provide evidence which would appear more valid than in fact it was: far too many extraneous elements were at work on beginning teachers to isolate the influence of the teacher trainer from the complex of influences brought to bear on beginning teachers. These include the teacher's own contribution to his growth, and the work of the school supervisors assigned to assist or direct teacher work.

IV. PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION

The Teacher Training program was carried out by eighteen (18) trainers selected from among the staffs of their respective schools, for work with the newest members of the school staffs. One District Coordinator was assigned to manage the program from the District Office. Although the original proposal envisioned two such Coordinators, the proposal was approved in terms of eighteen Teacher Trainers and One Coordinator. In fact, then, the program was fully staffed.

Teacher Trainers indeed represented a highly trained and fully experienced group of faculty members. These trainers themselves showed a certain amount of mobility, however, and there were changes in compostion of the group during the year the program operated. The personnel were assigned on the nominations of their principals, and were relieved of classroom teaching assignments in their schools. The Teacher Trainers, however, remained within their original schools and continued to be

regarded as members of the school organization, despite their status as Title I personnel. This arrangement made it more acceptable to principals to name highly competent classroom teachers for work outside their normal classrooms; all the principals interviewed indicated that they would not have been prepared to give up the teachers designated as Teacher Trainers from their regular organizations. The Teacher Trainers themselves indicated that they would wish to remain with their organizations.

In one instance, a teacher trainer was assigned to serve two school organizations (P.S. 87 and P.S. 125 Brooklyn). Two teacher trainers were assigned to Junior High School 263, and two were assigned to Intermediate School 271, Brooklyn. The remaining schools in the project designated one teacher trainer each; these schools were:

Intermediate School 55-K

Junior High School 275-K

Elementary Schools: 73-K 178-K

137-K 183-K

144-K 184-K

150-K 284-K

155-K 298-K

The Teacher Training Program in operation limited itself to the work of the school day and the normal after-school faculty conference and training periods required and approved under union contract provisions. Thus, one element in the original proposal was changed; only school day hours were used for training. There was, however, very strong evidence of after-school preparation and planning of lesson activities;

in three cases individual beginning teachers indicated that three different teacher trainers had provided assistance for them in lesson planning in their homes; in another case, a beginning teacher and a teacher trainer shared in a carpool, and the beginning teacher indicated that assistance was extended beyond, and before, school hours.

There was limited development of the objective of training teacher-paraprofessional teams through this project. This development arose in those situations where the beginning teachers were assigned as members of such teams, but the primary focus of teacher trainers' attention was to the teacher members of the teams. In view of the large number of trainees, it seemed more suitable for the trainers to devote their attention to the less experienced teachers, rather than attempting to work with fewer inexperienced teachers and more paraprofessionals. The study and development of teamwork, however, was a major thread in the work done by several of the trainers; in situations where inexperienced teachers were teamed with paraprofessionals, training was provided for both members of the team. However, this element was in fact a somewhat less emphasized part of the program.

The kinds of work undertaken by the Teacher Trainers were many and varied. Most of the elements listed above, as projected by the proposal, were in fact handled by virtually all of the Teacher Trainers. Typical activities included assistance in lesson planning; giving of demonstration lessons on particular skills or topics; assistance in creating attractive bulletin board displays; assistance in grouping children for small group activities and studies; assistance in developing and directing

individual testing and individual learning situations; reporting and sharing information with parents; questionning techniques; preparing classroom testing materials; interpreting standardized test results; developing social skills among children. Virtually the entire range of teacher-improvement techniques was included, with great emphasis on the "how-to" practical assistance that one practicing professional can provide to a beginning colleague.

In some instances, other techniques were developed. Some of the Teacher Trainers taught their colleagues how to conduct television lessons; others emphasized special approaches to classroom interaction analysis; in one instance sociogram techniques were discussed (it is possible that this was done in several, but only one instance was identified positively); the guidance functions of the classroom teacher were attended to by several trainers. Attention to audio-visual techniques and equipment was not so heavily emphasized, but was a major theme with two trainers; study of the community in which the schools are located was recommended and directed by several of the trainers.

In implementing this program, two problems appeared which gave cause for some concern. It developed very early in the program that the assignment as Teacher Trainer attracted an aura of special status within the faculties of the schools affected. This special assignment carried implicit recognition of the trainer as a "master teacher," and it resulted in an "out-of-class" assignment for the trainer; this combination aroused certain inter-personal problems in some cases among faculty colleagues. There does not appear to have been any instance in which principals or acting principals named individuals to the assignment simply

because of longevity; however, there was a certain amoung of carping from faculty members who were not chosen, and comments that the trainers were selected simply for length of service, and not for special teaching abilities. While this does not conform to the observations of the evaluator, it constituted a problem in the implementation of the program which was extraneous to the program itself.

A second problem in implementation arose in the area of the relationship between Teacher Trainers and school supervisors. This too, arose not because of the nature of the program so much as because of differing interpretations and understandings of the work of the trainers. Because of the extreme pressures under which supervisors work, there were occasions when improvement of inexperienced teachers' work was not so thoroughly planned between Trainers and Supervisors as might have been best; as a result, some trainers and supervisors differed about the effectiveness of the training work. It appeared to the evaluator that these instances were relatively few, and again arose not from the nature of the project but from conditions outside it.

The implementation of the Teacher Training program did not reach every inexperienced teacher in the schools, although trainers did in fact come in contact with every inexperienced teacher in their own building. The constant turnover in several buildings, and the setting of priorities for work in each organization, made it impossible for the trainers to have maximum effect on each new teacher. As a matter of fact, the program was extended, in some respects, to include service to several teachers with more than one year of service, but whose techniques and skills indicated a need for help; in several schools, individual teachers

connection with the study indicated that their evaluation of progress by the beginning teachers was markedly assisted by the Teacher Trainers. One head of school expressed reservations about the operation of the trainer in his school, and one expressed the highest possible regard for the program and the opinion that the beginning teachers were assisted immeasureably by the trainer. Balancing these two extremes against each other, the consensus of the supervisors rated the effectiveness at least "good" due in part to the Teacher Trainers' work. "In part" is only a fair comment on the situation; so many factors were at work in the District this year that it seemed impossible to identify the effect of the Teacher Trainers and to isolate it from other influences, both positive and negative.

D. The beginning teachers themselves who were contacted in the course of the evaluation indicated a very high opinion of the value of the teacher training program for their adjustment to school, and for their progress in the opening months of their professional careers. This opinion was expressed by all the beginning teachers contacted.

E. The evaluator's judgment is that the program was successful, and that the services of the Teacher Trainers provided not only the technical skills in which beginning teachers were lacking, but a very much more important personal ingredient which was not stated in the program objectives. These trainers provided the young teachers with contact with an experienced, friendly, and helpful contact and human resource. The trainers provided an example of accomplishment and professional approach which was impressive not only to the young teachers but to the evaluator as well; it seemed an intangible but extremely valuable con-

tribution to the professional development of the young and inexperienced teachers, and the performance as well as the attitude of these Teacher Trainers combine to merit the application of a word too often used just as a cliche: dedication.

In general, therefore, the evaluation of this program is that it was a quality program of high value. Its values, however, must be recognized as uneven and, although substantial, only beginning to bear the fruit that they should produce in the future. The trainers set out to help inexperienced teachers maintain themselves in classroom work; this they accomplished with a good degree of success. In some instances, it was possible to move beyond this "survival" assistance to the level of inspiring imaginative and effective activity beyond the level of a survivor in teaching. It seems that the trainers and trainees might well proceed to a next step in the future; the opportunity to develop higher professional skills, and to develop innovative curricular materials for and with young teachers is a present challenge.

The major stengths observed in this program lie in the availability of skilled classroom teachers to serve with inexperienced teachers in helping start professional careers in a positive and confident manner. The strength is in the area of personnel; the individuals selected seemed to be men and women of considerable skill in teaching, and of high skills in interpersonal relations. One of the principal strengths of the program lies in the fact that without it tremendous amounts of professional help would not- could not- have been deployed to help beginning teachers serve satisfactorily the children of the district. Given the facts of rapid teacher turnover and heavy drains on supervisory time, this program

offered a great resource for introducing and developing young teachers in the service of the district. The program's effect on morale, especially on the morale of the beginning teachers, must be cited as its great strength, too.

One of the major shortcomings of the program is related to its very reason for existence: the large number of inexperienced teachers in the schools. Some of these could not be effectively assisted within the limits of time available. Others, perhaps only a trifle more seasoned, lacked the assistance of trainers. The probability is that the services of the teacher trainers would be valuable on a much more extended basis than it has been begun, and that with an extension, a certain amount of trainer specialization may be developed.

Another problem lies in the nature of the "Teacher Trainer" position. Within the New York City school system, the term "supervisor" carries with it certain special overtones of rank, pay, and background. As the evaluator pointed out in The New York Supervisor (Spring 1969) Teacher Trainers are in fact at work "improving instruction" - which is a rather good definition of "supervision." Teacher trainers in this project, like those in other districts and schools, serve to improve instruction under the direction of their school principals and assistants. There is a grey area of indefinate authority in the operation of Teacher Trainers in District 23 or any other district. It is the area in which a teacher trainer serves to identify and eliminate teacher problems beyond the specific items identified by the administrator-supervisors assigned to a school. It appears to the evaluator that such action is normal, expected, and inevitable; however, it is an important problem for the trainers, the administrators-supervisors of the schools, and the teachers being assisted.

V. RECOMMENDATIONS

1. The first and firmest recommendation of the evaluator is that this program be continued. The major problem facing many schools is the suitable development of beginning teachers; without such development, the children must inevitably suffer from unimaginative and ineffective instruction; the community and parents must inevitably suffer frustration as their children flounder with inept instruction. There seems no likelihood that sufficient supervisory time will be available in the next school year, from those in administrative assignments, to insure the development and progress of beginning teachers and those with somewhat lengthier experience. The perceptions of all participants in the program indicate that teacher trainers are a helpful and effective assistance for beginning teachers. Therefore, it is recommended that the program be continued for the coming year, with the objective of reducing the overall ratio of trainers to trainees to about 1:15.

2. A suitable focus for attention by trainers and trainees for the next year of operation would be the problem of joint training of teachers and paraprofessionals. Experience in other instances indicates that such cooperative learning is far more effective than individual groups of one category; teachers and paraprofessionals often train each other, and the possibilities of a joint training for teams that will serve together as a regular feature of a district's operation seem especially attractive. It is therefore recommended that the district consider setting up such a joint training program, including not only the beginning or less experienced teachers, but also the beginning or even the experienced paraprofessionals with whom these teachers will be working. It

appears that this promises not only an effect on teacher and paraprofessional skill development, but offers a good opportunity to develop community ties for the teachers being trained, and an opportunity to develop team spirit among the individuals so assigned.

3. The proposal for an extension of the program should include recommendation that the services of teacher trainers be made available on a regular basis to teachers with modest experience. The operation of the project in 1970-1971 included some service to teachers other than the beginners mentioned in the proposal. This fact represents a value in the program, but it should be covered in the proposal for continuance.

4. The program evaluated here has operated with "borrowed" space in the schools of the district, and out of a desk at District headquarters. It seems evident that the district meetings of the trainers could benefit from a single "home base"; it seems evident, too, that the development of curriculum materials for use in the district's programs for beginning teachers would be more easily and more effectively accomplished in a curriculum center designed to serve District 23. Such a center could be located in non-school space, but it seems evidently a need of the district, and specifically something that could multiply considerably the effectiveness of teacher training. It is therefore recommended that a suitable space for a curriculum laboratory or curriculum development room be located and provided for the professional staff of the District, and specifically for the staff of the Teacher Training program.

5. The possibility of developing skills in using photography and videotaping should be investigated. The individual teacher trainers and trainers often handled lessons and demonstrations which could have a wider application than the individual classroom in which the demonstra-

tion was performed. Videotaping might be explored as a means of recording such techniques, and the materials could well be replayed both as a means of teacher self-evaluation, and as a means of explaining and showing techniques to parents and other community figures interested in the on-going programs of the schools.

For many of the tasks undertaken by the Teacher Trainers, micro-teaching appears to be a suitable and well demonstrated method of training. The technological resources available today ought to be employed to improve the scope and effectiveness with which the trainers operate with their trainees. It is recommended, therefore, that in a continuation of the program, the proposal should include provision for training in micro-teaching, and in videotaping of classroom activities; training in use of photographic and audio recording of community and classroom activities should also be provided. It might be wise to include provision of a seminar for the trainers prior to their use of these techniques for training young teachers.

6. Specific training in human relations skills, and in recognizing supportive behavior and signs of acceptance and non-acceptance seems to be a very valuable item in the training of young teachers. Evidence of an experimental study conducted by David Berenson in a teacher-training institution indicates that specific training in these skills carries over to a remarkable degreee into direct classroom performance apparently unrelated to the skills as such. It is recommended, therefore, that the teacher training program incorporate specific and systematic training in human relations skills; this training could well be provided in collaboration with parents and paraprofessionals in the schools.

FORDHAM UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF EDUCATION
HARRY N. RIVLIN, DEAN

Function No. 77-1-1607

EVALUATION OF ESEA TITLE I PROGRAMS

DISTRICT 23, NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION

"SPECIAL LIBRARY DEMONSTRATION PROGRAM"

Prepared by

CAROLYN N. HEDLEY
Evaluation Director

An evaluation of a New York City school district educational project funded under Title I of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965 (Pl 89-10) performed under contract with the Board of Education of the City of New York for the 1970-1971 school year.

INSTITUTE FOR RESEARCH AND EVALUATION

JOSEPH JUSTMAN, DIRECTOR

Publication No. 71-63 June, 1971

EVALUATION OF ESEA TITLE I PROGRAMS

DISTRICT 23, NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION

"SPECIAL LIBRARY DEMONSTRATION PROGRAM"

I. INTRODUCTION

The Special Library Demonstration Program in District 23, has two aspects. One is an in-school program which provides 23 educational assistants to all the schools of District 23, except P.S. 144, to support the school library and its services to the school; in the second aspect of the program, a central library center is provided where one teacher, two paraprofessionals and one program assistant provide services to the schools in terms of training, materials, field trips, audio-visual aids and other extended library programs to the schools.

The following excerpts from the request for funding describe the program:

In-School Program

"Twenty-three.....educational assistants, will be assigned, 1 each, to the 23 schools in the district where they will work under the supervision of the school librarian. Their duties will be to assist the librarian with the classes aiding individual or small groups to use the library, helping children in the use of audio-visual materials, telling stories, providing for classroom libraries.

"In addition, she will help the librarian in the organization of the library such as book processing and circulation of the books to pupils.

"The library educational assistants will indirectly reach all of the children in the schools (22,654). However, in each school there will be one special library demonstration class of 30 pupils. Intense service will be provided for 270 children in the early elementary level, 360 later elementary and 60 children in secondary."

The director of the program further spelled out the duties of the paraprofessional staff by circulating a description of the specific Educational Assistant career ladder duties.

The Central Library Program

"A central library will be open from 9 A.M. to 5 P.M. and available to all pupils and faculty in the district. It is located temporarily in Hut 11 at 2205 Dean Street. As soon as permanent quarters are remodeled, it will be transferred to a more central location at 321 Rockaway Avenue.

"One teacher and one parent program assistant who will work under the supervision of the library coordinator will be assigned to this program. The teacher will be responsible for all activities: multimedia programs, cultural activities as well as the normal duties in library work. She will be assisted by two educational assistants. In order to provided for a wide variety of after-school programs for the pupils, teachers and parents hours are budgeted for teachers to conduct workshops and special classes.

II. EVALUATION PROCEDURES

To ascertain the degree to which the program was being implemented as described above, observers, using a prepared observational schedule, visited 20 of the 23 schools in District 23. Nearly all the schools

were visited at least twice. In addition, five visits were paid to the Library Center itself and several meetings of the librarians were attended by observers. The program at the center was observed as were the programs in each of the 20 schools visited. Observers were sent out in pairs, but each handled their observation schedule separately to develop reliability in reporting. In addition to the observation schedule used to evaluate library activities, prepared schedules were used in interviews with the principal, the librarian, and the library assistant in each school. Each member of the professional staff in the library was interviewed, but on a less formal basis.

III. PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION

The In-School Program

As a preface to discussion of the implementation of the program, it should be noted that District 23 is a newly created district, comprised of the former Ocean Hill-Brownsville District, part of District 17, and part of District 18. The fact that all of the schools have been broken away from their former roots and former administration and that the block of schools from each of the districts had great loyalties to their former alliance has had a very pronounced effect on the program. This factor of forming new allegiances and relationships made for great variation in the quality of program implementation, depending on how well personnel were able to adapt to a changing perspective. Moreover, the program must be viewed as one in a transitional stage in the Brooklyn area; there was a great deal of difference in the implementation of the program depending upon the time of the year that observations took place. At the beginning of the observations in January and February, there was a lack of communication, and misunderstand-

ings occurred. In May and June when some of the personnel understood their roles more clearly, there was a great improvement in the program and a much greater implementation of it.

To give an overview of the program, each school visited will be discussed, but the actual school designations will not be given.

School A. An excellent program was in progress from the very beginning. Though the librarian was on leave, everyone in the program including the aide, and the replacement librarian was trained and knew what to do. The children were active and happy in the library. The program was well-organized; there was quantity and quality of books; the children were well-supervised and given much guidance in the use of the library. The children were highly motivated by the aide who came from the community and knew the children.

School B. In this school, housed in a very old building, the library was drab and small. Books were not in good order, but were stacked all over desks and chairs or were in careless array on the shelves. The librarian stated that the paraprofessional was not always there (she was not there on the days the library was visited) due to the fact that she had to attend many community meetings, participating in her role of parent in the school. The paraprofessional program in this school was not effective, and the program reflected this.

School C. In this school, there was great difficulty in attaining permission to visit the library. With each visit, (three persons in all attempted to visit the library) the observers were detained and queried as to their role, even though they produced identification. In all cases, in this school, the librarian, the principal, and the teacher aide were markedly uncooperative when an observation was attempted. In

one case, the interviewer was not allowed into the library. This continual harassment made evaluation impossible.

School D. This school had a very unique program. The library was part of an open corridor experiment, with an open corridor and visitation library program. Both the librarian and her aide were very enthusiastic and the children were eager for more library experience.

Many experimental programs were offered. In addition to the open corridor program, there were many displays in the library on Puerto Rico as well as famous blacks. The children were creating displays utilizing dolls and puppets. There were many special alcoves for studying and project work, as well as small group meetings. The librarians were obviously child-oriented in their desire to sell the library and books to children. This was an outstanding program.

School E. The library in this school was functioning well, although the school had lost its librarian (due to the fact that she had become an assistant principal). The new librarian had taken over without difficulty; the assistant also adjusted to the program quickly. By the end of the semester, the school library, which was doing a good job from the beginning, had succeeded in building sound communication with the community. One of the drawbacks in this situation was that a renovation program that was taking place disrupted the school and the use of library facilities.

School F. The school itself was probably more than 100 years old, but the library was cheerful with a good supply of audio-visual aids and software as well. The librarian was well organized and had an effective circulation routine worked out. The aide was familiar with the tasks listed in the career ladder duties for Educational Assistants. The

library had a display on the museum visit and other displays in evidence which aided self-image and the ecology program. One interesting facet of the program was the fact that the librarian had attended the school when she was a child and was familiar with the history of the area. The school library was well stocked, and the library class program was being augmented.

School G. This school library was outstandingly well stocked, with many books, audio-visual aids and software. All personnel were working exceptionally hard for the welfare of the youngsters. Inasmuch as this was a More Effective School, there were a great many special services for these children; this showed in the library program. Both the aide and the librarian had been in the school for a number of years, and showed excellent command of their tasks, and worked well together. Again, communication improved so much over the semester, that the program was working much more smoothly near its termination than in the beginning stages. The interest of both librarians in the program was manifest in the fact that they had brought so many of their own materials and supplies to the facility. There were book and magazine displays, which were unique. Moreover, the administration of the school was very library-oriented and had contributed many materials to the collection in the library. Classes were orderly and well-trained in the use of these facilities and materials.

School H. The library aide in this school has been out this semester due to a personal tragedy. The program itself worked well; when the aide was present, she was outstanding. Until the death of her young daughter this year, she was an outstanding worker who kept the library beautifully and related well to the children, who looked forward

to coming to the library just to see her. Again, there were magazine displays and a display on Martin Luther King. The library was on the fourth floor which did not add to its accessibility; indeed the fourth floor libraries seem to have a logistics problem. Children and teachers simply do not like to climb all of those stairs and they are used far less than a second floor facility.

School I. This library was in utter chaos, due to the fact that it was being moved to the floor above. The aide was holding down the operation while the workers were in the facility. The librarian himself was functioning as a cluster teacher. Children were not permitted in the library, and the aide really did not know what to do about operation of the library. She had not been there very long and had had almost no supervision, though she appeared to be a very willing worker and tried to be helpful.

School J. The library in this school was functioning well in spite of the very old facility in which it was housed. The librarian was experienced and ran a marvelous audio-visual program. The aide, who has been out due to an accident, was well trained and the librarian, who percieved the aide's ability in art, had allowed her to arrange displays and art work in the entire library. She was also highly aware of the nature of her duties. The librarian related very well to the children and had gathered poetry and stories from them. He, too, had been with the school for a number of years, knew the community well and took a very concerned, personal interest in the children who came there. Moreover, he worked well and easily with his aide and thus gave her confidence in the job she was doing.

School K. This school had a very unique library program with two rooms functioning as the library, one of which served for circulation and the other one of which served as a reference room and an audio-visual and program room. The special classes were instructed in this room. Morale was excellent and the children were genuinely excited about the program. In this school, there were two librarians, both of whom purchased special material for the children from their own resources. They had developed a paperback collection in this manner. Moreover, they had developed an audio-visual program which augmented the reading program in a very well-planned and cohesive effort. The children were enraptured and very orderly, since coming to the library was a highlight of the week.

School L. In this school the library was a heavily scheduled facility. Children even came in during their lunch. Books were neatly kept and an audio-visual program was in progress. The children in the school had provided the displays for the library. There was a heavy emphasis on Black Studies in this school, although many of the youngsters in the neighborhood were of Spanish surname and there was a great deal of Spanish spoken. The aide in this program had a good attendance record. There were many relevant displays here - one on the rights of man, another on animals, another on Black heroes, and a display on Puerto Rican interests. The librarian was very enthusiastic about the program and the aide, whom he found a great help with slow youngsters and discipline problems.

School M. This program was functioning in a fairly new school. However, the librarian had been ill for several months and the aide, though faithful in attendance, was really not functioning in the library. In effect, the library was not functioning. At the beginning of the term, a pro-

gram of sorts had been begun, but not continued.

School N. The program in this school was functioning well. The aide knew her duties and was aware of the special classes which she was to help. This program emphasized Black Studies. The library was well organized, quite structured and seemed to be heavily used by the students. The aide in the program said that she was contributing quite a few of her own books to the program. She said further that next year she hoped to do more basic reading instruction. In short, she showed a great deal of initiative.

School O. This school exhibited a fine atmosphere for learning. Many experimental programs were in evidence. The library did not seem to be participating in these programs, however. The aide had brought some materials, which were sorely needed in this new school which had not yet received its full quota of books and materials. In this school, the aide was absent very frequently. It was difficult to assess this program; children were not in evidence, there were few books and supplies, the aide did not seem to know her duties because of frequent absence. The librarian who appeared to be anxious and competent had difficulty running a program with these handicaps to overcome.

School P. This school was new and housed a very lovely library. The students were viewing a puppet show with a record player for background during one visit. The children actually cried when they had to return to class. They obviously loved the library and were very reluctant to leave this very heavily used library. The aide here was very active in the program. She said that she would much rather come to school, than to stay at home. This was one of the most outstanding and varied programs visited.

I.S. School A. In this ultra-modern school there were two aides and two librarians. The atmosphere in the library was relaxed and busy. Children were free to come and go and to check out books. The aides knew their duties well and seemed to need little assistance from the head librarians. The children were accustomed to using the library. When the program began in this school, the library had very heavy schedule for classes to attend, but during the latter part of the program, a flexible scheduling scheme was inaugurated. The librarian here expressed the hope that she would be able to set up satellite libraries which would function in the halls and the classrooms. The special class concept did not seem to function very well at the intermediate school, however.

I.S. School B. This is a new Intermediate School. The library is a quiet and well organized facility. However it contained only approximately one-fourth of the books necessary for a school with a population of 1700. The library functions very well, and the aides and student help are contributers to this smooth functioning; absences are not frequent. The displays and activities in the library make it seem a haven. However, the librarians had a difficult time getting the junior high level youngsters to attend. The students are quite "turned off" by any aspect of school. They frequently distress the assistants in the library. However, the program is well-planned, but the reading ability is so varied at this level, that it is difficult to have sufficient materials for the students.

School J.H.S. A. At the beginning of this program, the principal had used the money for the library aide to hire guards for the school. Toward the end of the semester, the aide was returned to his library position.

Although this was a relatively new school, morale was low (as it was in most of the intermediate and junior high schools). Teachers and librarians did not feel safe in their facilities unless the door was locked. As a result, the library was not easily accessible to children. Moreover, there was a shortage of staff to serve the youngsters. Many books and supplies were stolen. (This is true in all of the Junior High School and Intermediate School Libraries.) The students used the library during the home room periods, but the teachers did not always return for the youngsters on time. There was resistance on the part of the librarian to having the library used as a "dumping ground" for students during prep periods, but this frequently happened. Due to the shortage of staff and the fact that they were poorly trained, sections of the library were in poor order. This quality improved over the semester, however.

School J.H.S. B. The library was very short on help; and only one librarian was in attendance. The assistant was very effective in the library program; she handled the paperback collection and did a great deal with circulation and retrieval of books as well as cataloguing. The educational assistant also had excellent rapport with the children.

The Central Library Program

Inasmuch as this school district has received national attention, it would not be out of place to note the problems confronting the District Librarian and her staff. As part of a community school program set up in the Ocean Hill-Demonstration District, the District Librarian and her staff are hold-overs from a regime which is no longer in evidence. She and her staff have had a very difficult time integrating the three school districts which now comprise District 23. The district has been beset with unsettling community problems and managerial

problems. New alliances are being formed and the whole community is in a state of transition. In the face of such difficulties, the District Librarian and her staff have been beset by some almost insurmantable problems. This group should be commended and encouraged; they need support and a respite from political activity.

The observers, in an attempt to observe what was happening in these dimensions visited the Central Library Center five times. It became apparent as the semester moved along that not only was the staff doing their best to move the program along and to communicate with the personnel in the schools, but that the school personnel, librarians and aides alike, were seeking to become more supportive of the functions of the library center. One function of the Central Library Center was a trip made by children in all elementary schools to the Brooklyn Museum with all of the fascinating ethnic and community displays of artists and craftsmen and composers. Finally, on June 2, 1971, a hugh library festival was held at Hut 11 and all the schools participated in this effort. It was a very fitting culmination to the District program.

IV. PROGRAM EFFECTIVENESS

One must conclude that the Library Demonstration Project is functioning very well at the present time, although there were some growing pains at its inauguration due to shifts in organization and management and the fact that a new district had been created in an area where some turbulence had occurred. The schools themselves, and the libraries in particular with all of their manifest problems, take on an aura of relative calm.

In spite of these difficulties, observation of the program in action indicates the following:

- One elementary school with a truly outstanding program
- Nine elementary schools with very good programs and aide participation
- Two elementary schools which were functioning quite well
- Three elementary schools with very poor programs and high absence rates among the personnel
- Two junior or intermediate high school programs that were outstanding
- Two junior high or intermediate school programs that were very poor, largely because of morale factors in the total school situation. In both instances, some improvement was shown by the end of the school year.
- One library demonstration center that had made a valiant effort to implement a program in a very difficult reorganizational transition.

Observation was not conducted in three elementary schools participating in the program; in a fourth, an opportunity to observe was denied the members of the evaluation team.

V. RECOMMENDATIONS

There are still problems in the Library Demonstration Program, in spite of the fact that many difficulties have been resolved by the library personnel. In the light of a positive reaction to the program in general, the following recommendations are made for consideration by the District:

1. A major effort must be maintained to improve communication among all personnel participating in the program. Continued effort must be maintained to accomplish the objectives of the library program for the entire district.

2. The concept of demonstration classes might be re-examined, especially for the junior high schools and for those elementary schools where the library personnel are not well acquainted with the tasks of the basic library program.

3. A still greater effort must be made to obtain and distribute supplies, including books and audio-visual aids. Moreover, a security system must be developed so that supplies will not be stolen from the premises of the participating schools.

4. Although there are only a few schools that are not functioning well, personnel practices in these schools should be examined. If the aides funded by this program are excessively absent, they should be discharged. Should there be friction between a librarian and members of his or her staff, then transfers within the school should be arranged.

5. An effort to obtain books with wider ethnic appeal should be made. Most schools in the program have many materials for ethnic studies, but these materials seem to focus on the needs and aspirations of the black community. An effort should be made to purchase books and materials representing other ethnic groups (such as the Puerto Ricans and other Spanish-speaking groups) which comprised nearly half the school population.

6. A training program, with very specific behavioral objectives for the inexperienced aides who are new to the library program should be developed.

7. The concept of having two librarians in an elementary school, where one librarian and a well-trained aide would do as well, should be rethought. Some of the junior high schools with very large populations have but one librarian; redistribution of staff should be considered.

FORDHAM UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF EDUCATION
HARRY N. RIVLIN, DEAN

Function No. 77-11609

EVALUATION OF ESEA TITLE I PROGRAMS

DISTRICT 23, NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION

"BILINGUAL PROGRAM IN SCHOOL AND COMMUNITY RELATIONS"

Prepared by

JESSE H. BACHER
Research Associate

and

PAULA BACHER
Research Technician

An evaluation of a New York City school district educational project funded under Title I of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965 (Pl 89-10) performed under contract with the Board of Education of the City of New York for the 1970-1971 school year.

INSTITUTE FOR RESEARCH AND EVALUATION

JOSEPH JUSTMAN, DIRECTOR

Publication No.: 71-45

June 1971

EVALUATION OF ESEA TITLE I PROGRAMS

DISTRICT 23, NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION

"BILINGUAL PROGRAM IN SCHOOL AND COMMUNITY RELATIONS"

I. INTRODUCTION

As originally conceived, this program had two facets, and was to make use of the seven Bilingual Teachers who were to be assigned in rather different ways. One Bilingual Teacher was to be assigned to the District office to assist the District Coordinator of Bilingual Programs. Under the direction of the Coordinator, she was to prepare curricular materials and instruments especially designed for the non-English speaking pupils in the District, and was to assist in the training of Bilingual Teachers and of the other teachers involved with large numbers of non-English speaking pupils.

The other teachers were to be assigned, one to each of six schools, as Bilingual Teachers of School and Community Relations. These teachers were to aid teachers, pupils, parents, and members of the community through utilization of their bilingual and bicultural knowledge and skills. In each school, these Bilingual Teachers were to be used when and where needed to assist in any aspect of the guidance of the pupil throughout his educational career.

This major objective of the program, as stated in the request for funding submitted by the District, was to involve parents of non-English speaking and bilingual pupils in such activities as school programs, conferences, parent meetings, pupil guidance, etc., in a meaningful way.

II. EVALUATION OBJECTIVES AND PROCEDURES

In the light of the program objective stated above, this evaluation study was directed primarily to a consideration of the functioning of the six Bilingual Teachers of School and Community Relations. In order to determine the effectiveness of these Bilingual Teachers, the following approaches were utilized:

1. Observation of the program - each of the six Bilingual teachers were observed as they functioned in school, in their contact with students, teachers, administrators, and parents. In addition, they were accompanied on their visits to community agencies and homes of pupils. A training session conducted by the District Coordinator was also observed.

2. Interviews were held with the Bilingual Teachers, principals of the schools to which these teachers were assigned, with the District Coordinator of the program.

3. Questionnaires concerning educational background, previous employment, nature of activities in and out of the school, and reactions to the program were completed by each of the Bilingual Teachers. The District Coordinator also completed a questionnaire covering much the same ground.

III. PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION

Six Bilingual Teachers in School and Community Relations were assigned to the six schools originally designated. Five of these teachers served during the course of the year; one of the original group was replaced early in the school year when it was found that he could not function satisfactorily without constant supervision.

His replacement was more able to implement the objectives of the program. One Bilingual Teacher was assigned to the office of the District Coordinator of the program.

Facilities for the Bilingual Teachers varied from school to school. In three schools, adequate office space was provided, and privacy was assured. However, in the other schools which were more cramped for space, the Bilingual Teacher worked out of a mimeograph room, or in a room that was being modernized. Indeed, in one school, the Bilingual Teacher had no fixed location, and worked wherever space was available. The space problem in these schools made it virtually impossible to set up private conferences between the Bilingual Teacher, pupils, and parents.

Telephone facilities also created a problem. In some instances, the Bilingual Teacher had to be called to a telephone which was located in a distant office. At times, he was forced to limit the calls he could make to community agencies or parents because of the great demands for use of the telephone by other school personnel.

In all schools where the Bilingual Teacher had a base from which to work, there was ample storage space for materials acquired through the District Coordinator, or for those made by the teacher. However, insufficient materials were available to those Bilingual Teachers who were doing academic remediation with non-English speaking children, despite the fact that school materials were cheerfully loaned or given to them for use by pupils in most of the schools.

The original conception of the role of the Bilingual Teacher was not realized in all cases, due in part to the lack of adequate orientation, and in part to the limited amount of time available to undertake the many-faceted duties of the position. For example, in one school, the activities of the Bilingual Teacher were limited; in this instance, the principal felt that the teacher should serve in the school and not outside of it.

District-wide activities tended to take precedence over the individual work being conducted in any one school. For example, several weeks were spent in preparation for a District-wide program on Pan American Day to be held in April, 1971. This involved devoting considerable time to preparation of flags of Pan American nations, charts, and posters, all of which were to be used in the culminating program of festivities. Much of this art work could have been prepared by students or in parent work shops that would have involved them in school activities. Time spent on this program detracted from work with individual pupils and parents as well as from visits to community agencies.

Activities engaged in by the Bilingual Teachers were varied and encompassed several different areas of endeavour: a) conferences with non-English speaking parents and teachers relative to individual students; b) conferences with parents relative to their children's health needs and school attendance; c) conferences with teachers working with non-English speaking pupils in their classes; d) supervising clubs and language classes during and after the school day; e) visits to community agencies (such as the Puerto Rican Education Association, a community organization that works closely with the Bilingual Teacher on school and community relations) f) visits to the neighborhood health center check progress of children previously referred; g) visits to newly arrived families to welcome them and their children to school; h) individual and group remedial work with non-English speaking students; i) cooperative work with the school guidance counselor regarding children with problems.

IV. PROGRAM EFFECTIVENESS

While the activities described above may be considered typical of the work the Bilingual Teacher was called upon to do, it must be noted that the effectiveness of the program in a given school depended, in large measure, upon the individual effort, creativity and initiative of the Bilingual Teacher involved in implementing the program and integrating it into the total school program. In the judgment of the evaluators, only two of the six Bilingual Teachers could be considered to have been highly successful in attaining the objectives of the program. To be sure, the activities of the other four Bilingual Teachers were not unproductive; however, the two more effective teachers were more receptive to the problems of the non-English speaking, and more particularly to the problems of the Puerto Rican non-English speaking parent, as they related to coping with an unfamiliar environment.

It is of interest, at this point, to consider the background and experience of the six Bilingual Teachers operating in the program. These data are summarized in Table I.

TABLE I

BACKGROUND OF BILINGUAL TEACHERS IN SCHOOL AND COMMUNITY RELATIONS

Teacher	Birthplace	Education	School	Previous Employment
A	Puerto Rico	B.A., Education	Univ. of Puerto Rico	None
B	Puerto Rico	B.A., Education and Social Work	Univ. of Puerto Rico	Teacher, Social Work
C	Cuba	B.A., Education	Havana U.	Teacher
D	Cuba	B.A., Education	Havana U.	Teacher
E	Cuba	B.A., Education	Merry College (USA)	Teacher
F	Spain	B.A., Education, Social Work	Seminaire, Tayrac, France	Teacher, Social Work

As can be seen in Table I, only two of the six Bilingual Teachers assigned to the schools were natives of Puerto Rico and had a knowledge of the pressures and problems of the Puerto Rican child and parent in the community at large. It is interesting to note that these two people also lived within the community or very near to it as opposed to their peers who resided some distance from their schools. It was felt too, that place of birth also played a part in the work of the Bilingual Teacher insofar as identification with the Puerto Rican non-English speaking population was concerned. In all cases where the Bilingual Teacher was not a native Puerto Rican, there appeared to be some difficulty in acceptance of the Puerto Rican student and parent as a peer. In those instances where non-Puerto Rican Bilingual Teachers were observed as they worked with students and parents, the evaluators noted that there was almost an air of subtle condescension involved in the conference. In those situations where the native born Puerto Rican Bilingual Teacher was observed, an attitude of respect and admiration seemed to flow during the interview, and a strong willingness on the part of the parents to confide and identify; this was not evident in the other instances.

Building this attitude of identification proved to be one of the major problems of the program. This was especially obvious in the one case where the Bilingual Teacher felt that he could not reveal his place of birth to his clients, and indicated, where the question arose, that he was born in South America, because "they would not accept me if they knew I was born in Cuba."

Evidently, most of the Bilingual Teachers were unfamiliar with the problems facing the Puerto Rican non-English speaking parent and child, and had little knowledge of the community or its problems and tensions. Apparently, a major factor in their selection was their facility with Spanish, and not necessarily their mastery of the English language. In one case, the Bilingual Teacher had as much of a problem with English as his clients did, and was unable to communicate effectively with school personnel.

It is quite clear that the program had very strong potential where there could be adequate communication between the Bilingual Teacher, parents, and children, as well as with administrators school staff, and with community agencies. This was observed to a very high degree only in one instance. However, observation in this one situation is sufficient to make the generalization that it can be done elsewhere as well.

Why,then, was it not? Several factors evidently militated against development of a greater degree of program effectiveness. To begin with, too little attention was given to the orientation and training of the Bilingual Teacher. Thus, in a questionnaire completed by the District Coordinator, training of Bilingual Teachers was listed as last in order of importance when he was asked to indicate those of his activities that contributed most to the program. He also noted that only one per cent of his time was spent on screening and selecting candidates for the position.

A second factor that contributed to the ineffectiveness of the program was the evident lack of success in making it an integral part of the school program. Direct relationships between school administrators and Bilingual Teachers ranged from written reports of activities once every two weeks with no face-to-face contact, to regularly scheduled meetings with the principal or his designee on a once a week basis. In most instances, meetings with administrators were unscheduled, and were effected only when a problem arose regarding a non-English speaking parent or child where the language skills of the Bilingual Teacher were needed.

Contacts between the Bilingual Teacher and the instructional staff were also minimal, although several children were referred by classroom teachers for individual tutorial work. (This activity, of course, should not have been considered one of the functions of the Bilingual Teacher.) The Bilingual Teacher was rarely called upon as a resource person by members of the school staff who had non-English speaking children in their classes. Cooperative work with members of the guidance staff was also minimal. In those instances where the Bilingual Teacher was involved with the guidance effort, the case was more or less delegated to the Bilingual Teacher, and the counselor withdrew to work with other children in his heavy case load.

It is of interest to note the Bilingual Teacher's perception of his role in the program. When asked to rate the degree to which he was accepted, using a five-point scale, with 1 representing the lowest rating and 5 the highest rating, the median ratings noted by the Bilingual Teacher were as follows:

Acceptance by administration - 3

teachers - 2

parents - 4

pupils - 4

These ratings suggest that, while the Bilingual Teachers felt that they had been well received by parents and pupils, they were rather uncertain concerning their acceptance by school personnel. Yet, the latter represent the groups by whom acceptance is most important if they were to function effectively in integrating the non-English speaking family into the world of the school.

To some degree, to be sure, the degree to which an individual is accepted stems from one's attempt to generate receptivity. There was little observed that would indicate that the Bilingual Teachers, as a group, had the nerve to make their presence felt. In one instance already mentioned, the Bilingual Teacher was so handicapped by poor command of the English language that it was easier to withdraw than to cope. At the opposite extreme, one teacher was vital, interested, and very active in his relations with the school staff. As a result, he was well known, accepted and had more to do than time allowed. In the other cases, the teachers were somewhat unsure of themselves, and quickly withdrew lest they create difficulties when a situation arose where they had to make their presence felt in support of a child or a family. It is not surprising that a general feeling of futility would ensue.

The patterns of the Bilingual Teachers activity in the community paralleled that noted in the schools. Few of the Bilingual Teachers made regular visits to community agencies, children's homes, or had other than

telephone contact with referral agencies. In one case, a very vital teacher was constantly on the go. When the observer walked with him to a community agency, they were stopped several times by persons who wished to ask a question, or simply to pass the time of day. The five block walk with this teacher was very revealing of the potential this program has for the non-English speaking family in the school and the community. However, the most important ingredient is the person in the job, perhaps more so here than in most positions.

V. MAJOR PROGRAM STRENGTHS AND WEAKNESSES

Strengths

1. The strong desire on the part of the non-English speaking parent and child to communicate with school personnel; a desire to belong.

2. The number of services that can be provided to the non-English speaking parent and child when their needs are recognized and attended to.

3. The ideal communication on the part of some of the Bilingual Teachers with the non-English speaking parent and child, that can lead to better coping behavior on the part of the non-English speaking person.

4. The fact that there is someone to come to in the school so that the non-English speaking parent and child need not feel isolated in the school and community, and can begin to develop a sense of trust in the existing establishment.

5. That there is a program available that can be built into a more effective working unit that integrates all ethnic groups into the school and community.

6. Latin American activities to heighten awareness of the total school population to the culture of the Puerto Rican student.

Weaknesses

1. Poor selection of candidates for this position, which demands a high level of initiative and independence.

2. Lack, on the part of some incumbents, knowledge of the cultural background of the Puerto Rican non-English speaking person.

3. Inadequate delineation of the Bilingual Teacher's function and role: insufficient contact between teaching staff and Bilingual Teacher.

4. Insufficient attention to the training of the Bilingual Teacher.

5. Inordinate attention to general activities, such as holidays and festivals, as opposed to working with specific individuals.

6. Insufficient face to face contact with agencies and other community resources that might facilitate better service for the non-English speaking family.

7. Inadequate space in some schools to allow for privacy in counseling, planning sessions with large groups of students, clubs.

VI. RECOMMENDATIONS

The Bilingual Program in School and Community Relations, in spite of several weaknesses, has high potential for the meaningful integration of the non-English speaking family into the school, and merits recycling for an additional year. The following recommendations are made for consideration by the District:

1. More careful selection of Bilingual Teachers, to insure not only bilingualism, but also a thorough knowledge of the culture and heritage of the Puerto Rican non-English speaking parent and child.

2. Careful attention should be given to personality characteristics in selecting candidates. Vitality, empathy, and initiative are very important qualities to be looked for in filling this position.

3. Well planned orientation sessions for the Bilingual Teacher who often times has come into the schools uninitiated as to its internal functioning, should be organized.

4. Well planned orientation sessions for the school staff as to the nature and purpose of the Bilingual Teacher position in the school should be undertaken.

5. Regularly scheduled intensive training sessions for all Bilingual Teachers so that they may receive necessary assistance in the pursuit of their responsibilities. There training sessions should stress guidance procedures, community referral resources, and other areas that would enable him to assume a more active role with the non-English speaking people with whom he comes into contact daily.

6. Increased joint efforts between the Bilingual Teacher and other school staff, such as the Teacher in School and Community Relations (who serves the English speaking population of the school in much the same way as the Bilingual Teacher), the school guidance counselor, the school nurse, etc.

7. More adequate facilities for the Bilingual Teacher complete with telephone, to allow for privacy in counseling and parent conferences should be provided.